

THE GENESIS AND GESTATION OF A JUSTICE JOURNEY:  
CATHERINE PINKERTON, CHAMPION OF AND EDUCATOR FOR THE COMMON  
GOOD

By

JACQUELINE B. MAGNESS

Dissertation submitted to the Faculty of the  
Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University  
In partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

In

Adult Learning and Human Resource Development

Marcie Boucouvalas, Chairwoman  
Harold W. Stubblefield  
Orion F. White  
Suzanne Schnittman  
Ronald L. McKeen

April 7, 1999

THE GENESIS AND GESTATION OF A JUSTICE JOURNEY:  
CATHERINE PINKERTON, CSJ, CHAMPION OF AND EDUCATOR FOR  
THE COMMON GOOD

by

Jacqueline B. Magness

Committee Chairwoman: Marcie Boucouvalas  
Adult Learning and Human Resource Development

(ABSTRACT)

This historical study examines events, institutions, experiences, and relationships in Pinkerton's life for educational significance in developing her extraordinary commitment to the common good. Data are viewed through the Deweyan lens of education as continuous, participative, and experiential. Additionally, the study illuminates from Pinkerton's speeches examples of her education of others regarding the need for the common good.

Components of the common good found in the philosophical literature and ego transcendence stemming from a wisdom deep within oneself found in the literature of transpersonal psychology form the conceptual framework upon which this study builds. The chapters are thematic in scope with the content of each chapter presented chronologically to illuminate a continuous education.

The study revealed an integral interaction of education, spirituality, and history in the development and educative embodiment of Pinkerton's transpersonal commitment to the common good. Pinkerton lived a uniquely structured life as a member of the Congregation of Saint Joseph religious community. Emphasis on theological reflection, critical reflection, dialogue, and action for change fostered a perspective transformation regarding the role of women religious in the Roman Catholic Church and led to an analysis of systems that bring oppression of other groups and of planet earth. This awareness eventually led Pinkerton to educate and lobby the U.S. Congress for inclusion of all in the common good.

The study concludes with a metaphor of Pinkerton's life as a whole cloth or seamless garment being constructed from threads of the past, present, and envisioned future. A dialogical shuttle weaves the threads into vibrant, ever-changing, richly hued designs. The design increases in complexity and richness guided by radical, responsible freedom. Such freedom arises from a relationship with a divine wisdom deep within Pinkerton—a relationship through which developed an understanding of the interconnectedness of all things in the common good. Pinkerton's championship of the common good evolved historically through continuous, participative, experiential engagement with learning.

This dissertation is dedicated to the next generations:  
my daughter, Julia Elizabeth; my son, Charles Francis,  
my daughter-in-law, Sheila Anderson Magness,  
and my precious granddaughters,  
Alexandra Anne and Noelle Marie

with the desire that for all of their lives  
they will derive pleasure from learning.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

No undertaking of this magnitude can ever be accomplished without the support of others. First of all, I'm grateful for the insightful guidance and encouragement of the chairwoman of my dissertation committee, Dr. Marcie Boucouvalas. I thank her not only for the many hours of reading and editing drafts but also for her creative and intuitive insight that often sent me off on other rewarding paths of research. Drs. Harold W. Stubblefield, Orion White, Ron McKeen, and Suzanne Schnittman, the other members of my committee, have all played a major role in any academic successes I enjoy. This dissertation is like a jigsaw puzzle put together from all the pieces each of them gave me. Dr. Stubblefield gave me a love of history, particularly women's history, and always held me to a high standard of academic writing. Dr. White's memorable, experiential, participative design for learning dialogue's importance in building a civil society provided an unexpected bonus in my education. The philosophical literature on the common good reinforced dialogue's importance. Dr. McKeen helped me meet tuition bills by showing me how to put all this learning together into practical, interesting, educational learner-focused presentations. Dr. Schnittman was one of those serendipitous gifts in life. A talented historian and women's history enthusiast, she gave generously from her busy schedule to encourage my academic pursuits. One more professor, Dr. Paul Nelson, deserves special mention in these acknowledgements. Dr. Nelson's Saturday morning writing classes provided therapy, gave me weekly deadlines, and kept me out of the passive voice. Thank you all.

Now, I'd like to thank the "pit crew"—those friends who kept my life running smoothly when I was totally absorbed in research and writing. In particular, Barbara

Gallagher and Patricia Dowd gifted me incredibly with their time, talents, caring, and love. Space won't permit naming all the wonderful things they did for me, but a couple simply must be mentioned. Without Barbara's patient and calm interventions to compensate for my computer ineptitude, I could have never have completed this dissertation. The more panic rose in my voice and the later at night my call for help, the calmer Barbara became. She'd walk me through the problem over the phone or make one of hundreds of "house calls," and she never lost her sense of humor. Patricia gave generously of her court reporter skills--transcribing interviews and recordings of meetings with my advisor, and proofreading. They both kept volunteer requests at bay and fulfilled some volunteer obligations to which I had already committed. Thank you both.

Dr. Patricia Berne and Dr. Louis Savary started me off on this educational endeavor with letters of recommendation for entrance to graduate school. Pat's soothing, gentle manner calmed me in moments of anxiety and reassured me in moments of self-doubt. Lou's wit and incredible organizational skills restored both perspective and focus many times. Thank you both.

Jean Hite and Warren Gorrell each kept, cared for and loved Microchip, my toy poodle, while I traveled to Cleveland or Philadelphia on research ventures. The Sisters of Saint Joseph in Cleveland graciously and generously welcomed me into their homes and hearts. Sister Ruth Rodgers, the archivist, set aside days in the archives just for me. Sister Eileen Duffy shared her historical research with me. Countless other friends prayed for my progress, "sent me" energy, encouraged, cheered on, and allowed me to moan, complain, and periodically despair without ever giving up on me. The Aristotle

Foundation II awarded me financial support to advance my work and hasten its completion. Thank you all.

Finally, I'd like to acknowledge two very special people who have gifted my life: Elizabeth Roslewicz and Catherine Pinkerton. Liz models for me an incredible love of learning, perseverance, and organization, is amazingly tolerant of my ability to lose things, both mine and hers, when I'm preoccupied, and enriches my life with her humor and wit. Catherine, of course, graciously agreed to be subject of my study. Researching the genesis and gestation of her justice journey took me on a spiritual pilgrimage. I am blessed from sharing in her spirituality. Thank you both.

# CONTENTS

ABSTRACT .....	ii
DEDICATION .....	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .....	iv
CONTENTS .....	vii
PREFACE .....	x
Chapter	
1 CHARTING A COURSE.....	1
Challenging Adult Education .....	1
Background of the Problem .....	2
Capsulizing a Champion of the Common Good	
Components of Educator, Catherine Pinkerton’s Commitment in Context	
Contemporary Calls for the Common Good	
Catholic Communities of Women Religious in Metamorphosis	
Coming into One’s Own through Dialogic Learning	
Creating Emancipatory Knowledge	
Statement of the Problem: Centering on the Unknown .....	24
Purpose of the Study: Changing the Unknown to the Known .....	25
Questions That Guide the Inquiry: Coaxing the Answers .....	26
Significance of the Study: Citing the Meaningfulness of the Study.....	27
Method: Choosing an Appropriate Method and Creating a Comprehensive	
Plan .....	28
Sources and Data: Combing the “Catacombs” .....	30
Collection and Analysis of Data: Calling Forth and Examining the Data.....	31
Organization of the Study: Channeling Confusion into Order .....	33
2. THE COMMON GOOD IN PHILOSOPHICAL LITERATURE AND EGO-	
TRANSCENDENCE FOR THE COMMON GOOD IN PSYCHOLOGICAL	
LITERATURE .....	35
Adult Education, Autonomy, and Homonomy.....	35
The Common Good.....	37

The Common Good in Antiquity	
The Judeo-Christian Tradition Unfolds New Understanding	
The Common Good in the Roman Catholic Tradition	
The Common Good in the United States	
The Transpersonal Perspective.....	58
Transpersonal Psychology’s Interface with Mysticism	
Transpersonal Psychology’s Interface with Empirical Research	
Transpersonal Psychology's Interface with Adult Education	
Transpersonal Psychology’s Interface with Empirical Research	
Healthy Transcendence Derived from Continuous Learning	
Interface of the Common Good, Transpersonal Psychology, and Catherine Pinkerton	
3. DIALOGUE AND ACTION .....	72
Dialogue and Interconnectedness.....	72
Dialogue and Action in Adult Education .....	74
A Dialogue with the Past.....	75
Dialogue and Action’s Genesis in Pinkerton’s Education .....	76
Dialogue and Action’s Development in a Life of Commitment .....	83
An Era of Change Ushered in by Dialogic Planning of a Holistic Education .....	85
Dialogue and Action through Times of Upheaval .....	86
Dialogue Leads to Awareness of Institutionalized Values.....	91
Solidarity in a Dialogic Kin-dom.....	92
Conclusion.....	95
4. A HOLISTIC INCLUSIVITY .....	97
Integrating Inclusivity into a Dissertation.....	97
Social Movements Broaden Inclusivity .....	98
Learning From An Inclusive Childhood .....	99
The Exclusivity of Early Religious Life .....	100
Education in One Arena Affects Learning in Another.....	101
Inclusion of the Heart and Body with the Intellect .....	102
Vatican II Focuses on Inclusivity.....	102
Worldwide Protests Against Exclusion Develop .....	103
Old Lessons Are Unlearned .....	104
Continuous Learning Reveals Language as a Tool of Exclusivity .....	106
Transformative Learning Leads to Action and Change in Governmental Structures.... Of Religious Communities.....	109
Relationship with the Institutional Church is Strained by Exclusion.....	111
Speaking the Truth Begins to Include the Word Feminism	
Conflict with the Hierarchy Intensifies	
Pinkerton Advocates Dialogue and Corporate Action	
Reaction to Obedience Injures but Isn’t Lethal	
Three Inclusive Transitions Seen by Pinkerton as Interrelated.....	124

Increased Awareness of Domination Leads to Ecological Consciousness and Enriched Spirituality.....	126
Inclusivity Grows from Experiential, Interactive, Continuous Learning.....	127
5. AN INCARNATIONAL SPIRITUALITY .....	132
The Process of Maturation as Related to Adult Learning.....	132
A Structure for Exploration.....	133
A Young Woman Embraces Life and the World.....	134
A Young Sister Embraces the Dark .....	135
A Mature Woman Embraces Change.....	137
Creating the Climate in Which Another Can Be Liberated	
Liberation Begets More Change and More Friction	
Educating Educators in the Embrace of Life	
Embracing the Process of Becoming Fully Human	
Embracing Societal Change through Responsible Freedom	
Embracing the Raised Consciousness of Feminism	
Grounding the Embrace in the Present	
Embracing the Future	
The Wholeness of Pinkerton’s Spirituality .....	152
6. RECONCILIATION: THE WHOLE CLOTH .....	155
The Wholeness of Pinkerton’s Life.....	156
A Deweyan Education That Was Continuous, Participative, and Experiential.....	157
Pinkerton, Mezirow, Brookfield, and Freire .....	162
A Truly Radical Freedom.....	165
Concluding Thoughts .....	166
Significance for the Field of Adult Education .....	167
REFERENCE LIST.....	170
APPENDIX.....	184

## PREFACE

Three long-term and recent interests converged in the researcher's life to prompt the writing of this dissertation: the potential of adult education for developing human potential, social action founded in spirituality, and an acquaintance with a deeply spiritual educator for the common good. One of the inspirations for the study was a 1993 book, *Adult Education and Theological Interpretations* by Jarvis and Walters. Hart and Holton's Chapter 15, "Beyond God the Father and the Mother: Adult Education and Spirituality," gave a particularly appreciated, added dimension of spirituality to the usual discourse limited to the "intellectual/conceptual processes in transformative learning."

Catherine Pinkerton, Roman Catholic Sister of Saint Joseph, also motivated this study. Pinkerton, called by the First Lady of the United States, Hillary Rodham Clinton, to participate in meetings, invited to gatherings at the White House, and known by many members of Congress, doesn't own any designer label dresses or fashion accoutrements, a house, or even her own car. Unencumbered by the usual trappings of the successful, Pinkerton lives quite simply and exhibits a different kind of success – the success of one who has remained faithful to a vision. Pinkerton's vision is a society whose members share a concern for the common good. For this common good, Pinkerton offers no dogmatic formula. Rather, the boundaries or shape of that vision expand and change as society changes.

The researcher's interest in adult education ties together this appreciation for the inclusion of spirituality in the discourse of transformative learning, and acquaintance with a woman whose spirituality envelops the common good. Pinkerton's spirituality facilitates development beyond self-actualization to ego-transcendence. Adult education,

also, has the potential to facilitate this development. Thus a study evolved of what was educationally significant to Catherine Pinkerton, CSJ, in shaping her commitment to the common good and the ways in which this commitment was made manifest in Pinkerton's life.



## CHAPTER ONE

### CHARTING A COURSE

Chapter One sets forth the organizational structure of the dissertation and informs the reader of the background of the problem prompting the study as well as the purpose of the study. The researcher delineates the questions that guide the inquiry and explains the significance of the study.

#### **Challenging Adult Education**

As the millennium nears, knowledge of the interconnectedness of life arises from diverse fields and affords adult education the opportunity to re-examine its role in society. Society has expanded beyond the borders of the United States or even North America. Today's society is global in scope and offers increased possibilities and increased problems, as cultural values and economic practices compete for dominance worldwide. Richard J. Barnet and John Cavanagh see the world as getting smaller, but not coming together. "Instead," say Barnet and Cavanagh, "As economies are drawn closer, nations, cities, and neighborhoods are being pulled apart. The processes of global economic integration are stimulating political and social disintegration."<sup>1</sup> Henry Kissinger blames an unregulated global market for allowing an economic crisis to develop that he says threatens to become a crisis of political institutions.<sup>2</sup> A new understanding of the interconnectedness of countries economically, politically, and ecologically grows throughout the world, but Barnet and Cavanagh point out, "No world authority exists to define global welfare, much less to promote it."<sup>3</sup>

In addition to a new understanding of the interconnectedness of countries, an interesting awareness of the interconnection and interdependence of all things currently arises from both scientific fields and religion. Once only proclaimed by mystics, the recognition of this interconnectedness now emanates from many sectors and is accompanied by increased attention to a global common good. The field of transpersonal psychology studies those who recognize human inseparability from all life and who see humankind's intersubjective role in the universe. These people have an expanded knowledge of self that transcends ego and stems from an inner wisdom. From this wisdom within comes a collective rather than an individualistic perspective. Knowledge of the accessibility of this inner wisdom places adult education on the threshold of new opportunity. Education of adults, based on our expanded understanding of the human potential and the problems that accompany globalization, could make an impact on the common good of the world.

A look at one who for years has championed the common good, has acknowledged a sanctity and interconnectedness among all things, and has educated in response to globalization seems timely and of valuable import to adult education. Catherine Pinkerton recognizes global societal problems and calls forth from others an awareness of potentially disastrous effects of a global economy that ignores a global common good. Who is this Catherine Pinkerton? From whence comes this education for the common good, and what is the common good? This chapter will chart an exploration of Pinkerton, the roots of her commitment to the common good, and her efforts to educate others in this realm.

---

<sup>1</sup> Richard J. Barnet and John Cavanagh, *Global Dreams* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1994), 13.

<sup>2</sup> Henry Kissinger, "Perils of Globalism," *Washington Post*, 5 October 1998, A21.

<sup>3</sup> Barnet and Cavanagh, *Global Dreams*, 419.

## Capsulizing A Champion of the Common Good

Catherine Pinkerton, a Roman Catholic Sister of Saint Joseph, has a vita filled with honors: Woman of the Year Award, 1975; The American Catholic Who's Who, 1976; Cleveland's Ten Most Influential Women, 1983; Cleveland's 100 Most Influential Women, 1984; Ohio Women's Hall of Fame, 1984; and recipient of John Carroll University Centennial Medal, 1986, to list a few.<sup>4</sup> Pinkerton, profiled in the Washington Post Magazine and dubbed "Our Lady of the Lobby," currently lobbies members of the U. S. Congress on behalf of social justice legislation.<sup>5</sup> As a representative of Network, a Catholic Social Justice Lobby, Pinkerton provides congressional members with an awareness of the impact impending legislation will have on all segments of society. Additionally, she calls forth from citizens an awareness of the reality of their lives at the present and in the future should particular bills get passed. Even more importantly, Pinkerton educates and advocates citizen participation in notifying their elected representatives of important issues not currently being considered in Congress.

Pinkerton may be regarded as radical but not in the conventional sense of the term. Radical is often thought of as revolutionary or extremist, but the etymology of radical is *root*. When approached about studying her commitment to the common good, a dialogue emerged around the term "radical." Pinkerton smiled and exclaimed, "Radical...ah, yes...back to the root. I like it!" Pinkerton does have an uncanny ability to see beyond circumscribed arguments to the systemic root of the problem, an achievement that enables her to create cognitive dissonance or "teachable moments."<sup>6</sup> Such teachable moments foster in the audience awareness of possibilities for change in systems many previously thought to be "set in stone." To envision better systems and know the reality of one's life necessitates going beyond the current political discourse to the root of the problem or conflict. The root of good legislation to Pinkerton is legislation based on the common good. U. S. Congress members who haven't expressed an interest in the common good, or, at least, whose voting records on Capitol Hill do not appear to Pinkerton to be indicative of a concern for the common good, often find themselves on the receiving end of Pinkerton's probing questions. Questions of how to secure just access to economic resources, reorder federal budget priorities, obtain universal health care, and transform global relationships for the common good are the focal point of her lobbying efforts.

Like radical educators in the field of adult education, Pinkerton is concerned with education and politics, is committed to action, and uses education to engender change.<sup>7</sup> Across the nation, in large and small gatherings, formal ceremonies and informal settings, Pinkerton educates, *calls forth*, from others an awareness of the interdependence of all of creation and a particular need in this time of a "global commons" to understand the importance of this interdependence.<sup>8</sup>

---

<sup>4</sup> A.E.P. Wall, editor in chief, *The American Catholic Who's Who* (Washington, D.C.: N.C. News Service, a division of the U.S. Catholic Conference, 1976).

<sup>5</sup> Kerry Danner, "Our Lady of the Lobby," *Washington Post Magazine*, 23 May 1993, 8.

<sup>6</sup> Leon Festinger developed theory of cognitive dissonance. Robert Havighurst referred to instances of cognitive dissonance as teachable moments. Leon Festinger, *A Theory of Cognitive Dissonance* (1957); Robert J. Havighurst, *Developmental Tasks and Education* (New York: David McKay Co., 1961).

<sup>7</sup> This is Richard Johnson's definition of a radical educator Richard Johnson, "'Really Useful Knowledge 1790-1850: Memories for Education in the 1980s," in *Radical Approaches to Adult Education: A Reader*, ed. Tom Lovett (London: Routledge, 1988), 5.

<sup>8</sup> Daloz, et al. coined the phrase 'global commons' to indicate a change from the commons of the town hall, ballfields, or bodega where people met and talked to the commons of a 'shrinking world,' a world in which people

In 2000, Pinkerton celebrates sixty years as a member of the Congregation of Saint Joseph (CSJ), a Roman Catholic community of “women religious.” Women religious, sometimes shortened to just “religious,” is a relatively new term for nuns or sisters and is the term Pinkerton prefers. Technically, cloistered women religious are referred to as nuns and apostolic women religious (those out in the world) as sisters, but most people, unaware of this distinction, use the terms interchangeably. Throughout this study, women religious or simply religious will be used except in places where its newness seems awkward. In those instances, the word *sister* will be substituted. The terms are used interchangeably.

To study the shaping of Pinkerton’s commitment to the common good apart from her religious community would be impossible because her whole adult life has been lived in community. Social justice and systems-change form the roots of the Sisters of Saint Joseph. Founded secretly in 1650 in LePuy, France, Jesuit Father Jean Pierre Medaille gave six women permission to live and minister among the people at a time when the hierarchy of the church struggled to have all women in religious communities cloistered away from the world.<sup>9</sup> In what today we would call a needs assessment, the women went into the four quarters of the city to determine what help was needed and then developed their plan of assistance. The following year, Bishop de Maupas recognized the plan as the vision of Saint Francis de Sales, gave official recognition to the women, and granted them permission to do their works of charity. St. Francis de Sales (1567-1622) had envisioned a community of women devoted to the love of God and the service of their neighbor; religious whose community would balance the contemplative and the active life.<sup>10</sup>

A religious community in the Roman Catholic tradition develops when its founder(s) recognize a need. Theologian, Johannes B. Metz, notes that religious communities often came into being as movements that started on the fringe or margin of society: “at the point where social change first became noticeable and began to establish itself.”<sup>11</sup> Thus, Metz believes that religious communities have a corrective role: to redress imbalance within the church: “They are a kind of shock therapy instituted by the Holy Spirit for the Church as a whole.”<sup>12</sup> The mode of response to a recognized need is referred to within the church as a charism--a divinely conferred gift of the Spirit for the community. The charism of the Sisters of Saint Joseph is reconciliation, the act of bringing together or uniting again. Reconciliation has a two-part focus: reconciling people to God and reconciling people to people. After the close of Vatican II, a group of Sisters of Saint Joseph with expertise in French returned to research and probe their roots. Along with Father Maurice Nepper, S.J.<sup>13</sup>, the sisters examined the early documents of the congregation in LePuy, France, to rediscover who they are and who they are called to be. From that research, the women religious developed a Consensus Statement containing the concepts that Fr. Medaille most frequently and consistently expressed about the Sisters of Saint Joseph.

---

daily communicate globally. Laurant A. Daloz, Cheryl H. Keen, et al., *Common Fire* (Boston, Massachusetts: Beacon Press, 1996), 3.

<sup>9</sup> Jo Ann Kay McNamara, *Sisters in Arms* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1996), 491.

<sup>10</sup> Patricia Byrne, "French Roots of a Women's Movement: The Sisters of St. Joseph, 1650-1836," diss, *A 46/12*, p. 3752, *June 1986* (1996) (Boston: Boston College); Mary Lucinda Savage, SSJ, "The Congregation of Saint Joseph of Carondelet," diss (Washington, D. C.: Catholic University of America, 1923), 1-15; Margaret Quinlan, "Sisters of Saint Joseph of Cleveland" (Cleveland, 1963), ii.

<sup>11</sup> Johannes B. Metz, *Followers of Christ the Religious Life in the Church*, trans. Thomas Linton (NY: Paulist Press, 1978), 12.

<sup>12</sup> Metz, *Followers of Christ*, 12.

<sup>13</sup> Society of Jesus, members of which are known as Jesuits

Stimulated by the Holy Spirit of Love and receptive to the Spirit's inspirations, the Sister of Saint Joseph moves always toward profound love of God and love of neighbor without distinction, from whom she does not separate herself and for whom, in the following of Christ she works in order to achieve unity both of neighbor with neighbor and neighbor with God directly in this apostolate and indirectly through works of charity.

*in humility* – the spirit of the Incarnate Word (Philippians 2: 5-11)

*in sincere charity* (cordiale charite) – the manner of Saint Joseph whose name she bears in an Ignatian-Salesian climate: that is, with an orientation towards excellence (Le depassement, le plus)

tempered by gentleness (douceur), peace, joy.<sup>14</sup>

Pinkerton's religious community shaped and honed a concern for the common good into an indefatigable action. This movement into action, Pinkerton calls conversion. According to Pinkerton, conversion is a three-part process: (a) intellectual contemplation "fed with new insights and ideas and challenges;" (b) reflective conversion, "the process of making the truth one's own and changing attitudes and behavior to accord with new insights;" and finally (c) the conversion of action, "the going forth to create with others the structures, processes and systems that are authentic for what is life-giving."<sup>15</sup>

One of Pinkerton's conversions prompted her to work with others for change within the institutional church; in particular, on the exclusion of women from the clergy and other leadership positions. Pinkerton treasures her Roman Catholic faith but believes there needs to be systemic change in an institution of faith that expands and limits opportunity solely on the basis of gender. Pinkerton courageously and unashamedly states she is a feminist, a label that is subject to many interpretations often accompanied by strong feelings ranging from support to condemnation. Many, particularly those disdainful of feminism, think all feminists are angry men-haters. Perhaps some are; however, feminism has many facets. Pinkerton's feminism is inclusive and offers a value for the entire world. Woman religious Joan Chittister, O.S.B.,<sup>16</sup> best describes Pinkerton's type of feminism:

Feminism is a new world view....Feminism is not simply about femaleness.

It is about another way of looking at life, about another set of values designed to nurture a dying globe and rescue any people too long ground under foot, too long ignored, unseen, invisible...Feminism is about getting a better world for everybody.<sup>17</sup>

Pinkerton's advocacy of a better world for everybody and a power relations change arises from a commitment to a set of values and perceptions, a necessary foundation for changing the world according to Judith Newton and Deborah Rosenfelt.<sup>18</sup> The values set forth in the gospel of

---

<sup>14</sup> Congregation of the Sisters of Saint Joseph, *Constitution and Complementary Document* (Cleveland: Congregation of Saint Joseph, 1984).

<sup>15</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Untitled," Commission tenth anniversary (Akron, Ohio, 1995), 5.

<sup>16</sup> Order of Saint Benedict (Benedictine Sisters)

<sup>17</sup> Joan Chittister, OSB, "Heart of Flesh: A Feminist Spirituality for Women and Men," Call to Action (Detroit, Michigan, November 15, 1997).

<sup>18</sup> Judith Newton and Deborah Rosenfelt, "Introduction," in *Feminist Criticism and Social Change*, ed. Judith Newton and Deborah Rosenfelt (New York: Methuen, 1985), Introduction.

Jesus Christ, particularly as expressed in the social teachings of the Roman Catholic Church, ground Pinkerton's feminism, radical views and concern for the common good. In the gospels, Pinkerton sees Jesus Christ as turned against inequality and injustice. Richard Johnson calls this the view of a radical educator who sees Christianity "as a morality of cooperation among equals."<sup>19</sup> Johnson contrasts that with philanthropic educators who view God as a kind of policeman in the sky and human nature as finite, limited, and flawed. Radical educators, according to Johnson, hold the view of empowering each other to change the world for the common good and reject the view that "crime, riot, pauperism, vice, and even epidemic diseases are moral at root, and moral and religious education are the answer."<sup>20</sup>

Pinkerton's urgent belief that we can and we must champion the common good stems from the roots of her spirituality. This spirituality is not mere adherence to doctrinal tenets of a particular denomination. Religious beliefs may indeed be a part of one's spirituality, but spirituality, to the researcher, has greater depth and breadth. It encompasses and permeates one's being. Spirituality is more a way of being, a way of embracing life and the world. Pinkerton's spirituality was nurtured in educationally significant ways by events, experiences, institutions, and relationships in her life, and is made manifest in her speeches, conversations, and actions. This dissertation examines that education and illuminates Pinkerton's educative outreach for the common good.

Examination of the educative influences of a variety of institutions, events, experiences, and relationships in the shaping of a life requires a broad definition of education. This dissertation uses Robert D. Leigh's 1930 definition.

[Education] is a lifelong process beginning at birth and ending only with death, a process related at all points to the life experiences of the individual, a process full of meaning and reality to the learner, a process in which the student is active participant rather than passive recipient.<sup>21</sup>

While there are, of course, more recent and equally broad definitions of education, Leigh's definition is particularly congruent with a Deweyan conception of education as experiential, continuous, and interactive, the same lens through which the researcher will view the data.<sup>22</sup> Ellen Condliffe Lagemann, who examined the lives of five nineteenth century women reformers through a Deweyan lens of education, described in theoretical terms this notion of education: "...education is a process of interaction by which individual potential (instincts, propensities, talents) is activated, shaped, or channeled and a change (an observable or consciously felt difference) thereby produced in the self."<sup>23</sup>

Pinkerton's commitment to the common good and desire to educate others regarding the importance of the common good evolved continuously through the social, spiritual, economic, and political experiences of her life. Within these multiple contexts, Pinkerton's journey to justice had its genesis in childhood, its ongoing gestation and birth into action within a religious community, and its continuation in 1999, as an educator for the common good and a Congressional lobbyist for Network, a social justice membership organization of lay and

---

<sup>19</sup> Johnson, "Really Useful Knowledge," 5.

<sup>20</sup> Ibid.

<sup>21</sup> Malcolm Knowles, *The Adult Learner: A Neglected Species*, 4th ed. (Houston: Gulf Publishers, 1990), 33.

<sup>22</sup> Lagemann used a Deweyan lens of education to view the lives of 19th century women reformers Ellen Condliffe Lagemann, *A Generation of Women* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1979).

<sup>23</sup> Lagemann, *A Generation of Women*, 6.

religious women and men who put their faith into action. This study illuminates Pinkerton's educative outreach for the common good and examines the continuous, experiential, and interactive education that called forth a commitment to the common good. To use Stephen Brookfield's description of the exploration of the life and writings of Eduard Lindemann, this study will explore "that contradictory nexus where the private and public, the person and the political meet" to understand the connection between Pinkerton's "individual biography and socio-historical forces."<sup>24</sup>

### **Components of Educator Catherine Pinkerton's Commitment in Context**

Chapter Two provides a contextual background for Pinkerton's understanding of the common good. The construct, the common good, has been in the philosophical literature for centuries with a multiplicity of interpretations over time. Chapter Two examines the relationship of this construct to its incarnations throughout history. Also, in Chapter Two, the literature of transpersonal psychology describes the ability to transcend one's ego and live for the common good and provides a contextual background for understanding Pinkerton's extraordinary commitment to the common good. The common good commands attention in some eras more than others. Its neglect in one period seems to provoke calls for a return to the common good in succeeding periods.

### **Contemporary Calls for the Common Good**

Pinkerton's philosophy of life is so oriented toward the common good that hardly a conversation takes place without evoking this construct. No one, however, has illuminated Catherine Pinkerton's educational outreach for the common good or studied the development of her commitment. Pinkerton, though often honored for her work in social justice and keynote speaker at many functions, is virtually unknown in contemporary literature on the common good.

Numerous contemporary writers express concern for the common good and the need for its return to a role in public policy. These books, written from various professional perspectives, cite multiple causes for the loss of the common good today and offer particular solutions for its return. Martin Marty, author of more than two dozen books on culture and religion, urges a change in communication focus for the common good. Marty believes factionalism has developed in the United States as a result of a heightened awareness of civil rights and the voices of many diverse cultures and groups protesting exclusion from equal opportunity. Rather than strident factionalism, Marty urges a celebration of this diversity, a refocusing of communication. As all our various communities continue to protest their victimhood and keep naming the oppressor, "blaming the dominant elites," Marty says they all begin to sound alike.<sup>25</sup> According to Marty, their stories need to be told without focusing on victimization and blame, but accenting "what gave integrity to their group and their achievements;" "the advice for every citizen who wishes to participate in American life and its necessary arguments [is to] start associating, telling, hearing and keep talking."<sup>26</sup>

---

<sup>24</sup> Stephen Brookfield, *Learning Democracy: Eduard Lindeman on Adult Education and Social Change* (London: Croom Helm, 1987), preface.

<sup>25</sup> Martin Marty, *The One and the Many* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1997), 224.

<sup>26</sup> *Ibid.*, 225.

Marcus G. Raskin, Co-Founder and Distinguished Fellow of the Institute for Policy Studies in Washington, D.C., urges us to find ways of stimulating empathy and a caring sense.<sup>27</sup> According to Raskin, “Our writ as human beings” of lowering human suffering cannot be heard until we “have an empathic awareness of the Other, whether nature, animal, or the person.”<sup>28</sup> Raskin sees a need in our modern democracy to raise and resolve political and ethical questions for reconstructive change in a movement for the common good.

John M. Bryson and Barbara C. Crosby of the Hubert H. Humphrey Institute of Public Affairs urge policy entrepreneurs and advocates of policy change to recognize the necessity of shared power in confronting today’s public problems. Bryson and Crosby encourage motivation of others to pursue the common good.<sup>29</sup>

Christopher Lasch, George Lodge, and Amitai Etzioni detail the costs to civil society of radical individualism and call for a rebalancing of individualism with a communal focus and civic participation.<sup>30</sup> George Rupp also claims we must criticize and counter “the pervasive and corrosive individualism of our prevailing culture” for it is rationalizing “indifference to the plight of others.”<sup>31</sup>

Rupp addresses the two communities of religious and academics and advocates going beyond the stereotypes of religious communities as appealing only to authorities they believe are infallible and also as producing propaganda aimed at engendering blind convictions. The other stereotype to surpass, Rupp adds, is that of academia as guardian of objective, value-free inquiry. Instead, Rupp urges collaboration by the two communities to acknowledge academia’s underlying values that shaped a preoccupation with technical and bureaucratic solutions to social problems, and for religious communities, an unapologetic refocusing from priority of salvation beyond this world to a spirituality concerned with corporate historical life.<sup>32</sup> Lawrence Daloz, et al., also recognizing a need for the common good, recently studied the lives of several people with a long-term commitment to the common good and uncovered common themes: community, compassion, conviction, courage, confession, and commitment.<sup>33</sup> Daloz, et al. found that “an awareness of the connections among things—of interrelatedness, broadly construed—is a key sensibility among those whose lives are committed to the common good.”<sup>34</sup>

While these authors expressed a concerned need for the common good, none examined the work of educator/lobbyist, Catherine Pinkerton. None examined ways in which Pinkerton’s education shaped her commitment to the common good or how life as a woman religious honed a commitment into an educative action. Yet, Pinkerton lives in community, is a woman of courage and conviction, urges dialogue, action, and shared power, and witnesses a concern with corporate historical life – all qualities for which these authors call.

### **Catholic Communities of Women Religious in Metamorphosis**

---

<sup>27</sup> Marcus G. Raskin, *The Common Good: Its Politics, Policies, and Philosophy* (New York: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1986), 327.

<sup>28</sup> *Ibid.*, 326.

<sup>29</sup> John M. Bryson and Barbara C. Crosby, *Leadership for the Common Good* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1992).

<sup>30</sup> Christopher Lasch, *The Culture of Narcissism* (New York: Norton, 1978), Lodge 1976; Amitai Etzioni, *The Spirit of Community: Rights, Responsibilities, and the Communitarian Agenda* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1994).

<sup>31</sup> George Rupp, *Commitment and Community* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1989), 77.

<sup>32</sup> *Ibid.*, 65-81.

<sup>33</sup> Daloz, Keen, et al., *Common Fire*.

<sup>34</sup> *Ibid.*, 17.

Pinkerton was born into a Catholic family, was educated in Catholic schools, and has been a Sister of Saint Joseph for 59 years. Background knowledge of the culture of religious life in general, in the United States, and specifically of the Sisters of St. Joseph of Cleveland is foundational to understanding the context of Pinkerton's development as an educator for the common good. Throughout Pinkerton's community, one finds the resonance of adult education.

When Pinkerton entered the Sisters of Saint Joseph in 1939, all learning was instrumental. It was received knowledge parroted back in rote fashion. The sisters wore voluminous, floor-swirling black habits with starched brow-binding white bands and black veils on their heads.<sup>35</sup> Dutiful, unquestioning obedience and almost total separation from family and the world was demanded. Today, these same sisters don colorful blazers, blouses, and skirts, earrings and even make-up. You can find them anywhere and everywhere educating, ministering, advocating, and becoming agents of change in the world. To understand this transformation, one must turn the pages of history.

Joan Chittister, OSB,<sup>36</sup> wrote that in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, whole populations, many of who were Roman Catholics, immigrated to the primarily Protestant United States. Religious orders came from Europe with them, and other new orders formed to meet the needs of the immigrants. Soon Catholic neighborhoods, schools, orphanages, and hospitals existed – a “Catholic cocoon ... a world within a world, a world unto itself.”<sup>37</sup> This cocoon existence was fostered by the church's rejection of the world and Protestant's often hostile reception of Roman Catholics,<sup>38</sup> but also by a desire to preserve the faith and eventually to provide sufficient education for Catholics to fit into the Protestant society. According to Chittister, Roman Catholic sisters, although often ridiculed for the Old World customs, dress, and rigidity of life they brought with them to the New World--through their hard work--enabled the eventual assimilation of Catholics into American society. The rigidity of authority, discipline, and ritual, while not appropriate in today's understanding of the person and spirituality, at that time, “made achievements commonplace that might otherwise have been impossible.”

In military fashion, objectives were set, commands were given, and results were achieved with sometimes great cost to the individuals involved. With nuns to spare, religious congregations built up a network of schools and social service agencies at the lowest possible cost and the highest possible quality. In less than one hundred years this network would challenge the best periods of church history for scope and public effectiveness.<sup>39</sup>

Adrian van Kaam, CSSp<sup>40</sup>, writes that the behavioristic focus on the outer world of rules and conditioning of behavior began a gradual change in the conduct of religious life in the

---

<sup>35</sup> Jacqueline B. Magness, "Transformation" (Va. Technological Institute and State University, 1995), 1.

<sup>36</sup> Order of Saint Benedict (Benedictine Sisters)

<sup>37</sup> Joan Chittister, "An Amazing Journey: A Road of Twists and Turns," in *Religious Life: The Challenge of Tomorrow*, ed. Cassian J. Yuhaus, CP (New York: Paulist Press, 1994), 77.

<sup>38</sup> Anthony S. Bryk, Valerie Lee and Peter B. Holland, *Catholic Schools and the Common Good* (Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1993); Neil G. McCluskey, *Catholic Viewpoint on Education* (New York: Harvard University Press, 1959).

<sup>39</sup> Chittister, "An Amazing Journey," 77.

<sup>40</sup> Congregation of the Holy Ghost and the Immaculate Heart of Mary

United States with the rise of psychotherapeutic thought.<sup>41</sup> What van Kaam referred to as psychotherapeutic thought was the emergence of humanistic psychology that emphasized the whole person and the nurturing of each person's potential.<sup>42</sup> Psychotherapeutic thought, according to van Kaam, stressed the inner world of "being at home in the life of experiences, conscious and unconscious."<sup>43</sup> Van Kaam says the changes were not without conflict with some members rejecting psychotherapeutic thought as mere theory, others rejecting all rules and regulations if they didn't fit with their personal experience, and a third group in the middle trying to reconcile the two. From this turmoil, continues van Kaam, an integrative spirituality began to emerge that used the truth of both behaviorism and experientialism and has been called "incarnational, existential, personalistic, or anthropological."<sup>44</sup>

### Coming into One's Own through Dialogic Learning

The nurturance of potential encouraged some women religious to explore ministries other than those in which they had been placed. Through contemplation and the dialogic process of communal discernment, individuals often chose alternative ministries. Currently, women religious, no longer relegated always as groups to nursing, teaching, social work, or a cloistered life, are involved in many ministries focusing on numerous aspects of the common good. In 1999, these women continue to discern and "listen for" (*obey*) the current expressions of charisms in ministry. Pinkerton described the process of taking responsibility for discernment as: "It's like being pilgrims in a reality that is adrift itself and being missioned for that reality and its conversion/transformation [while at the same time], needing that reality to show us who we are and have become – to mirror us to ourselves; in a sense to be an instrument of our conversion/evangelization."<sup>45</sup>

The broad range of ministries reflects vast changes in the Roman Catholic church in the United States and, even more so in religious life in the past 60 years. Prior to Vatican II (1962-1965) convened by Pope John XXIII (1881-1963), the church rejected modernity and all its "errors." During Vatican II, however, "the windows were thrown open" to see all the good in the world.<sup>46</sup> The Vatican II changes were well documented for all the world, but Vatican II changes didn't happen in a vacuum. Many other changes less well known had been taking place in the Roman Catholic Church, particularly among communities of women religious, many years prior to Vatican II.

Interestingly, higher education after World War II had a significant influence on preparing the sisters for Vatican II by indirectly changing the isolation of women religious from each other and from the world. The passage of the Servicemen's Readjustment Act, commonly known as the G. I. Bill (1944), designed to reintegrate veterans into society without totally

---

<sup>41</sup> Adrian van Kaam, "Introduction," in *Sisters for the World* (New York: Herder & Herder, 1966), 8.

<sup>42</sup> Descriptions of humanistic psychology can be found in the following: Marcie Boucouvalas, "Transpersonal Psychology: Scope and Challenges Revisited," in *Embracing Transcendence: Visions of Transpersonal Psychology*, ed. E.M. McNeill and S.I. Shapiro (Stafford Heights, Australia: Bolda-Lok Publishing and Educational Enterprises, 1995), 1-25; Anthony Sutich, *Transpersonal Psychology* 1, no. 1 (Spring 1969); Charles T. Tart, "Introduction," in *Transpersonal Psychologies: Perspectives on the Mind from Seven Great Spiritual Traditions*, ed. Charles T. Tart (San Francisco: Harper, 1991 (2nd. ed.)).

<sup>43</sup> van Kaam, "Introduction," 8.

<sup>44</sup> *Ibid.*, 8-9.

<sup>45</sup> Handwritten notation by Pinkerton on 1997 iteration of this dissertation

<sup>46</sup> Michael Creal, "Introduction," *In the Eye of the Catholic Storm: The Church Since Vatican II*, ed. Michael Creal (Toronto, Canada: Harper Collins Publishers, 1992), 2.

disrupting the economy,<sup>47</sup> brought a renewed emphasis on education in the United States. Thousands of military veterans accepted the free education provided by the government. So many literacy classes, vocational schools, and colleges “sprang up” to compete for these students that a means for quality control had to be instituted. Eventually, this quality control spilled over into the public schools, and the National Education Association began a process of standardization to professionalize teaching. Catholic schools, at that time almost totally staffed by religious sisters, in order to be accredited, would necessarily have to adhere to the same training requirements as teachers in public schools. Prior to this push for professionalization, according to Patrice Noterman, with a few exceptions, sisters who were educators began teaching with only enough education to prepare them for immediate classroom needs. They would then complete their education in summer schools over so many years that their education was commonly referred to as “the twenty year plan.”<sup>48</sup>

Educated women religious who were college administrators in the 1940s had been urging religious communities to educate their sisters. However, many years passed while working through the National Catholic Education Association (NCEA) before a bachelor’s degree became the norm for sisters beginning teaching careers.<sup>49</sup> The 1954 NCEA convention in Chicago gave birth to a new education plan, the Sister Formation Conference. The sisters chose the word *formation* to emphasize a holistic education. All further education must supply more than the professional needs of sisters. Noterman explains, “Convinced that the formation of religious should include the intellectual, social, and psychological aspects of the person along with the spiritual, the leadership sought a process that would form effective and healthy ministers.”<sup>50</sup> Women religious who previously followed cloister traditions whereby “sisters had to travel together, study together, eat together, dress differently from the laity and read only certain books,”<sup>51</sup> now began a collaborative process with other religious communities to educate American sisters - many with master’s and even doctoral degrees. Lora Ann Quinonez, CDP,<sup>52</sup> and Mary Daniel Turner, S.N.D.deN,<sup>53</sup> note that this higher education and the planning of it by the women religious themselves allowed the sisters to use their vision in planning their own future.

In short, prior to Vatican Council II the SFC had produced a cadre of educated American sisters with the knowledge and the skills to take charge of a planned change process. Equally important, it had facilitated the transmission and internalization within and among women’s communities of ‘new’ ideas, which were slowly affecting the image American nuns held of themselves.<sup>54</sup>

Also, during this period, Pope Pius XII--believing that religious communities should work together to make the changes needed within their structures to become powerful agents of

---

<sup>47</sup> Harold W. Stubblefield and Patrick Keane, *Adult Education in the American Experience* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1995), 244.

<sup>48</sup> M. Patrice Noterman, "An Interpretive History of the Sister Formation Conference, 1954-1964," diss, *UMI Dissertation Services* (1988) (Chicago: Loyola University of Chicago).

<sup>49</sup> *Ibid.*, 6, 15.

<sup>50</sup> *Ibid.*, 38.

<sup>51</sup> *Ibid.*, 14.

<sup>52</sup> Congregation of Divine Providence

<sup>53</sup> Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur; Noterman, "An Interpretive History," 191.

<sup>54</sup> Lora Ann Quinonez, CDP and Mary Daniel Turner, S.N.D.deN, *The Transformation of American Catholic Sisters* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1992), 10.

change in an ailing world--called a meeting of all Major Superiors, heads of religious communities. As a result of that call in 1956, the heads of over two hundred American communities of women religious met in Chicago and formed the Conference of Major Superiors of Women (CMSW), later called the Leadership Conference of Women Religious (LCWR). "This represented a new form of dialogue at the leadership level," according to Pinkerton.<sup>55</sup> The women, leaders of their communities, determined to actively plan the directions for change. The focus of both LCWR and SFC was on the complete restructuring of the formation plan. Eileen Duffy, CSJ,<sup>56</sup> says the work was supported by the Vatican, but more often than not, was opposed at the local level as bishops and pastors, reluctant to hire lay teachers, realized they would not have enough sisters to staff their rapidly growing parochial schools.<sup>57</sup>

Addressing this resistance, Father Emilio Gambari spoke out about past abuses and defended the reform:

We have today great need in the complex circumstances of our lives today of being on guard against a certain false sacramentalism. We cannot say to the candidate, "You will now do this work for which you are not trained and in reward for your humility and obedience, the Holy Spirit will make up for all you do not know. This might occasionally happen, but usually the work is very badly done and there is serious injustice done to other people and to the Sister herself, for we do not have authority over the Holy Spirit, and God does not work miracles for frivolous reasons. The vocation is like a seed that must germinate. Unless it is put into a soil in which it finds all the proper nutritive elements; it will not grow unless it has the proper climatic conditions; it will not bear fruit without proper pollination."<sup>58</sup>

The reform continued. Sister colleges formed, and the studies began. St. Mary's College at Notre Dame in Indiana offered the first graduate program in theology available to women. Betty Moslander, CSJ, president of her congregation at that time, reminisced with the researcher in a 1995 conversation: "The campus in the 1950s would be flooded with women who had come to earn their Master's in Theology. Women were taking advantage of this new opportunity. It was an exciting time. They had been deprived of it, and they were hungry for knowledge."<sup>59</sup> Moslander and other women religious repeatedly refer to the Sister Formation Conference as the Sister Formation Movement. Indeed, it did have the characteristics of a social movement, which, according to Sara Evans and Harry Boyte, arises out of community and fosters the common good and cooperation.<sup>60</sup> The Sister Formation Conference was a source of empowerment and gave women religious a new understanding of their ability to enact change.

When the Vatican II document *Perfectae Caritatis* was issued on October 28, 1965, communities of women religious obeyed (listened) and began the process of renewal of religious life for which the document called. *Perfectae Caritatis* stressed harmony: harmony among manner of life, prayer, and work with the physical and psychological condition of its members

---

<sup>55</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "NAWR: A Vision for the Future," NAWR (San Francisco, 1975), 142.

<sup>56</sup> Congregation of Saint Joseph

<sup>57</sup> Eileen Duffy, "American Women Religious Since Vatican II" (Cleveland, Ohio, 29 October, 1997), 3.

<sup>58</sup> Elio Gambari, SMM, *Religious Apostolic Formation for Sisters* (New York: Fordham University Press, 1964), 29-30.

<sup>59</sup> Conversation with researcher at the Windham Hotel, Philadelphia, PA on July 4, 1995. The occasion was a Federation Meeting of the Congregation of Saint Joseph.

<sup>60</sup> Sara M. Evans and Harry C. Boyte, *Free Spaces* (New York: Harper & Row, 1986), Chapter 6.

and the needs of the apostolate. The mode of government, “constitutions, directories, books of custom, of prayers, or ceremonies and such should be properly revised, obsolete prescriptions being suppressed, and should be brought into line with conciliar documents.”<sup>61</sup> The Council left the determination of changes needed and the means of accomplishment to the Superiors of the religious communities with the admonition to consult and listen to all its members.

### Creating Emancipatory Knowledge

The self-reflection, critical reflection, and dialogue in this period of examining structures eventually brought emancipatory knowledge. The process was similar to Paulo Freire’s consciousness raising, but it went a step further than learning to be an autonomous being.<sup>62</sup> Theological reflection, encounters with God, fostered a homonomous<sup>63</sup> understanding of the uniqueness of each individual in its relational being.

Among religious women in the United States, change took place at what seemed to be an extremely rapid pace, but change was, for the most part, carefully planned with inclusion of all communities in the process. Even so, women religious experienced the tension of being caught between two worlds. As changes were instituted, Doris Gottemoeller, RSM,<sup>64</sup> noted that women religious often experienced “misunderstanding from without/polarizations within, loss of membership, lack of resources and pastoral disappointment”,<sup>65</sup> but along the way they developed skills in group participation and calling forth leadership. Many new national organizations were founded. Pinkerton was among the founders in Cleveland, (1970), of grassroots organization, the National Assembly of Women Religious, (NAWR), which linked women religious with social activism, and she became its second chairperson, serving from 1973-1975. NAWR eventually became the National Assembly of Religious Women (NARW), the name reflecting inclusion of non-vowed associates, co-members of religious communities, and other lay women. Network, the organization for which Pinkerton now works, was founded during this period and registered as a lobby for social justice in Congress.<sup>66</sup>

---

<sup>61</sup> Vatican Council II, *Vatican Council II the Conciliar and Post Conciliar Documents*, second, 1975, ed. Flannery, Austin, O. P., trans. Ambrose McNicholl, O. P. (Northport, NY: Costello Publishing Co., 1965), 611-23.

<sup>62</sup> Paulo Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, trans. Myra Bergman Ramos (New York: Continuum, 1990).

<sup>63</sup> Marcie Boucouvalas picked up the term *homonomous* originally from a footnote in Abraham Maslow's work, then read the original 1941 Angyal publication, and related the term to transpersonal psychology and adult learning first in 1980, then 1988, and later in 1991 and 1999. Abraham Maslow, *Toward a Psychology of Being* (NY: Van Nostrand Reinhold, 1968); A. Angyal, *Foundations for a Science of Personality* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press for the Commonwealth Fund, 1941); Marcie Boucouvalas, *An Analysis of Lifelong Learning and Transpersonal Psychology As Two Complementary Movements Reflecting and Contributing to Social Transformation*, diss. (Florida State University, Tallahassee, FL, August 1980); Marcie Boucouvalas, “An Analysis and Critique of the Concept of Self in Self-Directed Learning: Toward a More Robust Construct for Research and Practice,” *Transatlantic Dialogue Among Standing Conference on University Teaching (SCUTREA), Adult Education Research Conference (AERC), and the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education (CASAE) University of Leeds*, 11-13 July, 1988); Marcie Boucouvalas, “The Transpersonal Self: An Issue Area for Comparative Adult Education Research,” *World Conference on Comparative Adult Education* (University of Ibadan, Nigeria, 7-11 October, 1991); Marcie Boucouvalas, “The Transpersonal Orientation as a Framework for Understanding Adult Development and Creative Processes,” in *Art, Science, and Spirituality in the Context of Maturity*, eds. M. Miller & S. Cook-Greuter (Greenwich, CT: Ablex, 1999).

<sup>64</sup> Sisters of Mercy Noterman, "An Interpretive History," 191.

<sup>65</sup> Doris Gottemoeller, RSM, "Befriending the Wind," *Leadership Conference of Women Religious* (August 29, 1994), 2.

<sup>66</sup> Quinonez and Turner, *The Transformation of American Catholic Sisters*, 142.

Religious communities continued a return to their roots to reassess their missions, and in the process, according to Jo Ann Kay McNamara, histories were recovered and women developed “a raised consciousness of their relationship with the male hierarchy” and became aware of their own integrity.<sup>67</sup> Twenty-five years later, Pinkerton reminisced about that period, “Those gathered there knew they were standing on the threshold of what could be characterized as a new era in the history of religious life and the Church. We were claiming our role as women of the Church, calling for a voice in its decision-making.”<sup>68</sup> Chittister says women religious had brought themselves “to new ways of seeing new things and new ways of seeing old things as well.”<sup>69</sup> They perceived the importance of a spirituality which unifies economic, social and political realities that shape people’s lives, and saw themselves moving from maintaining existing structures to creating alternatives within these realities.<sup>70</sup> This spirituality did not neglect direct service, healing the wounds of societal injustice, or advocacy, but expanded to include work for systemic change, getting at the roots of responsibility for those ills.<sup>71</sup>

Although the ministries of women religious have expanded, religious communities still suffer from dwindling numbers. Members are aging, and fewer women are choosing to enter religious life. Researchers have studied religious orders and women’s religious life in general and have favorite theories for the demise of religious life. In a recent book, Ann Carey blames radical feminists who managed to get into leadership positions and push their agendas. Carey names Pinkerton as one of these feminists.<sup>72</sup> Pinkerton and other women religious on the staff of Network, when shown Carey’s book, responded that the sisters were only being obedient to the urgings of the Vatican. George Weigel of the Ethics and Public Policy Center, a think-tank in Washington, defended Carey’s book. Patricia Lefevere cites Weigel who “termed renewal in religious life as ‘the last pure exercise in Leninist politics in the 20th century’ carried out by ‘purges, re-education, self-perpetuating leadership cadres,’ whom he claimed were deployed to deconstruct religious life.”<sup>73</sup>

Pinkerton and others have documented vast changes in religious life. Some, like Pinkerton, acclaim the changes; others decry them and point fingers of blame at those whom they see as the cause of declining numbers of women religious. No one has examined, however, the ways in which these changes might have affected Pinkerton’s championship of the common good. No one has written about the development of this commitment or illuminated Pinkerton’s educational outreach for the common good.

Five years of reading Pinkerton’s speeches, conversing with, interviewing, and attending Congregation of Saint Joseph workshops, meetings, and conventions convinced this researcher that Pinkerton is an excellent topic for timely research in adult education. Cries for a return to the common good, for a civil society<sup>74</sup>--even a global civil society increase daily. At the same

---

<sup>67</sup> McNamara, *Sisters in Arms*, 632.

<sup>68</sup> Pinkerton, "Untitled."

<sup>69</sup> Joan Chittister, "Climbing the Eight Mountains of Religious Life," *National Catholic Register*, February 20 1998, 30.

<sup>70</sup> Leadership Conference of Women Religious of the USA and Conference of Major Superiors of Men of the USA, "Apostolic Religious Life in a Changing World and Church," Fifth Inter-American Conference of Religious (1986), 9.41.

<sup>71</sup> Handwritten notation by Pinkerton on 1997 iteration of this dissertation

<sup>72</sup> Ann Carey, *Sisters in Crisis* (Huntington, Indiana: Our Sunday Visitor, Inc., 1997), 180, 245, 249, 255.

<sup>73</sup> Patricia Lefevere, "Bishop Sacks Liberal Column, Diocesan Priests Fight Back," *National Catholic Reporter*, February 13 1998, 7; George Weigel, *Catholic Sun*, Jan. 29-Feb. 4 1998.

<sup>74</sup> The idea of a civil society is quite important globally. It was an integral part of the 1997 UNESCO Agenda for the Future in the Hamburg Declaration on Adult Learning. A civil society contains many elements, but, borrowing

time, some adult educators worldwide urge the field to activate social responsibility,<sup>75</sup> while the field of transpersonal psychology illuminates a human potential for a wisdom of interconnectedness and interdependence. These pleas from society and adult educators coupled with the human potential to draw from a wisdom of interconnectedness is of great import for adult education.<sup>76</sup>

At age seventy-seven, Pinkerton, a woman of numerous achievements and recipient of many accolades, still works zealously for social justice. Pinkerton describes this work as evangelization, "the call to become inserted into a community of transformation."<sup>77</sup> This call, Pinkerton continues, requires "not only accepting the difficult and onerous task of changing those structures and systems which stifle and oppress the human spirit, but to create anew – to envision a different reality and to take steps to cross over to that new way of being."<sup>78</sup>

### Centering on the Unknown

Catherine Pinkerton's educational outreach for the common good in political, religious and societal arenas is essentially unknown except by those with whom she has worked, those whom she has educated, and those whom she has led in religious life. Also unknown are the educational experiences that brought about that commitment. This historical inquiry illuminates Catherine Pinkerton's educative outreach for the common good and examines the historical events, experiences, institutions, and relationships that shaped in Pinkerton a philosophy of life oriented toward the common good.

Much has been written about the historical events--such as the Great Depression, the social upheaval of the 1960s, the revival of the Women's Movement in the 1960s and '70s, and liberation theology that occurred within Pinkerton's lifetime. Books and dissertations document the vast changes in religious life that took place in the 1950's and '60s including the Sister Formation Movement, the rise of Sister Senates, Leadership Conference of Women Religious, and the changes brought about by Vatican II (1962 -1965). None, however, has examined Pinkerton's educational efforts for the common good within these contexts. Recent books call

---

from the work of Scott Peck, it begins with "the ethical consciousness of other people, individually and collectively, as precious beings." M. Scott Peck, *A World Waiting to Be Born* (New York: Bantam Books, 1993), 53.

<sup>75</sup> Matthias Finger Finger, Theo Jansen and Wildemeersch, "Reconciling the Irreconcilable? Adult and Continuing Education Between Personal Development, Corporate Concerns and Public Responsibility," in *Adult Education and Social Responsibility*, ed. Danny Wildemeersch, Matthias Finger and Theo Jansen (Frankfurt am Main, Germany: Peter Lang GmbH, 1998), 1-26; Richard Edwards and Robin Usher, "Modern Field and Postmodern Moorland: Adult Education Bound for Glory or Bound and Gagged," in *Adult Education and Social Responsibility*, ed. Danny Wildemeersch, Matthias Finger and Theo Jansen (Frankfurt am Main, Germany: Peter Lang GmbH, 1998), 27-56; Peter Jarvis, "The Education of Adults as a Social Movement: A Question for Late Modern Society," in *Adult Education and Social Responsibility*, ed. Danny Wildemeersch, Matthias Finger and Theo Jansen (Frankfurt am Main, Germany: Peter Lang GmbH, 1998), 57-72; Michael Welton, "Civil Society as Theory and Project: Adult Education and the Renewal of Global Citizenship," in *Adult Education and Social Responsibility*, ed. Danny Wildemeersch, Matthias Finger and Theo Jansen (Frankfurt am Main, Germany: Peter Lang GmbH, 1998), 187-220; Cees Klaassen, "Empowerment and Social Responsibility in the Learning Society," in *Adult Education and Social Responsibility*, ed. Danny Wildemeersch, Matthias Finger and Theo Jansen (Frankfurt am Main, Germany: Peter Lang GmbH, 1998), 221-36.

<sup>76</sup> Marcie Boucouvalas, "Social Transformation, Lifelong Learning, and the Fourth Force-Transpersonal Psychology," *Lifelong Learning: The Adult Years*, March 1983, 6-9.

<sup>77</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "The Wellspring of Political Action: Prayer," *Catholic Evangelization in the United States of America* 1, no. 2 (March/April 1988): 10.

<sup>78</sup> Ibid.

for a return to the common good in the United States and even a broadening of the construct to embrace a global common good, which Pinkerton also advocates. Lawrence Daloz, et al. uncovered common themes within a group committed to the common good but did not examine specifically one life for educationally significant events, experiences, relationships and historical times that shaped this commitment.<sup>79</sup>

Pinkerton's life is an unexplored contemporary example of a life committed to the common good and to the education or calling forth from others: (a) the ability to look beyond popular discourse for the root of social problems, and (b) the desire to become part of a community of transformation. This transformation is both process and product and, Pinkerton says, has both individual and collective dimensions. "Individually, a person becomes aware of his/her own participation in systems of injustice, experiences conversion, and then works collectively to develop a "community of new consciousness."<sup>80</sup> According to Pinkerton, this conversion and development of a community of new consciousness link faith and citizenship, and Pinkerton continues, "If we love our nation, we will critique it, challenge it to become what it is called to be. In so doing, we will carve out the relationship between what it means to be a person of faith and what it means to be American."<sup>81</sup> Pinkerton's longtime commitment to the common good and her uniquely structured life of discipline, reflection, education, and action within a religious community provide a singular opportunity for study.

### **Changing the Unknown to the Known**

This study's purpose is to illuminate Catherine Pinkerton's educative outreach for the common good and examine events, experiences, institutions, and relationships for educational significance in shaping that orientation. Like examination of the life of Mahatma Gandhi, (1869-1948), Lucretia Coffin Mott, (1793-1880), or other advocates of non-violent agitation on behalf of the common good, this study of Pinkerton's life, mission, and commitment can inspire and lead others in her orientation. The study will also provide valuable information to adult educators interested in ways the field can activate social responsibility.

### **Coaxing the Answers**

This study, then, specifically addresses the central question: What historical events, experiences, institutions, and relationships were educationally significant in the shaping of Catherine Pinkerton's philosophy of life oriented toward the common good, and how has this commitment to the common good manifested itself in Pinkerton's life?

One's life commitment doesn't develop in a vacuum; hence several subsequent questions were developed to gain insight into educationally significant events, experiences, institutions, and relationships in Pinkerton's life. These questions give direction to the study and establish a framework for examining the development of Pinkerton's championship of the common good.

1. How did family as an educational institution contribute to Pinkerton's commitment to the common good?
2. Did Pinkerton's formal education have significance in the development of this commitment?

---

<sup>79</sup> Daloz, Keen, et al., *Common Fire*.

<sup>80</sup> Pinkerton, "The Wellspring of Political Action: Prayer," 16.

<sup>81</sup> Ibid.

3. In what ways did daily life as a Sister of Saint Joseph hone Pinkerton's commitment to the common good into an educative action and facilitate Pinkerton's knowledge of self in its intersubjective role?
4. In what ways might historical events during Pinkerton's lifetime, such as the Depression, the rise of feminism, Vatican II, and others have helped shape Pinkerton's commitment to the common good?

### Citing the Meaningfulness of the Study

Our society exhibits a continuing need for research into the process and results of education. In 1943, the philosopher William James decried the generalization of the particular to make the universal and wrote that theories need to come *from* experience rather than *about* experience.<sup>82</sup> Forty years later, in 1983, Henry C. Johnson, Jr. maintained that James' statements were applicable to educational history.

If we need thickened educational theories, only a thickened history can be of much help in providing them: a history which takes full account not simply of trends and forces, but of particular events and places and singular persons, including the thoughts, words, and deeds, which are the conclusion to their beliefs and values.<sup>83</sup>

Other educators, too, have noted the importance of studying human experience both to better understand education and to add a richness to educational history.<sup>84</sup> Ellen Condliffe Lagemann noted that extending "education beyond the walls of a school" can add to the knowledge of how psychological and social circumstances can combine to produce education.<sup>85</sup>

Harold W. Stubblefield and Patrick Keane, adult education historians, write that a maturing, socially-oriented field such as adult education needs to go beyond an "institutional, inspirational and celebratory" history to include "questions of ideas and purposes, questions of the relationship between segments of society, and questions of the social questions that adult educators seek to redress...."<sup>86</sup> In addition to studying the process of education to better understand learning and to add a richness to educational history, Adrian Blunt lists socially responsible research as one of the goals for a dynamic and productive future of adult education research.<sup>87</sup>

---

<sup>82</sup> William James, *A Pluralistic Universe*, Essays in Radical Empiricism, vol. 2 (New York, 1943).

<sup>83</sup> Jr. Johnson, Henry C., *Historical Inquiry in Education: A Research Agenda*, ed. John Hardin Best (Washington, D.C.: American Education Research Association, 1983), 30.

<sup>84</sup> Lawrence Cremin, *The Family as Educator*, ed. Hope Jensen Leichter (New York, 1977), 76-91; Geraldine Joncich Clifford, "The Life Story Biographic Study," in *Historical Inquiry in Education: A Research Agenda*, ed. John Hardin Best (Washington, D.C.: American Educational Research Association, 1983), 66; III Cutler, William W., "Asking for Answers," in *Historical Inquiry in Education: A Research Agenda*, ed. John Hardin Best (Washington, D.C.: American Educational Research Association, 1983), 99; Ellen Condliffe Lagemann, "Looking at Gender Women's History," in *Historical Inquiry in Education: A Research Agenda*, ed. John Hardin Best (Washington, D.C.: American educational research association, 1983), 260.

<sup>85</sup> Lagemann, "Looking at Gender Women's History," 261.

<sup>86</sup> Harold W. Stubblefield and Patrick Keane, "The History of Adult and Continuous Education," in *Handbook of Adult and Continuing Education*, ed. Sharan B. Merriam and Phyllis M. Cunningham (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1989), 26.

<sup>87</sup> Adrian Blunt, "The Future of Adult Education Research," in *Research Perspectives in Adult Education*, ed. D. Randy Garrison (Malabar, Florida: Krieger Publishing Company, 1994), 168.

Currently, concern about society's problems of violence, inequitable distribution of wealth, unjust access to resources, and environmental destruction is increasing. Researchers accompany this concern with a call for an education that nurtures social commitment and an ability to "build new connections" in an "increasingly diverse, complex, and interconnected world."<sup>88</sup>

This study takes a step in response to those stated needs. An examination of the educationally significant events, experiences, institutions, and relationships of Catherine Pinkerton, an educator of adults and a radical thinker with a philosophy of life oriented toward the common good, can (a) serve to better understand education, (b) enrich educational history, (c) better understand how historical and social circumstances can combine to produce education, (d) provide an analysis of the shaping of a life committed to the common good, and (e) offer some insight into developing an education that nurtures social commitment and an ability to build new connections.

### **Choosing an Appropriate Method and Creating a Comprehensive Plan**

The historical method of inquiry guides this research of Catherine Pinkerton as champion of and educator for the common good. The research began with a curiosity about the evolution of an extraordinary commitment to the common good and the expression of that commitment in education of adults in political, religious, and secular arenas. As such, the research has a biographical focus anchored in a larger social context of contemporary national and global problems. Adult education for social responsibility and knowledge from the field of transpersonal psychology regarding human potential come together in this research to provide adult educators an example of an educator who challenges unjust social, political, and cultural practices.

According to Sharan Merriam and Edwin Simpson, historical research in applied fields should inform the field in ways significant to the practice of that field.<sup>89</sup> This research has the potential to broaden the current adult education focus on human resource development for business to include human resource development for affirmation of all life as expressed in the common good.

Jacques Barzun and Henry F. Graff credit history with moving minds by what it inspires, but they caution, "If other human beings are to enjoy and use the knowledge gathered from records by the searcher's critical methods, the breath of life must be in the product."<sup>90</sup> It is the researcher's sincere hope that "the breath of life" is in this product. This historical method of research includes determining meaningful categories of evidence, collecting the evidence, arranging it into some order and interpreting the data to bring insight and coherence to the facts.<sup>91</sup> The historical evidence is subjected to external criticism to verify authenticity and internal criticism to determine accuracy.<sup>92</sup>

---

<sup>88</sup> Daloz, Keen, et al., *Common Fire*.

<sup>89</sup> Sharan B. Merriam and Edwin L. Simpson, *A Guide to Research for Educators and Trainers of Adults*, second edition (Malabar, Florida: Krieger Publishing Co., 1995), 76.

<sup>90</sup> Jacques Barzun and Henry F. Graff, *The Modern Researcher*, Fifth edition (Fort Worth: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich College Publishers, 1992), 38-39.

<sup>91</sup> Merriam and Simpson, *A Guide to Research*, 82.

<sup>92</sup> John W. Best and James V. Kahn, *Research in Education*, Seventh edition (Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1993); R.J. Shafer, *A Guide to Historical Method*, Revised edition (Homewood, IL: The Dorsey Press, 1974).

In light of a personal acquaintance with Catherine Pinkerton, the researcher must guard against uncontrolled bias. Bias can never be eliminated, but it can be minimized by self-awareness of preconceptions, triangulation or consideration of alternatives, and the weighing of all evidence both pro and con.<sup>93</sup> An acquaintance with Pinkerton does have advantages. The personal relationship allows the researcher to view Pinkerton as subject rather than mere object or form. The personal perspective provides the advantage of understanding the person beneath the form. Being connected to a person while also trying to be a researcher capable of describing aspects of a person objectively without making judgments on those aspects is a complex issue. It requires living in the tension created by a need for self-awareness and a desire to truly see the inner and outer world of the person being researched rather than settle for the public appearances of a commitment to the common good.

### **Combing the “Catacombs”**

The researcher accessed the archives of the Sisters of Saint Joseph in Cleveland, Ohio, for the institutional histories, minutes of meetings, newspaper articles, tape recorded interviews, some LCWR and NARW papers and Pinkerton’s speeches. The archivist, Sister Ruth Rodgers, graciously gave hours of assistance, and the Sisters of Saint Joseph generously opened their homes to lodge and even feed a traveling researcher. Dissertations and other secondary sources used are found in the Library of Congress, Washington, D. C.; Newman Library, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg, VA; the Northern Virginia Center Library, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Falls Church, VA; Marymount University, Arlington, Va.; and the Episcopal Theological Seminary in Alexandria, VA.

### **Calling Forth and Examining the Data**

Primary sources include Pinkerton herself. Semi-structured interviews of Pinkerton provided some educationally significant events, experiences, institutions, and relationships and some ways in which they were significant. The interviews provided an opportunity to guard against what Commager calls “present mindedness” by understanding events from Pinkerton’s perspective.<sup>94</sup> Additionally, the open-ended interviews and subsequent informal conversations with Pinkerton allowed the researcher to clarify data, probe and seek amplification as needed.<sup>95</sup> With Pinkerton’s consent, earlier interviews were recorded and transcribed. As Pinkerton’s schedule became more chaotic, field notes taken of brief conversations replaced lengthier recorded and transcribed interviews. Notes were recorded on the computer with academic software known as Citation 7. Primary documents such as Leadership Conference of Women Religious *Occasional Papers*, the Sister Formation Conference *Bulletin*, and community meeting records served as reminders for interviews and dialogue, provided the researcher with an historical perspective, and verified Pinkerton’s recollections. Speeches given by Pinkerton between 1963 – 1998 were a priceless resource.

In addition to interviews, informal conversations, and document research, the researcher attended the Sisters of Saint Joseph 1995 Federation National Event in Philadelphia, the 125th

---

<sup>93</sup> Barzun and Graff, *The modern Researcher*; R. J. Shafer, *A Guide to Historical Method* (Homewood, IL: The Dorsey Press, 1980).

<sup>94</sup> H. S. Commager, *The Nature and the Study of History* (Columbus, Ohio: C. E. Merrill, 1965).

<sup>95</sup> M. Q. Patton, *Qualitative Education and Research Methods*, 2nd edition (Newbury Park: Sage, 1990).

Anniversary Celebration in Cleveland, and numerous workshops held at the mother house in Cleveland to learn the culture and concerns of the Sisters of Saint Joseph.

Secondary documents include dissertations on the Sister Formation Conference, Leadership Conference of Women Religious (LCWR), the history of the Sisters of Saint Joseph, Catholic summaries of Vatican encyclicals, historical accounts of changes of direction in the American Roman Catholic Church in its interaction with society-at-large and of changes of direction in the Sisters of Saint Joseph community. Throughout the study, Pinkerton reviewed the data. Merriam and Simpson call this process “member checks – taking data collected from study participants and your tentative interpretations of the data back to the people from whom they were derived, asking if the data ‘ring true’.”<sup>96</sup>

The events, experiences, institutions, and relationships that were educationally significant in the development of Pinkerton’s commitment to the common good are viewed through a Deweyan lens of education. That is, the researcher is conscious of experiential and interactive aspects of Pinkerton’s formal, non-formal, and informal education in this realm and attempts to organize data to illustrate the continuity of education – that all learning builds on prior learning. Examples of Pinkerton’s speeches and observances of her actions in daily life are used to illuminate her educational outreach for the common good.

Additionally, the data are organized by elements of the common good: dialogue and action, inclusivity, and by the deep, strong roots of spirituality which grounded Pinkerton’s commitment. Upon completion of the review of philosophical literature concerning the common good, the researcher examined the findings for key elements of the construct and noted dialogue, action or participation, and inclusivity. Having read copies of Pinkerton’s speeches given between 1963 and 1998, the researcher intuited that the same elements were in the speeches. To verify, she re-read all the speeches and determined that dialogue, action, and inclusivity were themes that run throughout Pinkerton’s life. Pinkerton’s ethical consciousness of others is rooted in her spirituality, her way of embracing life and the world, so the researcher felt it was an integral part of Pinkerton’s commitment to the common good and needed to be included in the research.

### **Channeling Confusion into Order**

This illumination of Pinkerton’s commitment to the common good and analysis of educationally significant events, experiences, institutions, and relationships in the shaping of that commitment is structured thematically. Chapter Two includes a review of the philosophical literature on the common good, to provide both knowledge of this construct’s changeable operationalization since ancient Greece and enriched understanding of the evolution of Pinkerton’s longstanding commitment.

The breadth, depth, and duration of Pinkerton’s engagement with the common good attests to extraordinariness. Indeed, Pinkerton recognizes a sanctity and interconnectedness among all humanity and creation that transcends ego in living for the common good. Ego transcendence is a phenomenon found in the literature of transpersonal psychology. A review of transpersonal literature is also included in Chapter Two to assist readers in understanding the inner wisdom from which an ego transcending orientation to the common good arises.

The remaining chapters focus on themes present in the scholarly philosophical and transpersonal literature, Pinkerton’s speeches, and documentation of religious communities in the

---

<sup>96</sup> Merriam and Simpson, *A Guide to Research*, 102.

United States, with one chapter illuminating historical social movements of significance that occurred during Pinkerton's life. Dialogue and action, elements of every operationalization of the common good since ancient Greece, permeated Pinkerton's life and are reflected throughout three decades of speeches. Chapter Three, "Dialogue and Action," traces and illuminates these elements. Chapter Four, "A Holistic Inclusivity," based on inclusion, the common denominator of all operationalizations of the common good, includes a look at concurrent streams of social thought such as the feminist and ecological movements, liberation theology, and non-denominational spirituality for impact on the development of Pinkerton's advocacy for the common good. Pinkerton's penchant for "going to the root" for understanding and wisdom necessitates a section on the root of Pinkerton's championship of the common good. Chapter Five, "An Incarnational Spirituality," examines a foundation that is at once solid and mutable, solid in Pinkerton's belief in a God present throughout history and within all creation and mutable in confident expectation and acceptance of new revelations. Individually and together, these movements affected Pinkerton's integrative worldview of a global common good. Chapter Six, "Reconciliation: The Whole Cloth" uses the charisma of the Sisters of Saint Joseph as theme in the concluding chapter to unite all the data.

## CHAPTER TWO

### THE COMMON GOOD IN PHILOSOPHICAL LITERATURE AND EGO TRANSCENDENCE FOR THE COMMON GOOD IN PSYCHOLOGICAL LITERATURE

Since this dissertation examines the development of an extraordinary commitment to the common good and illuminates an educative outreach on behalf of the common good, a look at this construct is in order. What exactly is the common good? How is it operationalized? To answer these questions, Chapter Two examines philosophical literature for the dynamic qualities of the common good and traces historical incarnations of the common good from which Pinkerton's commitment and educative outreach emanate.

As mentioned previously, Pinkerton's commitment is extraordinary--fueled by a spirituality that recognizes an interconnectedness of all things. For Pinkerton, this interconnectedness necessitates attention to a global common good as well as a national common good. A unifying vision of interconnectedness often arises from wisdom deep within a person and is a subject of study in the field of transpersonal psychology. So Chapter Two will also examine the literature of transpersonal psychology to better understand the relationship of this inner wisdom to the common good. But, of what benefit is this information to the field of adult education?

#### **Adult Education, Autonomy, and Homonomy**

Adult education facilitates the individual's ability to be self-directed in learning and meaning making in life's experiences. Individuals with this ability are described as autonomous or self-governing, and independent. Autonomous people, Brian Fay says, are free, "able to ordain for themselves the principles by which they live."<sup>97</sup> To facilitate the development of autonomous people is indeed a goal of adult education, but current research citing the need for attention to the common good indicates need for an expanded focus. Fay, as a critical theorist, proposes the idea of collective autonomy which involves a "group of people determining on the basis of rational reflection the sorts of policies and practices it will follow and acting in accordance with them."<sup>98</sup> Michael Welton says Fay includes in collective autonomy the "understanding of true interests and proper goals which are continually reassessed and reestablished as situations change."<sup>99</sup> Collective autonomy takes into account the social aspects of life and necessitates the dialogic practice called for by advocates of the common good. Stubblefield and Keane in their adult education history text present examples of collective autonomy; i.e., the Woman's Club Movement, Woman's Rights, Woman's Suffrage, The National Grange of the Patrons of Husbandry, and Knights of Labor among others.<sup>100</sup>

The Sisters of Saint Joseph of Cleveland developed a collective autonomy as a result of self-reflection, theological reflection, discernment through dialogue, and change from a

---

<sup>97</sup> Brian Fay, *Critical Social Science: The Limits of Liberation* (NY: Cornell University Press, 1987), 76; Michael R. Welton, "The Critical Turn in Adult Education Theory," in *In Defense of the Lifeworld*, ed. Michael R. Welton (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1995), 37.

<sup>98</sup> Fay, *Critical Social Science*, 77; Welton, "The Critical Turn," 37.

<sup>99</sup> Welton, "The Critical Turn," 37.

<sup>100</sup> Harold W. Stubblefield and Patrick Keane, *Adult Education in the American Experience* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1994), 152-69.

structure-centered living of community to one that is person-centered. These women religious determine their own policies and practices and, to a surprising degree, are not dominated by the institutional church. Collective autonomy, while social in nature and often corrective of hegemonic abuses, could be restrictive in perspective, however, if used only for the benefit of the group irrespective of the larger society. The expanded view of these women religious does not fall into this trap and includes recognition, critique, and work to change systems that constrain or block autonomy for all humans. This work for many of the women and certainly for Pinkerton stems from an homonomous view of creation. An homonomous understanding of life involves an awareness of the interconnectedness of all things. Such awareness expands the idea of collective autonomy and expands a vision of the common good from local or even national understanding to a global perspective. Boucouvalas describes homonomy as “the meaning derived in life by feeling and being parts of greater wholes.”<sup>101</sup>

Pinkerton’s writing indicates a meaning making that is cognizant of an individual, local, national, and global common good. One sees in Pinkerton’s writing awareness of an interconnectedness with all things--an understanding of life that expands from collective autonomy to homonomy. Homonomy, in a sense, builds on collective autonomy, which in turn, builds on the foundation of autonomy, but not in a totally hierarchical sequence. According to Boucouvalas, awareness of and development of self and self in relationships takes place in a more open system of balance, each with its own trajectory.<sup>102</sup> Recall that all learning is continuous – built on previous learning. Pinkerton’s ego-transcendent understanding of the common good evolved just as societal interpretations of the common good have evolved over time.

### **The Common Good**

While the common good is based on the importance for the other as always being included in the whole, this concern since antiquity still defies definition. The etymological origin of the word common is the Old French *commun* and Latin *communis* meaning with service “as if serving each other.”<sup>103</sup> Determination of the best way to serve each other, however, is tied to social issues and the issues of the times, conditions that indicate a dynamic quality to the common good. The common good changes with social conditions and political issues. In addition to changing social and political issues, evolving spiritual views have affected its operationalizations throughout the centuries. Mortimer Adler explains that the view one takes of one’s social nature and one’s relation to God affects both an understanding of the common good and one’s view of the proper role of the state or government in attaining the common good.<sup>104</sup> In other words, Michael Smith writes, “The ways in which we understand ourselves as persons have a direct bearing on the ways in which we organize ourselves collectively in political communities.”<sup>105</sup>

---

<sup>101</sup> Boucouvalas, "The Transpersonal Orientation."

<sup>102</sup> Boucouvalas, "The Transpersonal Self," 7; Boucouvalas, "The Transpersonal Orientation."

<sup>103</sup> Rev. Walter W. Skeat, *An Etymological Dictionary of the English Language* (Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1995), 124.

<sup>104</sup> Mortimer J. Adler, editor in chief, *The Great Ideas: A Syntopicon of Great Books of the Western World*, ed. Mortimer J. Adler and William Gorman (Chicago: Encyclopaedia Britannica, Inc., 1952), II.

<sup>105</sup> Michael Smith, *Human Dignity and the Common Good in the Aristotelean-Thomistic Tradition* (Lewiston, NY: The Edwin Mellen Press, 1958), 2.

Adding yet another dynamic dimension, James Collins notes that the ways in which we organize ourselves in political communities also change with each age, each having its own characteristic philosophy.<sup>106</sup> The evolution of humankind precludes the common good in the age of antiquity being the same as the common good in today's age of awareness of global interconnectedness. This fluidity of definition, explains Marcus Raskin, co-founder of the Institute for Policy Studies, makes the common good both "a victim and beneficiary of process; we bring to it our constantly unfolding understanding of what the good is, for society is a system of relationships that produces a common and changing understanding."<sup>107</sup>

An examination of the evolution of thought regarding the common good can be helpful in understanding its dynamic quality and in understanding the origins of Pinkerton's concept of the common good. The philosophers and examples included here are surely not inclusive but are representative of the evolution of thought on the common good. In addition, some insights of each author are used, and others are set aside limiting discussion to the common good.

### The Common Good in Antiquity

In ancient Greece, Plato (c.428-348/347 B. C.) and Aristotle (384-322 B. C.) emphasized the priority of society over man. The state was thought to be a creature of nature and prior to the individual because the individual could not be self-sufficient in isolation. Therefore, Adler clarifies, "...man was like a part in relation to a whole."<sup>108</sup> Society provided the context to meaning. Charles M. Sherover elucidates this view of the priority of society: "Society is the means by which individuals come to see themselves as those whom it has nurtured and developed; society teaches its members to seek their own matured responsibilities as members of a polity, the activities of which are to be justified as the instrument enabling them to seek their common good together."<sup>109</sup>

Plato wrote of the common good as the virtue justice, and justice in Plato's Ideal State was inseparable from the other three virtues of temperance, courage and wisdom. Tham Dilman's citation of Socrates in Plato's *The Gorgias* (269d-270c) elucidates the importance Plato placed on the virtue justice and its embodiment as the common good. Socrates said, "It [justice] is the source of the life of the soul, the condition necessary for its flourishing. A man who... devotes his life to activities which quicken his compassion and deepen his concern for others is said to have 'gained inwardness,' to have deepened his spirituality."<sup>110</sup> Injustice, by contrast, Plato scholar, Irving Zeitlin, writes, was social unrighteousness--"the failure to observe the system of ethics and morals on which the system rests.... The perpetrator of injustice possesses a diseased soul."<sup>111</sup>

In Plato's Ideal State, justice is present when each person is able to perform his best in the job for which he is best suited. Grecian emphasis on the priority of society over man, however, restricted individual choice of job. The choice of job for each person was the task of

---

<sup>106</sup> James Collins, "Book Review of The Philosophy of Bertrand Russell," *The Modern Schoolman* XXII, no. No. 2 (January 1945): 107.

<sup>107</sup> Raskin, *The Common Good: Its Politics, Policies, and Philosophy*, 32.

<sup>108</sup> Adler, *The Great Ideas: A Syntopicon of Great Books of the Western world*, II:826.

<sup>109</sup> Charles M. Sherover, *Time, Freedom and the Common Good* (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1989), 14.

<sup>110</sup> Tham Dilman, *Morality and the Inner Life: A Study in Plato's Gorgias* (New York: Harper and Row, 1979), 23.

<sup>111</sup> Irving M. Zeitlin, *Plato's Vision: The Classical Origins of Social and Political Thought* (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1993), 85.

the just guardians of the society. Only the guardians had a knowledge of goodness and justice and thus could always act for the good of the community. According to Irving Zeitlin, the guardians gained knowledge of goodness and justice through the dialogic method of dialectics, a process of questions and answers used to determine the relations among separate subjects.<sup>112</sup> The virtuous guardians then developed laws to direct the communal good for the greatest happiness of the whole. Because insight and choice were denied to all but a select few for the end product of the common good, Michael Novak says man was a means for the common good.<sup>113</sup>

Aristotle turned to the best form of government for the common good, but the same hierarchical understanding of humans affected his view of a governmental structure organized for justice. Not all humans could enjoy justice. H. Rackham writes that, for Aristotle, justice could only exist between men who are free and “who enjoy either absolute or proportional equality;”<sup>114</sup> hence, injustice toward things that belong to man such as children and slaves did not exist.

Aristotle also assigned justice a different hierarchical status, according to McKeon.<sup>115</sup> While Plato believed justice was inseparable from temperance, courage, and wisdom, Aristotle believed justice was the highest virtue because it always involved ‘the other’ in its practice.

And it [justice] is complete virtue in its fullest sense, because it is the actual exercise of complete virtue. It is complete because he who possesses it can exercise his virtue not only in himself but towards his neighbor also; for many men can exercise virtue in their own affairs, but not in relations to their neighbour. ... and the best man is not he who exercises virtue towards himself but he who exercises it towards another; for this is a difficult task. Justice in this sense, then, is not part of virtue but virtue entire. Justice is perfect because it is our mode of practicing perfect virtue; (*Nicomachean Ethics* 1129b, 30-1130a, 10).<sup>116</sup>

All things were believed to aim at the good, but the good of the community was of utmost importance. Sherover cites from Aristotle’s *Nicomachean Ethics* 1252a: “Every state [*polis*] is a community [*koinonia*] of some kind, and every community is established with a view to some good; for mankind always act in order to obtain that which they think good.”<sup>117</sup> The highest form of community, to Aristotle, was the political community formed in justice and friendship for the common advantage of all.<sup>118</sup> The common advantage of all, continues McKeon, implied a sort of equality. Thus, citizens of lower social status were not excluded from governing roles.

Those people who were best suited for governing, whether rich or poor, should govern the just political community. In fact, if both weren’t represented, according to Aristotle, government would not be just with laws fostering the common good (*Politica* 1281b 20-40).<sup>119</sup>

Aristotle, as did Plato, saw the common good as a final cause, an end in itself. The common good was happiness, which could not be found from an individual perspective only

---

<sup>112</sup> Ibid., 114.

<sup>113</sup> Michael Novak, *Free Persons and the Common Good* (Lanham, MD: Madison Books, 1989), 26-28.

<sup>114</sup> H. Rackham, *Aristotle’s Ethics for English Readers Rendered from the Greek of the Nicomachean Ethics*, trans. H. Rackham (New York: Barnes and Noble, Inc., 1943), 96-97.

<sup>115</sup> McKeon, *The Basic Works of Aristotle*, ed. McKeon (New York: Random House, 1941), 1003.

<sup>116</sup> Ibid., 1003-04.

<sup>117</sup> Sherover, *Time, Freedom and the Common Good*, 16.

<sup>118</sup> McKeon, *The Basic Works of Aristotle*, 936.

<sup>119</sup> Ibid., 1191.

from a life shared with others. In Book 1, Chapter 2 of *Nicomachean Ethics* (1049b8-11), Aristotle wrote, “For even if the end is the same for a single man and for a state, that of the state seems at all events something greater and more complete whether to attain or to preserve; though it is worthwhile to attain the end merely for one man, it is finer and more godlike to attain it for a nation or for city states.”<sup>120</sup> Community fostered the highest good, and justice could only be assured through public civil communication to communicate “the expedient and inexpedient” (1253a 13-15).<sup>121</sup>

### The Judeo-Christian Tradition Unfolds A New Understanding

In the Judeo-Christian tradition, the highest form of community was not the political community, but the communion of all people under God. In the Jewish tradition, God so loved His people that He entered into a covenant with them. Michael Novak saw this covenant as significant in developing a new understanding of the nature of man:

Judaism’s notion of the One God and of the human side of consent to the Covenant led to its emphasis upon the human will, and this in turn led Western culture to reflect upon the sacredness of the human individual, known to God and loved by Him before history began.<sup>122</sup>

Belief in the sacredness of the human individual, known and loved by God, further intensified when some believers saw Jesus as the Son of God and the Messiah come to live among them. These followers of Jesus, who were later called Christians, placed a high value on the common good of its members with a distribution of goods determined by need. From Acts 2: 44-45 we read: “The faithful all lived together and owned everything in common: they sold their goods and possessions and shared out the proceeds among themselves according to what each one needed.”<sup>123</sup> Also in Acts 4: 32, 34-35:

The whole group of believers was united, heart and soul; no one claimed for his own use anything that he had, as everything they owned was held in common.

None of their members was ever in want, as all those who owned land or houses would sell them, and bring the money from them, to present it to the apostles; it was then distributed to any members who might be in need.<sup>124</sup>

The common good clearly was immensely important to the early Christians, but now recognition of its importance came not from guardians or governing bodies of society as before. Rather, a desire for the common good emanated from within the individual. Humankind’s desires, interests, and aptitudes now had priority over society, and humankind willfully chose to use them for the benefit of society – an interesting phenomenon. Michael J. Schuck explains that these early Christians’ structure of society stemmed from their spiritual views. Schuck notes that life was lived out of a pastoral metaphor of a shepherd and his flock. Society for the early Christians was “the flock’s spatial milieu with areas of nourishment and security and also areas

---

<sup>120</sup> McKeon, *The Basic Works of Aristotle*, 936.

<sup>121</sup> *Ibid.*, 1129.

<sup>122</sup> Novak, *Free Persons and the Common Good*, 26.

<sup>123</sup> *The Jerusalem Bible*, Reader's Edition (Garden City, NY: Doubleday & Company, Ltd., 1968), 159.

<sup>124</sup> *Ibid.*, 161.

of wilderness with wolves.”<sup>125</sup> The person was to have the virtues of a lamb in the flock and those of Christ, the Good Shepherd: simplicity, obedience, and long suffering.<sup>126</sup> Jesus had told them as often as they had fed the hungry, clothed the naked, visited the sick or incarcerated, welcomed strangers, etc., they had also done that for Him.

From the Christians’ belief that Jesus is both God and man, Novak says theologians then began to understand person differently from individual:

An individual is merely a member of a species...A person designates an individual with a capacity for insight (inquiry) and choice (liberty). This means a self-starting capacity, a seat of responsibility, a being that is responsible for understanding and directing its own activities, independently of any other.<sup>127</sup>

James Collins states that each age has its own characteristic philosophy of organization into communities.<sup>128</sup> The ancient Grecian priority of society became unacceptable to the Jewish people, when, in their tradition, God entered into a covenant with man. The individual with a human will was seen as sacred and loved by God.

The understanding of humanness later expanded from individual with human will to person made in the image of God and thus, able to direct his own activities. The early Christian community, without even guardians or legislation to direct activity toward the common good, willfully lived lives dedicated to the common good of all.

#### The Common Good in the Roman Catholic Tradition

Thomas Aquinas, (1224-1274), an admirer of Aristotle, combined classical notions of the common good with this Judeo-Christian concept of person created in God’s image (having a capacity for insight and choice), according to Novak.<sup>129</sup> Novak says this characteristic of God, now understood to be in man, meant that man could never be a means to the end of a common good. Instead government must exist, or be the means, to allow people to reach their end—fulfillment of union with God.<sup>130</sup> Man must always have the right to exercise insight and choice in the common good.

Aquinas, Smith clarifies, believed man’s pursuit of personal happiness was guided by conscience toward the common good, and governments had a moral responsibility to serve people and help them lead virtuous lives. While consciences guided, Smith continues, Aquinas believed achievement of the common good would also need the Aristotelian view of civic friendship founded on virtue and distributive justice to correct inequalities among men.<sup>131</sup> Smith adds, “Where there is justice, friendship is possible. And where there is friendship, there is the pursuit of the common good.”<sup>132</sup>

---

<sup>125</sup> Michael J. Schuck, "Modern Catholic Social Thought," in *The New Dictionary of Catholic Social Thought*, ed. Judith A. Dwyer (Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 1994), 624.

<sup>126</sup> Ibid.

<sup>127</sup> Novak, *Free Persons and the Common Good*, 27-28.

<sup>128</sup> Collins, "Book Review of The Philosophy of Bertrand Russell."

<sup>129</sup> Novak, *Free Persons and the Common Good*, 26.

<sup>130</sup> Novak, *Free Persons and the Common Good*, 26-28.

<sup>131</sup> Smith, *Human Dignity and the Common Good*, 123-29.

<sup>132</sup> Ibid., 167.

Aquinas invoked the Judeo-Christian hierarchy of community. While membership in a political community was limited to citizens only, all people were creatures of God and thus members of a community that transcended the political community. Smith explains that now God is the common good of the whole. Happiness is the good of the human species, and happiness is found in God.<sup>133</sup>

Schuck notes that with Aquinas, the pastoral metaphor changed to a metaphor of cosmological design: "Now God is imaged less as the Good Shepherd and more as the intelligent designer of the universe."<sup>134</sup> Society in this metaphor, Schuck continues, is a part of God's universal order with the person at "the apex of God's earthly order."<sup>135</sup>

Throughout the centuries, according to Novak, many incarnations of priority of society and priority of humankind evolve and exist in a state of tension. As humankind evolves, Novak says, differences arise among definitions of person, community, individual, collective, association, state, private and public.<sup>136</sup> The Roman Catholic Church's collective autonomy, sometimes with universal vision and sometimes with protective, particular interests, throughout the years has instructed its members to live their lives with a concern for the common good. The needs of the times determined which aspect of the common good the various popes emphasized.

Catholic social teaching embodies two themes: that of the dignity of the human person with certain inalienable rights and the common good, which perfects society. To pursue the common good without recognizing the rights of persons is impossible. According to Smith, the common good consists of an ethical life lived in common, "a life characterized by justice and friendship."<sup>137</sup> Even so, Catholic thought regarding the common good has evolved just as humankind has evolved. Pinkerton, in a 1997 speech, described Catholic social teaching as "dynamic, always evolving, critiquing the dynamics of each age, announcing what is pro-Gospel and denouncing what is contrary to the Gospel. It then announces an alternative, new way of being."<sup>138</sup>

When socialism arose in protest to the exploitation of workers in the Industrial Revolution, Pope Leo XIII (1878-1903) saw an alternative way. Leo, according to Gerald Fogarty, S.J., took the middle road for the common good between "socialism's denial of private property and capitalism's denial of the rights of labor."<sup>139</sup> Stephen J. Pope said Leo XIII issued *Rerum novarum* (On the Condition of Labor) on May 15, 1891, to address the impact of industrial capitalism on the working class with "the enormous fortunes of some few individuals and the utter poverty of the masses (1)"<sup>140</sup>. *Rerum novarum* rejected both the belief of economic liberalists that social progress would be achieved by a free market supplemented by Christian charity and the socialist position in which private property was to be abolished for social

---

<sup>133</sup> Ibid., 75-82.

<sup>134</sup> Schuck, "Modern Catholic Social Thought," 624.

<sup>135</sup> Ibid.

<sup>136</sup> Novak, *Free Persons and the Common Good*, 2.

<sup>137</sup> Smith, *Human Dignity and the Common Good*, 1.

<sup>138</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Global Spirituality" (Maryknoll, NY, March 17, 1998), 27.

<sup>139</sup> Gerald P. Fogarty, S. J., "Leo XIII," ed. Judith A. Dwyer (Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 1994), 547.

<sup>140</sup> The numbers in parentheses indicate location of the passage within the encyclical, *Rerum novarum* Stephen J. Pope, "Rerum Novarum," in *The New Dictionary of Catholic Social Thought*, ed. Judith A. Dwyer (Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 1994), 830.

progress.<sup>141</sup> Leo XIII argued for a natural right to property and said that banishing private property would “reduce everyone to poverty rather than raise up the poor.”<sup>142</sup>

Regarding working classes and capitalists, Leo said they both need each other, and each had a *duty* toward the other (19), laborers to perform the work they agreed to do and capitalists to respect the dignity of workers by providing them with reasonable hours of work, safe jobs suitable to their strength and age, and just wages (20).<sup>143</sup> Laws should be structured to minimize the need for charity to the poor. The state is charged with promoting, and working class members are a part of the social whole (32, 33). According to Leo, “The state must intervene whenever the common good, including the good of any single class, is threatened with harm and no other solution is forthcoming” (35).<sup>144</sup> In general, however, Leo writes, “the law must not undertake more, nor proceed further, than is required for the remedy of the evil or the removal of the mischief” (36).<sup>145</sup> Leo endorsed the right of workers to organize in labor and trade unions to promote their own particular good within the context of the larger common good of society (48-61).<sup>146</sup> *Rerum novarum* defended workers’ rights to receive a wage sufficient to support them and their families and provide enough to save for the purchase of property (9) (65). The state was to protect private property (55) and should “protect equitably each and every class of citizens, maintaining inviolate that justice especially which is called distributive” (49).<sup>147</sup> However, if the state failed in its protection and “change would threaten the established order, he exhorted the poor to seek comfort in their heavenly reward.”<sup>148</sup>

Forty years after *Rerum novarum* was issued, in a period of worldwide economic depression, unemployment, and tension between the Vatican and Italy’s Fascist regime, Pope Pius XI (1857-1939) issued the encyclical *Quadragesimo anno* (On Reconstructing the Social Order) on May 15, 1931.<sup>149</sup> Marie Giblin explained that Pius XI saw economic power as abusing political power and using it for private gain of a few and wrote that public authority (the state) needed to limit economic domination.<sup>150</sup> Giblin reflects that Pius did not condemn capitalism in the face of the alternatives of socialism and fascism. According to Giblin, Pius, like his predecessors, saw self-centered atomism in capitalism, but saw a greater danger in systems in which people were conceived of as means to the end of a state.<sup>151</sup> Socialism, according to Pius, demanded such “total submission of people to society in the interest of production of wealth” that it violated the Christian view of persons “as placed on earth with a social nature under an authority ordained by God and with duties to fulfill in accord with one’s station.”<sup>152</sup> “Pius,” Giblin continues, “saw the solution to regaining the common good as moral – a return to Christian moderation rather than as social or political, and he hoped that an educational program,

---

<sup>141</sup> Pope, "Rerum novarum," 830.

<sup>142</sup> Ibid., 831.

<sup>143</sup> Ibid.

<sup>144</sup> Ibid., 835.

<sup>145</sup> Ibid.

<sup>146</sup> Ibid., 836.

<sup>147</sup> Ibid., 547.

<sup>148</sup> Amata Miller, "On the Side of the Poor: Evolution of a Stance," *Shaping a New World: The Catholic Social Justice Tradition 1891-1991* (1991).

<sup>149</sup> Marie J. Giblin, "Quadragesimo anno," in *The New Dictionary of Catholic Social Thought*, ed. Judith A. Dwyer (Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 1994), 803.

<sup>150</sup> Ibid., 809.

<sup>151</sup> Ibid., 810.

<sup>152</sup> Ibid.

Catholic Action, would develop new Christian leaders.”<sup>153</sup> Catholic Action, however, often acted more in the role of activist for social change than as educator.

While Pius XI addressed the abuse of economic power with a call for Christian morality and charity, some people sought reform in totalitarian ideologies that demanded total conformity on the part of people. The intent of totalitarianism may have been reform, but the resulting racism, elitism, terrorism, and violence used to control others have been well documented. The common disappeared from the common good. Novak reports that the Fascist and Stalinist totalitarian regimes in Europe prompted a great deal of debate on whether the common good is a final cause or a means of attaining one’s private good.<sup>154</sup>

The struggle for balance between man’s freedom for insight and choice and the common good continued with the works of Jacques Maritain (1882-1973). Writing after World War II, Maritain believed “a misconception of the individual had led the bourgeois democracy to grief [and] a misconception of the common good had led Communist states into totalitarianisms.”<sup>155</sup> To restore what he saw as the proper balance, Maritain returned to the teachings of Thomas Aquinas in which man was made in God’s image and the supreme good as being union with God.<sup>156</sup> Ralph McNery says Maritain was one of the major figures in a Thomistic revival. His thought reflected that of Aquinas, but it also reflected the times in which he lived.<sup>157</sup>

Totalitarian regimes of the time focused on the economic good, but Maritain, seeing the abuses of these regimes, focused on the political common good.<sup>158</sup> The abuses, Smith wrote, caused Maritain to make a distinction between the State and the political community and evoke the common good in the political order.<sup>159</sup> Maritain referred to the state as “an administrative apparatus designed to serve the community,” and the political community as composed of persons. As such, the State may even set itself against the good of the whole community and become a super-individual.”<sup>160</sup> In response to this “super individual” state, Maritain explained that man is a whole; society is a whole of wholes, and the common good of society cannot sacrifice its parts to itself. Rather, “it [the common good] is therefore common to both the whole and parts into which it flows back and which, in turn, must benefit from it.”<sup>161</sup> The common good, Maritain continued, must have as its principal value, “the access of persons to their liberty of expansion.”<sup>162</sup> Liberty of expansion was not meant to include greed, however. Maritain wrote:

If a person’s actions follow the bent of material individualism, his development will be oriented to the ego with intent to grasp for itself. But, if development occurs in the direction of spiritual personality, man will be oriented towards the generous self of the heroes and saints. Thus man will be truly a person only in so far as the life of the spirit and of liberty reigns over that of the senses and passions.<sup>163</sup>

---

<sup>153</sup> Ibid., 812.

<sup>154</sup> Novak, *Free Persons and the Common Good*, 3.

<sup>155</sup> Ibid.

<sup>156</sup> Smith, *Human Dignity and the Common Good*; Novak, *Free Persons and the Common Good*.

<sup>157</sup> Ralph McNery, “Jacques Maritain,” in *The New Dictionary of Catholic Social Thought*, ed. Judith A. Dwyer (Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 1994), 563.

<sup>158</sup> Smith, *Human Dignity and the Common Good*, iv.

<sup>159</sup> Ibid.

<sup>160</sup> Smith, *Human Dignity and the Common Good*, iv.

<sup>161</sup> Jacques Maritain, *The Person and the Common Good*, First paperback edition 1966, trans. John J. Fitzgerald (Notre Dame, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press, 1946), 51.

<sup>162</sup> Ibid., 55.

<sup>163</sup> Ibid., 44-45.

However, warned Maritain, if education denied the role of ego by trying to excise it and replace it with “the heart of an angel,” the result could never be an authentic person, but one wearing the mask of the Pharisee.<sup>164</sup> Later in this chapter, the reader will find more about the danger of denying the ego found in the literature of transpersonal psychology. The art of education, Maritain continues, is not excising but pruning and trimming, “operations in which both the individual and the person are interested-in such wise that, within the intimacy of the human being, the gravity of individuality diminishes and that of true personality and its generosity increases.”<sup>165</sup>

Twentieth century popes continued calling for an increase in generosity and denouncing the evils they saw in society. Nancy Sylvester, I.H.M.,<sup>166</sup> and Carol Coston, O.P.,<sup>167</sup> refer to these social teachings of the church as “the prophetic tradition of denouncing and announcing.”<sup>168</sup> In 1961, Pope John XXIII deplored the widening gap between rich and poor nations and denounced the arms race.<sup>169</sup> His encyclical *Mater et magistra* (Christianity and Social Progress) defined the common good as “the sum total of social conditions of social living, whereby persons are enabled more fully and readily to achieve their own perfection” (MM 65).<sup>170</sup> John XXIII’s 1963 encyclical *Pacem in terris* (Peace on Earth) again called for disarmament and also a worldwide public authority to promote a universal common good.<sup>171</sup>

In 1965, still decrying world poverty, Pope John issued yet another encyclical, *Gaudium et spes* (The Church in the Modern World). *Gaudium et spes* stressed distributive justice in the common good and an expansion of the role of the Christian, writes Amata Miller. Miller says the document stressed that “almsgiving from superfluous income is no longer enough for the nonpoor...justice requires a new economic order in which poor nations have a more equal share of the world’s goods.”<sup>172</sup> Pope Paul VI (1897 - 1978), responding to the famine, disease, illiteracy, poverty and disease of Third World, wrote in *Evangelii nuntiandi* (Evangelization in the Modern World) that social justice is integral to faith. Social teaching needed to translate into action, and his 1971 *Octogesima adveniens* (A Call to Action) called for political action for economic justice.<sup>173</sup> At a 1971 Synod of Justice, the U. S. Bishops declared, “for those who had ears to hear,” says Pinkerton, that “justice was a constitutive element of the preaching of the Gospel.”<sup>174</sup>

Increasingly, Catholics who advocate the common good address economic justice. John Paul II (1920 –) called for the transformation of economic structures in *Redemptor hominis*

---

<sup>164</sup> Pharisees, in scripture, are alternately referred to as a brood of vipers (Matthew 12: 34), frauds (Matthew 24: 13), blind fools (Matthew 24: 17), whitewashed tombs, beautiful on the outside but inside full of filth and dead men's bones (Matthew 24: 27), and filled with hypocrisy (Matthew 24: 28) Maritain, *The Person and the Common Good*, 45.

<sup>165</sup> Ibid., 46.

<sup>166</sup> Immaculate Heart of Mary Community

<sup>167</sup> Oblate Sisters of Providence

<sup>168</sup> Nancy Sylvester and Carol Coston, "The Prophetic Tradition of Denouncing and Announcing," *Shaping a New World* (1991).

<sup>169</sup> Network, *Shaping a New World* (Washington, D. C.: Network, Inc., 1991), 5.

<sup>170</sup> SJ Hollenbach, David, "Common Good," in *The New Dictionary of Catholic Social Thought*, ed. Judith A. Dwyer and Elizabeth L. Montgomery (Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 1994), 193.

<sup>171</sup> Network, *Shaping a New World*, 5.

<sup>172</sup> Miller, "On the Side of the Poor," 11.

<sup>173</sup> Network, *Shaping a New World*, 7.

<sup>174</sup> Pinkerton, "Global Spirituality," 11.

(Redeemer of Humankind) (1979), and for workplace justice in *Laborem exercens* (On Human Work) (1981).<sup>175</sup> His 1991 *Centesimus annus* (The 100<sup>th</sup> Year), Miller writes, detailed “Western capitalist nations’ ills: consumerism, materialism, exploitation, alienation, marginalization, environmental damage, and deterioration of social bonds and calls for individual and societal conversion.”<sup>176</sup>

As Western nations rely on market forces for economic growth, Catholic bishops in the United Kingdom remind Catholics that the social teachings of the Catholic Church reject the belief in the “automatic beneficence of market forces.”<sup>177</sup> According to the British bishops, without Marxist Communism, however flawed it was, to act as a “balancing factor or crude brake on some of the excesses of which capitalism is capable,” promotion and application of the church’s social teachings is more necessary than ever.<sup>178</sup>

In summary, Plato, Aristotle, Thomas Aquinas, Popes Leo XIII, Pius XI, John XXIII, Paul VI, John Paul II, and Jacques Maritain all saw humankind as social in nature and society as necessary for the development of the individual. The Christian influence falls more strongly on the dignity and wholeness of the individual, but nonetheless, the social dimension of the human condition is emphasized. Let us now look at the common good within our own shores.

### The Common Good in the United States

The emphasis on the dignity and wholeness of the individual as a social being found a home in the founding of the new republic. The 1776 framers of the Constitution of the United States reflected an orientation toward the common good when they planned a government “by the people, for the people, and of the people.” However, Alan Shain notes, there are two political philosophies, two competing visions, of what the Founding Fathers meant by the balance of individual rights with social responsibilities.<sup>179</sup> These visions are liberalism and republicanism. According to Shain, individualists of the liberal tradition believe that eighteenth century Americans were advocates of political individualism and thus “defended something like the modern concept of individual freedom—freedom to do what one wishes.”<sup>180</sup> Shain has found a competing myth, however, in the work of revisionist historians of the 1960s and 1970s. According to Shain, revisionist historians saw a rich tradition of political thought that has been lost in “the myth of individualism.”<sup>181</sup> Republican historiography, according to Shain, “evidences priority awarded to the good of the public rather than the individual.”<sup>182</sup> Shain says this public good “was not an ultimate end, but an immediate and aggregate one that was valued ahead of the short-term and particular ends of the community’s constituent members.”<sup>183</sup>

Novak, a liberalist, disagrees and says the American experiment was an original conception of the common good with central to the common good the protection of individual

---

<sup>175</sup> Network, *Shaping a New World*, 7.

<sup>176</sup> Miller, “On the Side of the Poor,” 9.

<sup>177</sup> United Kingdom Catholic Bishops Conference, “Morality in the Market Place,” in *The Common Good*, <<http://www.tasc.ac.uk/cc/cbc/cg004.htm>>, 1997.

<sup>178</sup> United Kingdom Catholic Bishops Conference, “Morality in the Market Place.”

<sup>179</sup> Alan Shain, *The Myth of American Individualism* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1994), xiv.

<sup>180</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>181</sup> *Ibid.*, 21.

<sup>182</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>183</sup> *Ibid.*

rights.<sup>184</sup> “The framers wished to build an *ordo* worthy of free persons, each endowed with inalienable rights,” and they sought to plan a government that would accomplish this.<sup>185</sup> The Preamble to the Constitution, Novak states, illuminates in civil discourse desired elements of the components of the common good: “We the People of the United States, in Order to form a more perfect Union, establish Justice, insure domestic tranquillity provide for the common defense, promote the general Welfare, and secure the Blessings of Liberty to ourselves and our Posterity, do ordain and establish this Constitution for the United States of America.”<sup>186</sup> Thus, according to Novak, “The people, the society at large, not the state are the definers of the common good.”<sup>187</sup>

Novak sees in liberalism a fostering of the communitarian individual where others have seen only an atomistic concept of the solitary individual. David Hollenbach, S.J., makes a distinction between liberalists and communitarians, however. Hollenbach says that when free equal people have opposing visions about the common good, liberalists believe to enact laws “implementing a comprehensive vision of the common good is a violation of the rights of people to equal concern and respect.”<sup>188</sup> Liberalists put the right prior to the good. Hollenbach describes communitarians as believing that human beings are social beings and their communal roles, commitments, and social bonds constitute their selfhood. “The determination of how persons ought to live,” Hollenbach continues, “depends on a prior determination of what kinds of social relationship and communal participation are to be valued as good in themselves. Therefore the good is prior to the right.”<sup>189</sup>

The balance between individual rights and the common good is often difficult to maintain, and communitarian Amitai Etzioni reminds, “Strong rights presume strong responsibilities.”<sup>190</sup> Communitarians, according to Etzioni, believe that “societies, like bicycles, teeter and need continuously to be pulled back to center lest they lean too far toward anarchy or tyranny.”<sup>191</sup> The center is the fulcrum for communitarians. Etzioni explains that in China, a communitarian would fight for expanding individual rights, but in the United States now, communitarians believe that social responsibilities need attention.<sup>192</sup>

Conflicting political views in the United States also exist regarding government’s role in maintaining the common good. The Democratic Party tends to favor a strong national government in favor of public projects for the common good. Novak attributes the lineage for this view to the Progressive Movement of the early twentieth century, to the philosopher John Dewey, and to Franklin Delano Roosevelt.<sup>193</sup> But the liberal view, according to Novak, sees the United States as a community of communities and public-spiritedness as “rarely expressed in sweeping national projects (except in cases of national emergency), such as war, and even there with due regard for local control, state and local responsibilities, and rights...decisions most wisely made by the local agencies closest to the relevant daily realities, and by next-highest

---

<sup>184</sup> Novak, *Free Persons and the Common Good*, 39, 41.

<sup>185</sup> *Ibid.*, 43.

<sup>186</sup> Novak, *Free Persons and the Common Good*, 44.

<sup>187</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>188</sup> *Ibid.*, 157.

<sup>189</sup> *Ibid.*, 157-58.

<sup>190</sup> Amitai Etzioni, "Introduction," in *Rights and the Common Good*, ed. Amitai Etzioni (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1995), 1.

<sup>191</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>193</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>193</sup> Novak, *Free Persons and the Common Good*, 125.

agencies only when beyond the capacities of actors at lower levels.”<sup>194</sup> This model, claims Novak, is the older one in the United States, dating back to Madison and Jefferson.

Novak does not mention, however, that when the founders were trying to unite the colonies they stressed sameness among the citizens—not individualism nor even commonality. According to Marty, Jefferson and Alexander Hamilton feared that the diversity of immigrants’ ideals would “corrupt the national spirit.”<sup>195</sup> Imposing sameness was seen as a means to the desired end of commonality for the common good. Government, however, did not impose this sameness. By the 19th century, education, not government, was used to impose sameness via schoolbooks that gave the American child “an idealized image both of himself and of the history that produced the admired American type.”<sup>196</sup> The common good was thought attainable through uniformity rather than unity.

Reconciling respect for the dignity of persons and the common good is a twofold problem according to Novak. It is, first of all, a moral problem: “Only a people practicing virtues of certain kinds can make such an experiment work.”<sup>197</sup> It is, second, an institutional problem. The virtues, the habits of the heart, Novak calls “the single most important part of the common good of a free society”, and he says they are weakened today. “As these habits weaken,” notes Novak, “the decay of institutions follows swiftly.”<sup>198</sup>

Through drugs, fanaticism, violence, and the aberrations of passion, human beings can and do destroy the image of God in themselves. In free societies today, millions of persons are betraying their own inner agencies of insight and choice. Liberals, focused upon external enemies, have paid too little attention to the threat of darkness from within every human heart.<sup>199</sup>

Because in a free society, every citizen depends upon the virtues of the other, Novak says, the common good will be found by turning to practices of cooperation in being “alert to goods not presently being attended to and to evils that are already choking the tree of common blessings.”<sup>200</sup> According to Novak, the common good today cannot be a set of common aims, purposes, and intentions as is possible in a homogeneous society. Rather, “the essence in a pluralistic society consists in mutual cooperation.”<sup>201</sup> Indeed, believes Novak, the chief social agencies, free associations of persons concerned with the moral and cultural dimensions of life, are far more basic to the achievement of the common good than the state.<sup>202</sup>

Whether one agrees or disagrees with Novak’s liberalism, the importance he places on the virtues or habits of the heart for the common good are found in the writings of Plato, Aristotle, and Aquinas. Novak’s belief that the essence of the common good is mutual cooperation seems to find support by contemporary authors mentioned in Chapter One. Martin Marty’s advice for every citizen was to “start associating, telling, hearing and keep talking.”

---

<sup>194</sup> Ibid.

<sup>195</sup> Marty, *The One and the Many*, 49.

<sup>196</sup> Ruth Miller Elson, *Guardians of Tradition: American Schoolbooks of the 19th Century* (Lincoln, Nebraska: University of Nebraska Press, 1964), vii; Marty, *The One and the Many*, 55.

<sup>197</sup> Novak, *Free Persons and the Common Good*, 141.

<sup>198</sup> Ibid., 141-42.

<sup>199</sup> Ibid., 142.

<sup>200</sup> Ibid.

<sup>201</sup> Ibid., 82-83.

<sup>202</sup> Novak, *Free Persons and the Common Good*, 146-47.

Sherover says that from communal reasoning together we form common concepts of justice that bond us together. Marcus Raskin urges an empathic awareness of the Other, and George Rupp calls for collaboration between the academic and religious communities to foster a communal focus and civic participation for the common good.

This provides the perfect opportunity to discover and illuminate the development of the habits of the heart, the virtues of the common good in a member of a religious community who educates, calls forth from others an acceptance of their responsibility to “care for humanity and for the earth we call home.”<sup>203</sup> Pinkerton notes how proudly, and rightfully so, we speak of our freedoms in the United States; we have freedom from unjust intrusions and the right to join groups designed to protect our freedoms.<sup>204</sup> “The circle of our freedom,” Pinkerton adds, “is protected by the style of government which was designed by our founders and is set as an ideal for the whole human community. Whatever its shortcomings, we must be aware of and proud of that heritage.”<sup>205</sup> According to Pinkerton, that is our civic freedom. “Our scriptural freedom (for Christians) is freedom *for* (Italics mine) rather than freedom from,” and it is relational says Pinkerton.<sup>206</sup> Addressing a Religious Education Congress, Pinkerton taught, “The relationship between Jesus and the person is both the launching pad and the frame of reference in all relationships.”<sup>207</sup> Noting the mutuality, maturity, and responsibility which Jesus exemplified in His interaction with others, Pinkerton adds, “Jesus did not free us for ourselves but to enter into the task of transforming the earth, of building a Kingdom of Justice and Peace...a challenge to be for others as Jesus was for us.”<sup>208</sup>

Robert Bellah, author of *Habits of the Heart* and *The Good Society*, would find hope in Pinkerton’s remarks. According to William Raspberry of the *Washington Post*, Bellah hopes “that organized religion, however secularized and individualized, might again assert the transcendent truths—including the homely one that we need each other, that ‘our precious and unique selves aren’t going to make it alone’.”<sup>209</sup>

### **The Transpersonal Perspective**

Transpersonal psychology seeks to study people such as Pinkerton who live lives of service, are reconcilers and peacekeepers, and who are able to see a sanctity and interconnectedness among all things. According to Marcie Boucouvalas, four levels of research exist in transpersonal psychology and study: (a) on the individual level, healthy individuals who have transcended ego boundaries and learned ways to nurture a balanced development of the whole individual, (b) on a group level, relationships as important means of transcendence, (c) on a societal level “ways to actualize the vision of a transformed society (based on transpersonal world views),” and finally, on a planetary/cosmic level, (d) “the developmental process of consciousness, including humanity’s place in the evolution of the planet.”<sup>210</sup> Thomas Berry, a

---

<sup>203</sup> Pinkerton, "The Wellspring of Political Action: Prayer," 38.

<sup>204</sup> Pinkerton, "NAWR: A Vision for the Future," 3.

<sup>205</sup> Ibid.

<sup>206</sup> Pinkerton, "NAWR: A Vision for the Future," 9.

<sup>207</sup> Ibid., 13.

<sup>208</sup> Ibid.

<sup>209</sup> William Raspberry, "Market Idolatry," *The Washington Post*, Friday/April 10 1998, A23.

<sup>210</sup> Marcie Boucouvalas, "An Analysis of Lifelong Learning and Transpersonal Psychology as Two Complementary Movements Reflecting and Contributing to Social Transformation," diss (Tallahassee, Florida: Florida State University, 1980), 40. The researcher would like to acknowledge the contribution of this seminal work. In the late '70s, there was no conceptualization of the field. Dr. Boucouvalas spent a number of years reading and analyzing

Catholic priest, whom John F. Haught calls “one of our foremost environmental thinkers today,” attributes the current surge of environmental concern to this evolutionary process of consciousness.<sup>211</sup>

Charles Tart defines transpersonal psychology as “the social manifestation” of trying to understand and develop the parts of our nature that are beyond (trans) our ordinary, limited, personal self.<sup>212</sup> Transpersonal psychology emerged in the 1960s in Western psychology and is often referred to as the fourth force.<sup>213</sup> The first force was the psychoanalytic approach that introduced the concept of the unconscious and its effect on behavior, focusing on the healthiness of releasing suppressed material into the unconscious.<sup>214</sup> The second force behaviorists, says Boucouvalas, reacted to what they claimed was nonverifiable and subjective and focused on observable behavior and ways to modify it.<sup>215</sup> Behaviorists stressed the importance of environment as a determinant of behavior.<sup>216</sup> Humanistic psychology, the third force, according to Boucouvalas, emerged unifying the first two by focusing on the whole person, not fragmented parts.<sup>217</sup> Humanistic psychology studied healthy, self-actualized people. Maslow developed his hierarchy of needs with self-actualization at the peak as the goal of personal growth.<sup>218</sup> Maslow, in his later years, however, Boucouvalas says, predicted the emergence of the fourth force, transpersonal psychology:

I consider Humanistic, Third Force Psychology to be transitional, a preparation for a still ‘higher’ Fourth Force Psychology, transpersonal, transhuman, centered in the cosmos rather than in actual needs and interest going beyond humanness, identity, self-actualization, and the like.<sup>219</sup>

Charles Tart provides a clear explanation of the emergence of this transpersonal fourth force. Tart says in the 1950s and 1960s therapists began seeing clients who were successful by the standards of our culture but who complained of an emptiness in their lives. Humanistic psychology, which focused on creativity and “finding meaning beyond material gratification,” evolved in response to this dis-ease.<sup>220</sup> Described by Tart as an exciting time—“a time of discovery that intelligence is not just a matter of intellectual, cognitive processes-- a realization

---

the extant literature, devising a five page conceptualization and sending it to a "Delphi" panel of the major authors and leaders in the emerging field for modification and verification. The resulting conceptualization was termed an "emerging outline" because of its incipient nature. This effort helped provide a substantive framework of concept characteristics in order to adequately analyze in a comparative manner the concept characteristics in order to adequately analyze in a comparative manner the concept characteristics juxtaposed to the lifelong learning movement which was already fairly well conceptualized and established.

<sup>211</sup> Thomas Berry, *The Dream of the Earth* (San Francisco: Sierra Club Books, 1988); John F. Haught, *The Promise of Nature* (New York: Paulist Press, 1993), 14, 84.

<sup>212</sup> Tart, "Introduction," ix.

<sup>213</sup> Boucouvalas, "Transpersonal Psychology: Scope and Challenges Revisited.;" Sutich, *Transpersonal Psychology*; Tart, "Introduction."

<sup>214</sup> Boucouvalas, "Social Transformation," 7.

<sup>215</sup> Ibid.

<sup>216</sup> Boucouvalas, "Transpersonal Psychology: Scope and Challenges Revisited.;" Sutich, *Transpersonal Psychology*; Tart, "Introduction."

<sup>217</sup> Boucouvalas, "Social Transformation," 7.

<sup>218</sup> A. H. Maslow, *Motivation and Personality* (New York: Harper and Row, 1954).

<sup>219</sup> Boucouvalas, "Social Transformation," 7; Maslow, *Toward a Psychology of Being*, iii-iv.

<sup>220</sup> Tart, "Introduction."

grew of the intelligence of the heart and body.”<sup>221</sup> According to Tart, it was an understanding of higher level of holistic functioning but still neglected the spirit. Spirit, Tart says, is “something real beyond the material manifestations of life, something we get fleeting glimpses of in ‘mystical experiences,’ the vital energy underlying religions before they all too often ossify into mechanisms of social control.”<sup>222</sup> Attention to spirit enhances the human condition as eastern and mystical religions and transpersonal psychology attest.<sup>223</sup>

### Transpersonal Psychology’s Interface with Mysticism

In the late 1960s, according to Frances Vaughan, Abraham Maslow, Stanislav Grof, and Anthony Sutich, among others, integrated humanistic psychology with Eastern and mystical religions.<sup>224</sup> Stanislav Grof, writes that the spiritual philosophies of the ancient and Eastern cultures see “consciousness and creative intelligence as primary attributes of existence, both immanent and transcendent in regard to the phenomenal world,” whereas Western psychology has seen human beings as “highly developed animals and thinking biological machines who have a fleeting and insignificant role in the overall scheme of things.”<sup>225</sup> According to Vaughan, “immanent and transcendent consciousness” stem from a unifying transforming wisdom within that is spoken of in all major religions. For example, Vaughan notes that, “Christians believe ‘the kingdom of God is within.’ In Buddhism, wisdom is in the discovery of ‘our own true nature’; in Hinduism, it is in ‘Atman’ realization’....”<sup>226</sup> Whatever the terminology used, all speak of a wisdom deep within ourselves.

Pinkerton’s relationship with Jesus reflects this inner wisdom of which mysticism and transpersonal psychology speak. “Allowing Jesus full possession over one is not the same as a Jesus and I mentality; it is a radical expansion of such spirituality,” Pinkerton says, and she adds:

One who allows God absolute dominion over one’s life has radical internal freedom... Paul talked about the follower of Jesus being free from the Torah. Paul was saying that there was an act on the part of God which issues in a new creation for those who respond to the creative act of God. This act is continually working within the person who responds in faith. Something ontological takes place. The person can, through the power of Jesus, experience a new freedom, the freedom over sin and death, a freedom that is interior and radical, that is operative even in situations where exterior restraints limit the right to do what one chooses. One who gives Jesus full possession (of him/herself) knows that ultimate happiness rests in the willingness to be called forth as a unique person to fulfillment in Him, to become freely who one is in Him.<sup>227</sup>

The ontological knowledge of which Pinkerton speaks frees the ego. Ego is subsumed into a perspective of connectedness rather than separateness. Transpersonal psychology seeks to

---

<sup>221</sup> Ibid., ix.

<sup>222</sup> Ibid.

<sup>223</sup> Ibid.

<sup>224</sup> Frances E. Vaughan, "The Transpersonal Perspective: A Personal Overview," *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology* 14, no. 1 (1982): 40.

<sup>225</sup> Stanislav Grof, "East and West: Ancient Wisdom and Modern Science," *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology* 15, no. 1 (1983): 14.

<sup>226</sup> Vaughan, "The Transpersonal Perspective," 37.

<sup>227</sup> Pinkerton, "NAWR: A Vision for the Future," 3.

study people such as Pinkerton who realize we need each other, who live lives of service, who are reconcilers and peacekeepers, and who are able to see a sanctity and interconnectedness among all things and all world views. Spiritual psychologies such as Pinkerton's are a subject of interest in the field of transpersonal psychology for their power to transform.<sup>228</sup>

Tart urges using these spiritual psychologies as "sources of inspiration, neither embracing them uncritically, nor rejecting them unthinkingly."<sup>229</sup> Tart writes, "If there is a real spiritual dimension linking us, so that we are brothers and sisters in some profound and loving way, then we have a vital basis for creating peace in the world and genuinely caring for each other's welfare. Insofar as we discover the reality of the transpersonal, we will be rich in a much more important way than in the material dimension and these riches will transform our world for the better."<sup>230</sup> According to Tart, many of the world's problems result from a neglect of the spirit, causing a spiritual vacuum which has been enormously costly. To find our spiritual side and to find good solutions to world problems, Tart advocates looking at psychologies that have dwelt with the spirit and cites a need to link current research with the work of researchers such as William James and Carl Jung and with "the 'esoteric' psychologies of other cultures, such as Sufism, Yoga, and Buddhism."<sup>231</sup> These psychologies all speak of an inner wisdom. Vaughan, too, writes that access to this source of inner wisdom is needed in order "to use science for the benefit of humanity, rather than for self-destruction."<sup>232</sup>

Other researchers, too, believe this inner wisdom has such potential for benefiting humanity. Stanislav and Christina Grof report that people who are involved in the process of spiritual emergence tend to develop a new appreciation for all forms of life and a new understanding of the unity of all things:

Consideration of all humanity, compassion for all of life, and thinking terms of the entire planet take priority over the narrow interests of individuals, families, political parties, classes, nations, and creeds. That which connects us all and that which we have in common become more important than our differences, which are seen as enhancing rather than threatening.<sup>233</sup>

Peter Russell says the nucleus of our being holds enormous untapped potential. Russell doesn't advocate a return to religions of the past, "but to discover the sacred within us in the language and technologies of the twentieth century."<sup>234</sup> According to Russell, the root of our environmental crisis is an "inner spiritual aridity," and overcoming the crisis requires research in not only the physical and biological sciences, but also psychological and sacred sciences.<sup>235</sup>

---

<sup>228</sup> Tart, "Introduction."

<sup>229</sup> Ibid., 4-5.

<sup>230</sup> Ibid., x.

<sup>231</sup> Ibid., 4-5.

<sup>232</sup> Vaughan, "The Transpersonal Perspective," 37.

<sup>233</sup> Stanislav Grof and Christina Grof, "Transpersonal Experiences and the Global Crisis," in *Paths Beyond Ego: The Transpersonal Vision*, ed. Roger Walsh and Frances Vaughan (Los Angeles, CA: Jeremy P. Tarcher/Perigee Books, 1993), 252.

<sup>234</sup> Peter Russell, "An Inner Manhattan Project," in *Paths Beyond Ego: The Transpersonal Vision*, ed. Roger Walsh and Frances Vaughan (Los Angeles, CA: Jeremy P. Tarcher/Perigee Books, 1993), 253.

<sup>235</sup> Ibid.

Ken Wilber, however, disagrees with anyone who says that the only way the world's problems can be solved is by a transpersonal transformation and calls for revisiting existing historical research:

...A cogent theory of how marginal knowledge (such as that of the transpersonal) becomes normalized or conventionally accepted needs to be worked out and thoroughly checked by then rereading history using that model. Work in this area is virtually nonexistent, yet without it any claim to 'world transformation,' is simply more ideology.<sup>236</sup>

Roger Walsh and Frances Vaughan state that both our global ecological crisis and the transpersonal vision call us "to grow up and wake up."<sup>237</sup> According to Walsh and Vaughan, we've learned that our view of normal development has had a culturally determined limit, and for the first time in history we have a transpersonal vision of our possibilities. Whether or not one believes that a transpersonal perspective is needed for world transformation, Walsh and Vaughan say, this "adventure of consciousness" has awakened us to often untapped potential.<sup>238</sup> Boucouvalas believes this untapped potential is of great importance to adult education.<sup>239</sup>

### Transpersonal Psychology's Interface with Adult Education

From research in the field of transpersonal psychology, awareness of a mostly untapped human potential-- an ego-transcendence that stems from a deep inner wisdom, and that sees an interconnectedness and interdependence of all things-- has great importance for adult education. According to Boucouvalas, this untapped potential necessitates for educators, an expanded view of human capabilities and an ability to prepare scholars and practitioners with academic knowledge and integrated healthy transpersonal experience.<sup>240</sup> Healthy transpersonal experience vs. unhealthy is discussed in detail later on. For now, the reader should know that healthy transpersonal experience adheres to the Deweyan view that all learning is continuous, building on previous learning.

The root of the word educate, *educare*, means *to bring out*, to call forth the potential from an individual.<sup>241</sup> Boucouvalas notes that if we have been living in a very restricted circle of our potential being, then educators will need to learn ways of calling forth this larger potential for learning. "A transpersonal image of humankind extends the parameters of what is possible," explains Boucouvalas, "and furnishes new pinnacles for human growth and learning, a new outer limit for lifelong learning endeavors."<sup>242</sup> She believes the transpersonal movement fosters social

---

<sup>236</sup> Ken Wilber, "Paths Beyond Ego in the Coming Decades," in *Paths Beyond Ego: The Transpersonal Vision*, ed. Roger Walsh and Frances Vaughan (Los Angeles, CA: Jeremy P. Tarcher/Perigee Books, 1993), 262-63.

<sup>237</sup> Roger Walsh and Frances Vaughan, "The Adventure of Consciousness," in *Paths Beyond Ego: The Transpersonal Vision*, ed. Roger Walsh and Frances Vaughan (Los Angeles, CA: Jeremy P. Tarcher/Perigee Books, 1993), 267.

<sup>238</sup> *Ibid.*, 266.

<sup>239</sup> Boucouvalas, "Social Transformation."

<sup>240</sup> Boucouvalas, "An Analysis," 2.

<sup>241</sup> Skeat, *An Etymological Dictionary of the English Language*, 188.

<sup>242</sup> Boucouvalas, "Social Transformation," 9.

transformation, as does the lifelong learning movement and sees the two movements as intertwined.<sup>243</sup>

Not all adult educators see the lifelong learning movement actually fostering social transformation. Mechthild Hart says adult education today generally has a “one-dimensional identification with the needs of business and industry” that in many ways contributes to social and economic injustice. Productive education, according to Hart, should be one that is “based above all on an affirmation of life rather than an affirmation of ‘the bottom line’.”<sup>244</sup> Michael Welton says for over a decade and a half “voices from the margins” have accused the modern practice of adult education of abandoning its role in fostering democratic social action and ignoring the poor, oppressed, and disenfranchised in North American society.<sup>245</sup> Welton argues that adult education needs to change course from its current direction of “teaching our future practitioners quickly digested and easily formulated principles of program planning” and instead, “have as its normative mandate the preservation of the critically reflective lifeworld...and the extension of communicative action into systemic domains.”<sup>246</sup> An interface with transpersonal psychology would help education “foster the good life and the good society” as well as “produce the good human being.”<sup>247</sup>

Students interested in transpersonal psychology can now obtain masters and doctoral degrees in the field, but some professionals in academia and other professions have a cultural bias against the transpersonal and a “prejudice against the intuitive mode in scientific and academic circles,” Boucouvalas says.<sup>248</sup> According to the works of Felix Morrow and Ken Wilber, years of hegemonic empiric-analytic inquiry have resulted in suppression of non-sensory verifiable research.<sup>249</sup> The philosopher, William James (1842-1910), however, proposed a different view of empiricism that will be discussed below.

### Transpersonal Psychology’s Interface with Empirical Research

“James advocated ‘radical empiricism’ in which no meaningful source of evidence was to be ignored or discounted, and he viewed ‘reality’ as ‘anything which we find ourselves obliged to take into account in any way’.”<sup>250</sup> Morrow notes that James had written much on psychical research and had concluded there is “a continuum of cosmic consciousness against which our individuality builds but accidental fences and into which our several minds plunge, as into a mother-sea or reservoir.”<sup>251</sup> According to Morrow, James’s research in this field was subsequently suppressed by Ralph Barton Perry, the editor of a posthumous collection of James’s writings. Also uncovering works on consciousness by John Dewey that had been suppressed,

---

<sup>243</sup> Boucouvalas, "An Analysis.;" Boucouvalas, "Social Transformation," 6.

<sup>244</sup> Mechthild U. Hart, *Working and Educating for Life: Feminist and International Perspectives on Adult Education* (London: Routledge, 1992), 2, 6, 198.

<sup>245</sup> Welton, "The Critical Turn," 4.

<sup>246</sup> Ibid., 4-6.

<sup>247</sup> Institute of Transpersonal Psychology, "The William James Research Center," <<http://www.tmn.com/itp/details.html#Research>>, 12/26 1997.

<sup>248</sup> Boucouvalas, "An Analysis," 45.

<sup>249</sup> Felix Morrow, "William James and John Dewey on Consciousness: Suppressed Writings," *Journal of Humanistic Psychology* 24, no. 1 (Winter 1984): 69-79; Ken Wilber, *Eye to Eye: The Quest for the New Paradigm* (Boston: Shambhala Publications, 1990).

<sup>250</sup> Institute of Transpersonal Psychology, "The William James Research Center," 3.

<sup>251</sup> William James, *Memories and Studies* (NY: Longmans, 1912), 204; Morrow 1984: 70; James, *Memories and studies*, 204.

Morrow reflects that these actions are symptomatic of the disdain in the empiricist academic world for psychical research.<sup>252</sup>

Wilber believes empiricism's understanding of 'experience' has been too limited and explains, "Empiricism...rightly claims that all valid knowledge must be grounded in experience, but it then reduces the meaning of experience to *sensibilia*."<sup>253</sup> Experience, according to Wilber, also encompasses *intelligibia* in which we experience our own thoughts, ideals, and 'imaginative displays' with the mind's eye, and *transcendelia* in which we experience spirit with the eye of contemplation.<sup>254</sup> The three modes of knowing have different methods of data collection and verification, Wilber says, but "the *abstract principles* of data accumulation and verification are essentially *identical* in each."<sup>255</sup> Three strands of valid data accumulation exist, and each has a "potential disproof mechanism," continues Wilber.<sup>256</sup> The three strands of data collection are:

1. *Instrumental injunction*. This [strand] is always of the form, 'If you want to know this, *do* this.'
2. *Intuitive apprehension*. This [strand] is a cognitive grasp, prehension, or immediate *experience* of the object domain (or aspect of the object domain) addressed by the injunction; that is, the immediate *data* apprehension.
3. *Communal confirmation*. This [strand] is a checking of results (apprehensions or data) with others who have adequately completed the injunctive and apprehensive strands.<sup>257</sup>

Wilber further explains a hierarchy in which each of the three modes of knowing--sensory, mental, and spiritual--can access data within their own mode. The mental mode, however, with its words, symbols and concepts, can be used to "*point to, or represent, other* data from any other realm," adds Wilber.<sup>258</sup> He notes that this "mediate" or intermediate process explains or maps other data results in "*theoretical knowledge*." In Wilber's view, the problem is that spiritual data are "transconceptual, and thus they resist, even defy, conceptual, rational, theoretical mapping and codification."

The mind can adequately look at and map *sensibilia* because it transcends *sensibilia*; it can adequately look at and map *intelligibia* because that is its own backyard; but it cannot adequately look at or map spirit because spirit transcends it. And when spirit is described in mental terms, it is not in the nice, common sensical, down-to-earth categories of empiric-analytic thought or even in the subtler symbolic logic; it is the slippery, paradoxical, poetic terms of mandalic<sup>259</sup> reason. Understand that spiritual knowledge itself...is the most direct, clear-cut, impactful knowledge imaginable--it simply transcends conceptualization and therefore resists neat hypothetical categorizations and

---

<sup>252</sup> Morrow, "William James and John Dewey," 73.

<sup>253</sup> Wilber, *Eye to Eye*, 42.

<sup>254</sup> Ibid.

<sup>255</sup> Ibid., 44.

<sup>256</sup> Ibid.

<sup>257</sup> Ibid., 44-45.

<sup>258</sup> Ibid., 67.

<sup>259</sup> Mandalic refers to a mandala: a symbolic representation of the cosmos with the attributes of a deity. In Jungian psychology, a mandala is a symbol representing the effort to reunify the self. *The Random House Dictionary of the American Language*, Second Edition Unabridged (New York: Random House, 1987), 1167.

mental mappings.<sup>260</sup>

Elusiveness of conceptualization should not result in the discounting of transcendia, however, for, as Melvin Miller and Susanne Cook-Greuter aptly put it, "...how we conceptualize what is possible enhances and limits our individual and cultural development."<sup>261</sup>

### Healthy Transcendence Derived from Continuous Learning

Transcendence needs to be built upon a healthy, fully developed, stable ego. Psychotherapist, John Welwood, who is interested in the relationship between psychological work and spiritual work, recounts three traps into which one may fall, obstacles to growth and development.<sup>262</sup> The first he calls spiritual by-passing--using spiritual practice to avoid dealing with unresolved personal and emotional issues--"all the sticky, messy things that keep us rooted right here."<sup>263</sup> The second is narcissism, "getting so fascinated with our own personal process that we become trapped in the labyrinth of our own rich material."<sup>264</sup> The third trap, Welwood notes, is desensitizing ourselves to personal process and spiritual development because we'd rather not feel things too strongly, just get through life with as little effort as possible.<sup>265</sup> Welwood believes this desensitizing is probably the most common of all in our society.<sup>266</sup>

Perhaps this desensitizing, in our culture, results from being overwhelmed with the pressures of modern life and upward progress. We aim for higher salaries and higher achievements, but the journey of transcendence in which the common good becomes a natural outgrowth of an awareness of the interconnectedness of all things, according to Melvin Miller and Suzanne Cook-Greuter, is a "journey inward to deeper and more subtle levels of perception."<sup>267</sup>

Pinkerton spoke of this interconnectedness to a group of Maryknoll women religious: ...down deep, we religious are fully aware that we cannot look upon the world and its confusion and complexity as an entity apart from any of us. It is part of our psyche. Our inner lives and energies, even our brokenness and fragility flow into the world and at the same time, the energies of the world, both positive and negative flow into our psyches.

We need to embrace that conflicted world reality as part of our own redemption before we can move to becoming instruments of its resurrection, so fiercely that we shall be enlivened, knowing that the Cosmic Christ will be with us all days even to the end of time.

---

<sup>260</sup> Wilber, *Eye to Eye*, 70.

<sup>261</sup> Melvin E. Miller and Susanne R. Cook-Greuter, "Introduction," in *Transcendence and Mature Thought in Adulthood*, ed. Melvin E. Miller and Susanne R. Cook-Greuter (Lanham, Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 1994), xvi.

<sup>262</sup> John Welwood, "Principles of Inner Work: Psychological and Spiritual," *Journal of Transpersonal Psychology* 16, no. 1 (1984): 64.

<sup>263</sup> Ibid.

<sup>264</sup> Ibid.

<sup>265</sup> Welwood, "Principles of Inner Work: Psychological and Spiritual," 65.

<sup>266</sup> Ibid.

<sup>267</sup> Miller and Cook-Greuter, "Introduction," xxii.

Our faith in Christ's promise of resurrection cannot falter at this time in history. What we must avoid is giving into any sense of powerlessness or ennui because of the overwhelming nature of the reality in which we are called to be the Word.<sup>268</sup>

While Pinkerton was speaking to women religious, the message of interconnectedness she would address to all people.

Grof describes this interconnectedness as an expansion of identity. "In transpersonal experiences," Grof says, "the sense of one's identity can expand beyond the body image and encompass other people, groups of people, or all of humanity. It can transcend human boundaries and include animals, plants, or even inanimate objects and processes."<sup>269</sup> Inspired by the work of transpersonal psychology, Grof maintains, "We are approaching a phenomenal synthesis of the ancient and the modern and a far-reaching integration of the great achievements of the East and West that might have profound consequences for the life on this planet."<sup>270</sup>

### Interface of the Common Good, Transpersonal Psychology, and Catherine Pinkerton

Chapter Two has traced the evolution of thought regarding the common good and recalled from Chapter One contemporary literature's call for the recurring components of dialogue and action/participation in operationalizations of the common good. An historical study of Pinkerton's championship of the common good also reveals the same components throughout her life. This dialogue and action will be illuminated in Chapter Three. Transpersonal psychology's scholarly literature spoke of increased human potential – an ability to access an inner wisdom that broadens one's understanding of an ego-centered self to an intersubjective self. An intersubjective self is subject of self but able to see her role in relation to others, to creation, and to a higher force. One who understands self as intersubjective has a homonomous, ego-transcendent understanding of interconnectedness. Pinkerton's speeches reveal a spirituality in touch with the inner wisdom that allows ego to be subsumed into a perspective of connectedness rather than separateness. This sense of connectedness allowed an extraordinary commitment to the common good to develop in Pinkerton.

This chapter has traced in philosophic literature historical incarnations of the common good and looked for its dynamic qualities, three of which are dialogue, action or participation, and inclusivity. With more and more public calls for the common good and with Pinkerton's extraordinary commitment in mind, the researcher combed the literature of transpersonal psychology and learned that a deep, inner divine wisdom often reveals an interconnectedness and interdependence of all life that fuels such commitment. Awareness of this mostly untapped—in the field of adult education—source of wisdom, coupled with society's current need for a civil society based on an ethical concern for each other offers a threshold of opportunity for adult education. Adult education has the potential to aid in the fullest development of humankind's potential and help a world in need attention to the common good.

---

<sup>268</sup> Pinkerton, "Global Spirituality," 13.

<sup>269</sup> Grof, "East and West," 30.

<sup>270</sup> Grof, "East and West," 33.

## CHAPTER THREE

### DIALOGUE AND ACTION

Chapter Three first offers a general review of dialogue and interconnectedness. This review serves as a springboard to place Pinkerton's action into a scholarly context. Chapter Three then illuminates Pinkerton's sense of interconnectedness as reflected in her advocacy and practice of dialogue and action. Her life of commitment to the common good is rich with such examples.

#### **Dialogue and Interconnectedness**

Recall that dialogue surfaced throughout the review of scholarly literature as a necessary component for the common good to be operationalized. In ancient Greece, Plato used the dialogic method of dialectics. Dialectics, a process of questions and succinct answers, was much more than that, however. The final and highest education for philosopher-rulers was the study of dialectics. Irving Zeitlin notes that, for Plato, prior education pursued knowledge in separate subjects, and dialectics, the capstone, revealed the relations among the separate subjects.<sup>271</sup> From Plato's *Republic* we read:

Dialectics stands above mathematics. The latter trains students to ascend from objects of sense to objects of thought. Dialectics, however, is the means by which we attain the knowledge of the objects of thought themselves—the absolute of pure Forms and, ultimately, the final object of thought, the Form of the Good. The dialectician is one 'who is able to provide an account of the essence of each thing' (534B), and who is able to bring this account together with others to yield a comprehensive view of the nature of things (537C).<sup>272</sup>

According to John Randall, Jr., "Platonic dialectic is no method or theory of logic—it is the soul of discussion."<sup>273</sup>

Aristotle used the term civil communication. Michael Smith, writing of the common good in the Aristotelian tradition, said, "All common human undertakings presuppose civil communication."<sup>274</sup> Contemporary authors, also, cite the importance of dialogue. Novak referred to mutual cooperation<sup>275</sup> and Sherover to communal reasoning.<sup>276</sup> Others spoke of associating, civil discourse, telling, hearing and talking.<sup>277</sup>

Robert Grudin sees dialogue as a spiritual necessity; "our individual identity is validated by participation in social discourse."<sup>278</sup> According to Grudin, the genuine contact of dialogue requires an act of self-disclosure which, when received in the dialogic act of listening to discover, allows participants to see themselves as social beings moved from self-absorption to active participation in society. According to O.C. McSwite, the act of listening--opening up to

---

<sup>271</sup> Zeitlin, *Plato's Vision*, 114.

<sup>272</sup> Ibid.

<sup>273</sup> John Herman Randall, *Plato: Dramatist of the Life of Reason* (NY: Columbia University Press, 1970), 3.

<sup>274</sup> Smith, *Human Dignity and the Common Good*, 64-65.

<sup>275</sup> Novak, *Free Persons and the Common Good*.

<sup>276</sup> Sherover, *Time, Freedom and the Common Good*.

<sup>277</sup> Marty, *The One and the Many*; Robert Grudin, *On Dialogue* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1996); Daloz, Keen, et al., *Common Fire*.

<sup>278</sup> Grudin, *On Dialogue*, 128.

really receive the other--is another key element of dialogue. McSwite describes this way of relating as "becoming less reasonable and more real."<sup>279</sup> This self-disclosure or speaking from one's personal experience and listening to really receive the other has the potential to enlarge perspective. Grudin says, "Dialogue frees the mind from ritualized thought and enables the mind to discover its own potential for inventive solutions."<sup>280</sup>

The two acts of self-disclosure and listening to receive, the researcher believes, make dialogue different from discourse and discussion, two other widely used communicative terms. The etymology of the word discourse is *dis* (Latin) apart and *currere* (Latin) to run. Discussion derives from *dis* (Latin) apart and *percussio* (Latin) striking or shaking asunder.<sup>281</sup> Pinkerton, with her return-to-the-root proclivity in search for new perspectives, points out that *dia* (Greek) means between or across, and *logue* stems from *logo* meaning the word. To find the word between requires genuine contact.<sup>282</sup>

John Stewart describes the use of dialogue as moving from "rhetorical sensitivity" to a commitment "to speak and listen into being genuine contact, and even genuine community."<sup>283</sup> Rhetorical sensitivity is awareness of the best way in which to say something to convince the listeners to support your agenda. Anderson, et al., the editors of *The Reach of Dialogue*, define dialogue as "a dimension of communication quality that keeps communicators more focused on mutuality and relationship than on self-interest, more concerned with discovering than with disclosing, more interested in access than in domination."<sup>284</sup> This chapter is based on dialogue as defined by Anderson, et al. Dialogue brings into being the possibilities of each other and fresh perspectives that emerge both within each other and in the middle--the space between them.

### Dialogue and Action in Adult Education

Dialogue and action in adult education bring Paulo Freire to mind. Freire believed humans are naturally participative in the world, but they become passive through the experience of repressive power.<sup>285</sup> "Passivity and cultural immobility," according to Freire, "can only be overcome through experience,"<sup>286</sup> and this experience requires an active, dialogical, educational program.<sup>287</sup> Denis Goulet in his introduction to Freire's book defined the mark of a successful educator as "not skill in persuasion—which is but an insidious form of propaganda—but the ability to dialogue with educatees in a mode of reciprocity."<sup>288</sup> Reciprocity involves a search together. In a sense, dialogue is ego-transcendent. One doesn't defend a position; rather, one

---

<sup>279</sup> O. C. McSwite, *Legitimacy in Public Administration* (Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications, Inc., 1997), 277.

<sup>280</sup> Grudin, *On Dialogue*, cover.

<sup>281</sup> Skeat, *An Etymological Dictionary of the English Language*, 167, 172-73, 442.

<sup>282</sup> For more information on the understanding of dialogue, the interested reader is referred to the works of Martin Buber: *I and Thou* (1958), *Daniel: Dialogues on Realization* (1964), "Afterword: The History of the Dialogic Principle" in *Between Man and Man* (1965a), and *The Knowledge of Man: A Philosophy of the Interhuman* (1965b).

<sup>283</sup> John Stewart, "Forward," in *The Reach of Dialogue*, ed. Rob Anderson, Kenneth N. Cissna and Ronald C. Arnett (Cresskill, New Jersey: Hampton Press, Inc, 1994), viii.

<sup>284</sup> Rob Anderson, Kenneth N. Cissna and Ronald C. Arnett, "Introduction," in *The Reach of Dialogue*, ed. Rob Anderson, Kenneth N. Cissna and Ronald C. Arnett (Cresskill, New Jersey: Hampton Press, Inc., 1994), 1-5.

<sup>285</sup> Paulo Freire, *Education for Critical Consciousness* (New York: The Seabury Press, 1973), 5.

<sup>286</sup> Freire, *Education for Critical Consciousness*, 16.

<sup>287</sup> *Ibid.*, 19.

<sup>288</sup> *Ibid.*, xii.

joins with another in search for solutions. Goulet further explains that dialogue in education frees the educator to be educatee and allows the educatee to be educator; “both partners are liberated, as they begin to learn.”<sup>289</sup>

### **A Dialogue with the Past**

This historical study of the development and enactment of a commitment to the common good in a contemporary life is itself a dialogue: a dialogue with the past and with Pinkerton to enlarge perspective. While one can never fully realize the past, Grudin very picturesquely says, “...we can inhale it, savor its irreconcilable unlikeness, play with its alternative ways of being, sift through its soil carefully in search of our own roots. In so doing we can build from chronological diversity an awareness of change and continuity that can well equip us for the future.”<sup>290</sup>

Many of Pinkerton’s speeches recount dialogic events and actions, a fact that assigned importance to the process in Pinkerton’s mind. Pinkerton’s peers, chapter records, and secondary sources that trace the 20<sup>th</sup> century changes in U. S. communities of women religious relate the dialogic processes of religious life. Also, through dialogue with Pinkerton, the researcher became even more aware of the importance Pinkerton assigns to dialogue for the common good and of her penchant for action. This chapter will first illuminate the stories of a remembered childhood, stories that indicate the seeds of dialogue and action sown in Pinkerton’s life, and then look at the gestation and birth into action of those seeds throughout sixty years of religious life.

### **Dialogue and Action’s Genesis in Pinkerton’s Education**

This section covers the years 1921-1939 from Pinkerton’s birth in Cleveland, Ohio, on September 22 to graduation from high school immediately after which she entered the convent. Pinkerton, fifth generation American, was born into an upper middle class Catholic family whereas most Catholics in the United States at that time were working class at the lower income levels and thought of themselves as a minority in a land that was considered Protestant.<sup>291</sup> The feeling of exclusion as well as a firm belief in the church of their faith, Pinkerton says, to some degree prompted the institutionalization, impressive churches, schools, universities, social service agencies, and hospitals built by Catholics.<sup>292</sup>

This faith was quite dogmatic. Catholics were “to accept with docility a series of truths divinely guaranteed by the church...[and] few ever questioned these truths or penetrated the spirit of the Law....”<sup>293</sup> Pastors executed considerable influence and control over parishioners. As within any denomination, however, some members question rules and sometimes dissent. Pinkerton’s parents retained a deep faith but openly criticized certain practices of the church in the presence of their children and freely dialogued with them their reasons for nonconformity<sup>294</sup>.

Dialogue began early in Pinkerton’s life. Pinkerton’s parents thought children should know what was going on in the family and the work that mother and father did to make life the

---

<sup>289</sup> Ibid., ix.

<sup>290</sup> Grudin, *On Dialogue*, 136.

<sup>291</sup> Pinkerton, "NAWR: A Vision for the Future," 7.

<sup>292</sup> Ibid.

<sup>293</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "The Meaning of Renewal to the Teacher," 2-9-1 (Sister of Saint Joseph Mother House, Cleveland, OH, 1968), 2.

<sup>294</sup> Interview with Pinkerton on July 31, 1995 in Onset, Massachusetts.

way it was for them<sup>295</sup>. Pinkerton's parents' conversations with her both respected her as she was at the moment and respected the possibilities within her. She recalls with special fondness conversations as a young girl with her father on Sunday afternoons as they'd walk down to Lake Erie together. When she was fearful of storms on the lake, her father listened and explored with her the formation of storms. "He taught me all about how the forces moved in nature," Pinkerton said<sup>296</sup>. At other times, these dialogues concerned the interdependence of countries as her father explained that the cargo arriving from other countries was needed in Cleveland, and Cleveland, in turn, shipped steel needed for building in other countries. "My understanding of the Cleveland area, the industrial base of it, came from my father [on those walks]," Pinkerton said.<sup>297</sup>

Pinkerton's justice orientation also began at home even though her first encounter with concern for the common good was heartbreaking to the 8 or 9 year old youngster at the time. Her father's foundry supply business had been successful, and the Pinkertons were going to buy a house in the suburbs of Cleveland. The chosen house had a paneled library, which so impressed young Pinkerton that she urged her dad, "Let's just give them the money and move in."<sup>298</sup> It was not to be, however, for in 1929, the U. S. economy worsened, and two weeks after Pinkerton first saw the "new" house, her father took her and her two brothers aside to explain, as Pinkerton remembers, "that we weren't moving to that house because something terrible was going to happen in the country. We would be all right, but other people wouldn't be, and we had to be able to help. I didn't know why we had to be able to help; they should help themselves. I can remember that [incident], because I thought his decision was like shards of glass falling at my feet. I had so wanted to live in that house."<sup>299</sup> Pinkerton recalls that later she accompanied her father when, following the advice of business friends, he withdrew his money from the bank the day before the banks fell.<sup>300</sup> The Pinkertons struggled but were fortunate because between 1929-1932, forty-four percent of U. S. banks failed with many families losing everything. Pinkerton remembers well another advocate for the common good, Franklin D. Roosevelt (1882-1945) who as President (1933-1945) expanded greatly the role of the federal government with economic and social programs, called The New Deal, to counter the Great Depression. Pinkerton says, "In our house we'd sooner miss Mass on Sunday than miss one of Roosevelt's "Fireside Chats."<sup>301</sup>

A less personal and less painful lesson in just action came from Pinkerton's mother one Sunday morning at church. The pastor had instituted a Five- Dollar Club to encourage parishioners to give five dollars, a considerable sum at the time, in the weekly offering and published the names of those contributors in the Sunday bulletin. The Pinkerton family was in the pew early one Sunday when Pinkerton noticed that her mother was missing. As Mass began, her mother slipped back into the pew but offered no explanation. At the conclusion of the Mass, the pastor announced that the names of five-dollar donors would no longer be published, as a lady in the parish had brought to his attention the elitism and resultant divisiveness of the practice. Pinkerton and her dad exchanged knowing smiles as they realized who "the lady" was. Pinkerton's mother had told the pastor if he ever published their names again, he had seen their

---

<sup>295</sup> April 14, 1990 interview of Pinkerton by Sister Jackie Bidden in Cleveland, Ohio

<sup>296</sup> Interview with Pinkerton on July 31, 1995 in Onset, Massachusetts.

<sup>297</sup> April 14, 1990 interview of Pinkerton by Sister Jackie Bidden in Cleveland, Ohio

<sup>298</sup> Interview with Pinkerton on July 31, 1995 in Onset, Massachusetts.

<sup>299</sup> Interview with Pinkerton on July 31, 1995 in Onset, Massachusetts.

<sup>300</sup> Ibid.

<sup>301</sup> Ibid.

last five-dollar contribution.<sup>302</sup> These actions of Pinkerton's parents were lessons in the importance of the common good, but they also set an example of being self-directed in the meaning-making of life's experiences. Fear wasn't to be denied; fear was felt, expressed and rendered powerless through dialogue. Misfortune and injustice called for compassion and commitment to action.

Pinkerton also says her parents were good role models for a working, loving relationship of mutual respect that valued equally with man the contributions of woman. Pinkerton recalls that her mother had "an excellent business sense," which her father trusted. They made decisions together.<sup>303</sup> Hence, Pinkerton grew up not doubting her right as a woman to participate in meaningful decisions and actions.

Lawrence A. Cremin notes the importance of these lessons learned early in life within the family. Cremin writes, "The family is the institution in which children have their earliest education, their earliest experience in the learning of languages, the nurturance of cognitive, emotional, and motor competencies, the maintenance of interpersonal relationships, the internalization of values, and the assignment of meaning to the world."<sup>304</sup> Furthermore, continues Cremin, citing the work of his colleague, Hope Jensen Leichter: "The family is the institution within which children first develop their educative styles--their characteristic ways of engaging in moving through and combining educative experiences over the lifespan."<sup>305</sup> Lagemann's educational biography of Grace Hoadley Dodge (1856-1914) notes that "one learns who one is through reflected images. Especially during childhood, one's sense of self is largely derived from the reactions one elicits in those to whom one is most closely attached."<sup>306</sup> The reactions Pinkerton received from her parents would have given her a sense of being valued as a thinking person. Her father's weekly walks and talks with her reflected an interesting person with whom one enjoyed sharing life.

Pinkerton's early education at St. Ignatius Elementary School staffed by the Sisters of St. Joseph built on these earlier experiences. "I had a wonderful education," Pinkerton said. It was a lab school in which teachers were trained in all the latest techniques of teaching.<sup>307</sup> Pinkerton remembered that her education was called the Winnetka Plan. The architect of the educational system that later became known as the Winnetka Plan was Carleton Washburne.<sup>308</sup> Actually, Washburne believed it was more than a plan. He declared that "...instead of a *plan* there was a *spirit*, a way of thinking, a way of living within the faculty."<sup>309</sup> Washburne described the Winnetka Plan as a confluence in 1919 of three streams of educational innovation: (a) that of individualized instruction in math developed by Mary Ward at San Francisco Normal School in 1912, (b) Washburne's own early teaching experience of a "special class" in Tulare, California, during which he became "acutely aware of the inefficiency and harmfulness--even cruelty--of trying to force widely differing children into the same mold", and (3) the desire of parents in

---

<sup>302</sup> Interview with Pinkerton on July 31, 1995 in Onset, Massachusetts.

<sup>303</sup> Ibid.

<sup>304</sup> Lawrence A. Cremin, *Popular Education and Its Discontents* (New York: Harper and Row, 1989), 53.

<sup>305</sup> Cremin, *Popular Education and Its Discontents*, 53; Hope Jensen Leichter, "Some Perspectives on the Family as Educator," in *The Family as Educator*, ed. Hope Jensen Leichter (New York: Teachers College Press, 1974), 1-43; Hope Jensen Leichter, "The Concept of Educative Style," *Teachers College Record* 75(Dec. 1974b): 239-50.

<sup>306</sup> Lagemann, *A Generation of Women*, 13.

<sup>307</sup> Conversation with Pinkerton on February 4, 1996, at home of researcher in Falls Church, VA

<sup>308</sup> Carleton W. Washburne and Jr. Marland, Sidney P., *Winnetka: The History and Significance of an Educational Experiment* (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1963), v.

<sup>309</sup> Ibid., 196.

Winnetka, Illinois, to establish a school of which they could be proud for their children.<sup>310</sup> These three streams had their origins in the work of earlier educators,<sup>311</sup> John Dewey being the best known and the one with whom Pinkerton associates her education.

Dewey believed that “all education proceeds by the participation of the individual in the social consciousness of the race:”

I believe that the only true education comes through the stimulations in which he finds himself. Through these demands he is stimulated to act as a member of a unity, to emerge from his original narrowness of action and feeling, and to conceive of himself from the standpoint of the welfare of the group to which he belongs. To prepare [a child] for the future life means to give him command of himself; it means so to train him that he will have the full and ready use of all his capacities; that his eye and ear and hand may be tools ready to command, that his judgment may be capable of grasping the conditions under which it has to work, and the executive forces be trained to act economically and efficiently.<sup>312</sup>

The Winnetka Plan, built on this philosophy, was a spirit of experimentation, individualizing for half of the morning and afternoon sessions the instruction of knowledge and skills, which everyone needed to master. Students learned at their own rate and reinforced the content with sessions spent in group and creative activities. The curriculum emphasized social learning and attitudes and stressed good mental health practices, self-instruction and responsibility.<sup>313</sup>

St. Ignatius School structured the school day a bit differently, but retained the essential elements of the Winnetka Plan. Pinkerton recalls the group activities and choices students were permitted to make regarding their activities and the welfare of the group that each felt. When a student mastered a skill or required knowledge, before continuing to another level, he or she then helped another child master the lessons.<sup>314</sup> Thus Pinkerton’s early schooling was active, experiential, respectful of students’ potential, and built on the lessons of commitment to the welfare of others already begun at home.

Pinkerton’s secondary school experience was also unique and creative. Whatever period of history the students were studying, they learned the mythology, music, art, science, inventions, and great thinkers of the period. Students had to know “what went on in every section of the world at the same time.”<sup>315</sup> It was an integrated, participatory, interdisciplinary education not learned in passive receipt of another’s knowledge. In fact, the tests were “the east bulletin board” which the students designed together to display all of those aspects of culture.

During Pinkerton’s high school years at St. Joseph Academy, a Catholic priest, supportive of the Catholic Worker Movement founded in 1933 by social activist, Dorothy Day (1897-1980) and Peter Maurin (1877-1949), asked several students for assistance in renovating an old house in Cleveland for use as one of the Movement’s hospitality houses for the homeless

---

<sup>310</sup> Ibid., 3-19.

<sup>311</sup> Ibid., 157.

<sup>312</sup> John Dewey, "My Pedagogic Creed," *The School Journal* LIV, no. 3 (January 16 1897): 7780; Martin S. Dworkin, *Dewey on Education: Selections*, Classics in Education, vol. 3 (NY: Teachers' College, Columbia University, 1959), 19-22.

<sup>313</sup> Washburne and Marland, *Winnetka*, 199.

<sup>314</sup> September 27, 1998 conversation with Pinkerton on automobile trip to Cleveland, Ohio.

<sup>315</sup> Conversation with Pinkerton on February 4, 1996, at home of researcher in Falls Church, VA

and hungry. Pinkerton volunteered along with others, cleaned and painted, and eventually helped cook and serve meals to the residents. In the process, she met Day, who, Pinkerton remembers, was searching for venues to promote the Catholic Worker Movement. Pinkerton volunteered her high school auditorium and even set with Day the date of the talk. Excited about her coup, Pinkerton told the principal and received a tongue-lashing that left her stunned. "Who did I think I was? The principal of the school?" the principal asked Pinkerton.<sup>316</sup> Pinkerton since childhood had made decisions and taken action when action was necessary. Youthful enthusiasm and practiced behavior, even with the best intentions, proved to be a volatile combination, however, as the principal perceived a complete disregard of protocol. After the principal's temper abated, she accepted Pinkerton's apology. Pinkerton's mother, meanwhile, didn't wait for the moment of reconciliation and chided the principal for destroying initiative in a student rather than praising it. Dorothy Day's talk was allowed to take place as scheduled, and the principal asked Pinkerton to introduce Ms. Day--which she did "wearing a beautiful fuchsia suit my mother had bought me just for the occasion," Pinkerton said with a smile.<sup>317</sup>

An excellent student, Pinkerton in her senior year won a scholarship to St. Mary's College at Notre Dame University but advised her parents she was considering entering the convent rather than accepting the scholarship. Pinkerton's parents clarified their preference for education, but entrusted the decision to Pinkerton. Disappointed when she chose the convent and probably sure the choice was wrong, her parents, nonetheless, steadfastly adhered to their belief in her right to decide. Pinkerton's paternal grandmother, however, disowned her when she chose the convent.<sup>318</sup>

In summary, Pinkerton saw herself, in reflection of her parents' response to her, as an interesting, intelligent, valued person. She began to develop an educative style of engaging in dialogic, active, participative learning that was reinforced throughout her formal schooling.

### **Dialogue and Action's Development in a Life of Commitment**

Pinkerton remembers the day well when her parents took her to enter the convent. Pinkerton's mother said to her, "Your trunk your father is carrying might as well be your coffin to him."<sup>319</sup> From an upstairs window, Pinkerton tearfully watched her parents drive away and then began what Pinkerton called "the dark night of the soul."<sup>320</sup> This independent young woman reared at home and educated in school to be responsibly self-directed would no longer be permitted to make even simple decisions or choices. "The sanctity or laxity of the person was determined by her fidelity to rule, to order, to observance. Structures were experientially more important than persons," Pinkerton recalls.<sup>321</sup> Quick to put into context and balance the picture, Pinkerton added:

This is not to undermine the sanctity of the persons who lived their [entire] lives within those structures, persons who in ministering to the needs of the people of God, created

---

<sup>316</sup> Ibid.

<sup>317</sup> Conversation with Pinkerton on February 4, 1996, at home of researcher in Falls Church, VA

<sup>318</sup> Ibid.

<sup>319</sup> September 27, 1998 conversation with Pinkerton on automobile trip to Cleveland, Ohio.

<sup>320</sup> The phrase "dark night of the soul" refers to the poem of that title written by Saint John of the Cross (1542-1591), a Spanish mystic and poet. The dark night of the soul is a time of purification of the soul--a time often accompanied by feelings of absolute aloneness and despair when nothing makes sense. The mystic, St. John of the Cross, described this period as a necessary step on the spiritual journey to a mystical union with God.

<sup>321</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Prayer and New Ministry," Formation Conference (Dubuque, Iowa, 1976), 6.

and nurtured the vast complex of institutions and services which have made such a monumental contribution to the service of the church. Because they had entered religious life at the period of its stabilization, they were nurtured by these structures, valid as they seemed for that historical moment and monastic as they were in origin.<sup>322</sup>

Obedience, not dialogue, was the order of life. Pinkerton experienced great lows as a novice<sup>323</sup> and in later theological reflection, metaphorically described this period as a long road back--in contrast to the road ahead on which she used to walk with her father to Lake Erie. Pinkerton almost left the convent several times, knowing that she would always be welcomed at home, but "something," as Pinkerton says, tugged at her to stay.<sup>324</sup>

Pinkerton also credits her remaining in the convent during that bleak period to the wisdom of the head of the religious community at the time, Mother Margaret Mary, who would calmly reassure Pinkerton that religious life was going to change soon. Mother Margaret Mary taught Pinkerton in high school and was instrumental in her decision to enter the convent. Pinkerton remembers Margaret Mary as "an awesome person" who loved Francis Thompson's *The Hound of Heaven* and read the story to the students as a basis of vocation.<sup>325</sup> Pinkerton stayed, made her final vows of commitment, graduated from Saint John's College in Cleveland and began teaching in Catholic schools during World War II.

### **An Era of Change Ushered in by Dialogic Planning of A Holistic Education**

Pinkerton doesn't remember daily life being much affected by World War II (1939-1945); however, the passage at war's end of the Servicemen's Readjustment Act, popularly known as the G. I. Bill, had great import for U. S. Catholics, according to Pinkerton. The education assistance provided by the bill enabled Catholics, she said, "to mirror the class composition and diversity of American society in general."<sup>326</sup> A ripple effect of this legislation prompted accreditation standards for schools and teachers, especially vocational schools, to ensure that the soldiers were indeed gaining an education. Soon, the quality control means spread to the public schools with licensing requirements for public school teachers. Catholic schools would need to be accredited in order to attract students, which in turn meant college degrees for Catholic women religious teachers before classroom assignment.

Remember from Chapter One that the sisters' education was called "the twenty year plan" because the education took that long to complete in summer schools. Realizing that change was necessary and taking charge of the planning process, the sisters founded The Sister Formation Conference (SFC) in 1952 to ensure a holistic education for women religious.

Pinkerton says the inter-community planning of the SFC and the increased communication attributable to a meeting of all Major Superiors of religious communities called by Pope Pius XII, in which sisters were urged to work together to become agents of change in the world, issued in an era of dialogue and participation that changed forever the structures of religious communities and the lives of its members.<sup>327</sup> The dialogue between religious communities, which before had little or no communication with each other, began a collaborative

---

<sup>322</sup> Pinkerton, "Prayer and New Ministry," 6.

<sup>323</sup> A novice is a new sister. The novitiate is a period of learning before taking final vows.

<sup>324</sup> Conversation with Pinkerton on February 4, 1996, at home of researcher in Falls Church, VA

<sup>325</sup> April 14, 1990 interview of Pinkerton by Sister Jackie Bidden in Cleveland, Ohio

<sup>326</sup> Pinkerton, "NAWR: A Vision for the Future," 7.

<sup>327</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Organizing for a New World," *New Catholic World* 218, no. 1305 (May 1975c): 142.

process and strengthened inter-community relationships. Pinkerton said, “There developed an openness to persons and a solidarity further strengthened by mutual sharing, probing, questioning.”<sup>328</sup>

Nonetheless, it was a time of great tension and stress as old traditions and customs coexisted with new theology and new ways of living as women religious. Sister Margaret Mary, who began another term as President of the community just prior to Vatican II, read all the documents preparatory to that council and saw to it that all members of the community became familiar with them. Pinkerton credits Margaret Mary’s early insistence on the community’s in-depth exposure to Vatican II theology as the main reason the community came to be on the cutting-edge of change.<sup>329</sup> An example of the conflict of old ways and new at the time, however, is evident in the story Pinkerton tells of her assignment as Director of Formation of the newly professed. Mother Margaret Mary told Pinkerton she was to be Director of Formation and to remember, “You are preparing these young women for a church and a community that doesn’t exist yet.”<sup>330</sup> A visionary of change in some ways, Mother Margaret Mary still operated in traditional ways, for when Pinkerton claimed an inability to perform the job Margaret Mary responded, “I didn’t ask you if you could; I told you you’re doing it.”<sup>331</sup> The move to dialogue had begun, but it would take many more years to achieve full acceptance in practice.

### **Dialogue and Action Through Times of Upheaval**

The watchword of Vatican II (1962-1965) was dialogue, and the most important result of that dialogue, according to Pinkerton, was the new perspective of the church as inserted into the modern world rather than apart from it.<sup>332</sup> “The vision of the Church was widened to embrace positively the whole world and to answer its needs. God comes to every generation in terms of its needs,” Pinkerton insists.<sup>333</sup>

The decade of the ‘60s had many needs. A time of social upheaval, the ‘60s saw rebellious youth whom Pinkerton saw as desirous of real dialogue—not rules and regulations which they were expected to obey without question:

The dialogue of youth is, ‘...What have you, Christian, to tell me about life and how it is to be lived? Are you really in contact with the crucial problems of my world? Who is this Christ of whom you speak, and what has He to do with the contemporary scene?’<sup>334</sup>

Pinkerton urged teachers to enter into dialogue with the youth, to start where the students were and search for answers together. To start where the students were gave a respect to the youngsters—an acknowledgement of their ability and right to engage in critical thinking. Pinkerton said the teachers should recognize students as sources of wisdom, limited perhaps, but containing a valid part of humankind’s search for understanding. Dialogue with students in a search together for answers required a belief in the process and courage to change previously

---

<sup>328</sup> Pinkerton, "Organizing for a New World," 142.

<sup>329</sup> April 14, 1990 interview of Pinkerton by Sister Jackie Bidden in Cleveland, Ohio.

<sup>330</sup> Ibid.

<sup>331</sup> Ibid.

<sup>332</sup> April 14, 1990 interview of Pinkerton by Sister Jackie Bidden in Cleveland, Ohio

<sup>333</sup> Pinkerton, "The Meaning of Renewal to the Teacher."

<sup>334</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "A Picture of the Contemporary Situation," 2-9-1 (Sisters of Saint Joseph Mother House, Cleveland, OH, 1969a), 3.

entrenched attitudes regarding authority. The belief in the process and the necessary courage to change possibly arose from the experience of the women religious in their own communities.

The 1960s and '70s for women religious was a period of searching for answers together. Pinkerton says Vatican Council II asked the sisters to return to the spirit of their founder, "to recapture the original myth or ideal which inspired the foundation and to seek its contemporary expression."<sup>335</sup> The original charism was reconciliation, but to know its contemporary expression necessitated hours and hours of dialogue in theological reflection and among themselves. Each new "truth" arrived at through dialogue brought forth more questions that necessitated more dialogue. Questions of suitability of habit or regular street dress for the contemporary expression of reconciliation, relationships of superior/subject or of equal participants engaged in discernment together, the direction of the community, and individual ministry discernment challenged members. Margaret Ann Leonard described this process as a journey into the world—a journey that required of the sisters:

a faith like that of Abraham: going far from a homeland we knew well, a religious subculture oriented to an other-worldly transcendence, reinforced and kept in place by an American culture which tolerated well religion celebrated in a private sphere. We went forth without knowing where we were going, guided by a Church sifting its own self-awareness in relation to the world, in relation to salvation, in relation to the Kingdom. All of these new awarenesses began to be appropriated by us, perhaps in unique ways. A People of God Church, the Universal Sacrament of Salvation, created enormous changes in our sense of ourselves in mission and ministry.<sup>336</sup>

Such dialogue was not without pain and controversy, for in the process participants sometimes discovered "THEIR truth" did not emerge as "THE truth." Through the pain of opening firmly held, often ritualized viewpoints to critical reflection through dialogue, the sisters discovered their own potential for inventive solutions. Eventually a social self-knowledge awoke of what Grudin calls, the "things that matter: oppression, suffering, sympathy, love, pain" in the world.<sup>337</sup> As assumptions underlying beliefs and previous behavior surfaced for examination, many seemed no longer justifiable in the constraints they placed on the sisters' understanding of the world. "The frame of reference changed from the previous values of structure and order to those of person, freedom, responsibility, dialogue, friendship, participation in the life and direction of community," Pinkerton wrote. "The new emphasis became the person, the importance of human development, and the relation of the person to community. The individual was called to responsibility for choice in ministry and lifestyle."<sup>338</sup>

The critical reflection of this period fostered transformative learning, a process that, according to Jack Mezirow and associates, results in "the reformulation of a meaning perspective to allow a more inclusive, discriminating, and integrative understanding of one's experience."<sup>339</sup> Once the women experienced the social knowledge of self in community, the church, and the larger society, they seemed corporately to become increasingly aware of oppression, suffering,

---

<sup>335</sup> Pinkerton, "Prayer and New Ministry," 6.

<sup>336</sup> Margaret Ann Leonard, "Reality of United States Women Religious Past and Present," National Assembly of the Leadership Conference of Women Religious (Kansas City, Missouri, 27/August, 1984), 3.

<sup>337</sup> Grudin, *On Dialogue*, 152.

<sup>338</sup> Pinkerton, "Prayer and New Ministry," 7.

<sup>339</sup> Jack and Associates Mezirow, *Fostering Critical Reflection in Adulthood* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 1991), xvi.

and injustice in the world. According to Pinkerton, their own “journey into the transformation of authority-obedience structures” resulted in a self-determination and increased free, responsible participation that enabled them to “listen more intently to those under the power of others.”<sup>340</sup> Not every woman religious or every community experienced the same perspective transformation at the same time or even to the same degree, but the ongoing dialogic process continues to foster freedom from ritualized thought, trust in one another, and a willingness to search together for inventive solutions. Some communities of women religious moved more quickly than others into new perspectives. The Congregation of Saint Joseph, Pinkerton says was on the cutting edge of change.<sup>341</sup>

The evaluation of their communities and the awakened social knowledge of self in community led to a further study of the relationship of the women and their communities to the local church, which Pinkerton wrote, “often gave little indication that a Council [Vatican II] had taken place.”<sup>342</sup> In contrast, Pinkerton noted, women religious “had by reason of the Sisters Formation Movement of the ‘50s become well-prepared ecclesially, theologically, educationally, professionally for the call of the Council” and found themselves in the position of nurturing the U. S. Church toward the movement of Vatican II.<sup>343</sup>

Pinkerton’s speeches clearly indicate that women religious expected to enter into a dialogic process with priests, bishops, senates, and laity to facilitate collaborative ministry.<sup>344</sup> This dialogic relationship meant inclusion in the decision-making process of the Church. Unfortunately, Pinkerton wrote, they often found themselves mistrusted by the clergy and less respected by many segments of the church: “They were prepared to serve a church which did not exist and, in some cases, was not in the process of becoming.”<sup>345</sup>

A source of hope for some women religious was the formation of inter-community groups, according to Pinkerton. The first of these groups were Sister Councils or Sister Senates, but soon so many organizations emerged that “diffusion and duplication of efforts was a danger,” reported Pinkerton.<sup>346</sup> Groups specified different justice agendas, and Network, where Pinkerton currently works as a lobbyist, was founded to address in Congress the legislative aspects of the justice agenda. Sisters Uniting formed to be a channel of communication among the groups. The National Assembly of Women Religious (NAWR) focused on the utilization of its corporate power in a ministry for justice.<sup>347</sup> Pinkerton was President of NAWR 1973-1975 and in her last term, addressed NAWR members in a speech later printed in the journal *Brothers’ Newsletter*:

Our life choice calls us to develop in concert with others a vision of a world of justice and peace in all its global ramification. It further calls us to critique the institutions of which we are a part against this vision of global justice, to decide what we as individuals, what NAWR as a grassroots group can do to make that vision reality. We need to know how to go about the business of systemic change, how to league with others also painfully

---

<sup>340</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Address to Religion Education Conference," Religion Education Congress (Providence, RI, 15/March, 1986), 5.

<sup>341</sup> September 27, 1998 conversation with Pinkerton on automobile trip to Cleveland, Ohio.

<sup>342</sup> Pinkerton, "Organizing for a New World," 142.

<sup>343</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "A Sister Views the Church of the '70s," Ecumenical Meeting-Avon, 2-9-1 (Sisters of Saint Joseph Mother House, Cleveland, OH, 1968-9), 1.

<sup>344</sup> Pinkerton, "Organizing for a New World."

<sup>345</sup> Pinkerton, "NAWR: A Vision for the Future," 142.

<sup>346</sup> Pinkerton, "Organizing for a New World," 142.

<sup>347</sup> Ibid.; Catherine Pinkerton, "Vision for the Future," *Brothers’ Newsletter* 17, no. No. 3 (Fall 1975d): 33.

aware of the present global disorders. I believe this is our Gospel mandate at the moment..<sup>348</sup>

### **Dialogue Leads to Awareness of Institutionalized Values**

In the dialogue of theological reflection, Pinkerton became aware of her own complicity in what she called “a success-oriented value system rather than a Gospel-oriented value system.”<sup>349</sup> Pinkerton realized that when she was Principal of St. Joseph’s Academy, her encouragement of youngsters “to get good SAT scores, to seek admission into fine universities, to pursue highly remunerative, prestigious positions and careers” had stemmed from a desire to have the most successful graduates rather than “to better bring the impact of the Gospel values of peace and justice to bear on societal structures.”<sup>350</sup>

Pinkerton’s realization of her own complicity in a success oriented value system stemmed from many hours in dialogue in which the sisters centered on: What are our values? Does our lifestyle give credibility to our ministry? Is our lifestyle speaking to the Gospel message of justice and freedom, or are we, too enslaved by the institutionalization of values? Pinkerton explained this institutionalization of values to the NAWR members:

U. S. Society today is one committed to the institutionalization of values, one which is based on consumerism, identifying success with the gross national product. An individual is respected not so much for his/her gifts of person and expertise, but rather for the needs he/she is wealthy enough to purchase or for how many new needs or service he/she can demand. Our dependence upon nature and the individuals has been replaced by our dependence upon institutions.<sup>351</sup>

Pinkerton believes that a country that lives such institutionalization may be the most developed nation in one sense, but the least developed in a “real sense.” She recalled a theologian at the 1974 Inter-American Conference on Religious Life held in Bogota who decried the use of the terms ‘developing, developed, under-developed’ in describing Latin-American and North American relationships. Pinkerton cited the theologian whose name she could not recall: ‘We are developed in the values of person, family, leisure, reflection, which you in the North have sacrificed in large part for the values of technology, industrialization’.<sup>352</sup>

A moment of reflection on the continuity of education in which all learning is built on previous learning is appropriate at this point. Women religious had passed from a concern for structure to a concern for community. The concern for community passed from an inward focus on self to an outward concern for systemic change in institutions and organizations that exclude others from dialogue. This experiential, participatory learning evoked a new maturity and sense of identity that allowed the sisters to confront the institutional church’s authoritative, non-dialogic actions.

---

<sup>348</sup> Pinkerton, "Vision for the Future," 34.

<sup>349</sup> Ibid., 35.

<sup>350</sup> Ibid.

<sup>351</sup> Pinkerton, "Vision for the Future," 36.

<sup>352</sup> Ibid.

## Solidarity in a Dialogic Kin-dom

When the Vatican Sacred Congregation for Religious and Secular Institutes (SCRIS) imposed a deadline for religious communities to send revised constitutions in for approval, women religious were assertive in response. Sister Theresa Kane, RSM, in a 1980 presidential address to NAWR, later reprinted in a 1981 issue of *Probe*, NAWR's official publication, questioned, "Are the systems of the institutional church such that a close scrutiny of details affecting women's congregations might be another example of paternalism?"<sup>353</sup> Kane suggested that the women religious might develop their own review panel: "Canonical approval of constitutions might neither be requested nor even granted; an ongoing dialogic posture between the religious community and the SCRIS structure would reflect a new relationship of maturity, mutuality, and equality between that structure and the religious communities."<sup>354</sup>

Dialogue had brought these women to a new vision of the kin[g]dom of God. The omitted "g" in the word kingdom is something both lay women and women religious in the church increasingly do to show that God really wants kin-dom, a world of brothers and sisters, rather than kingdom with one in power over others. Pinkerton saw the trinitarian image of God as a community of persons in dialogue.<sup>355</sup>

The building blocks of the kin-dom are dialogic steps. Pinkerton says kin-dom begins with "recognition and affirmation of one's own history, real knowledge of where we have come from and in what direction we are going" and communicating with others "who we are at each stage of life."<sup>356</sup> Pinkerton believes we cannot affirm ourselves or embrace life alone. We need others in a friendship that "implies mutual exposure of all that we are and can be to one another and acceptance" and a wrestling with questions together.<sup>357</sup> Sister Amata Miller, IHM, who worked with Pinkerton at Network, echoed the importance of dialogue in a 1992 speech to the Sisters of Charity in Leavenworth, Kansas:

[Your local house and community gathering places should be places] where each is encouraged to speak, each is respectfully heard, and each is willing to be changed. [And we need to] learn to think in win-win rather than in win-lose terms, to use our imaginations and creativity to form new options in situations where there is potential for conflict.<sup>358</sup>

Pinkerton's and Miller's encouragement to sisters reveals self-disclosure received in the act of listening, a focus on mutuality and relationship, and a desire for fresh perspectives--all qualities of dialogue cited in this chapter. The almost five decades of dialogue have brought many new perspectives. In a 1986 talk, Pinkerton identified some of the changes in vision:

We had the courage to face our own exclusivity, our cultural apartness; to risk our identity and position within the Church and society; we have relinquished and assumed

---

<sup>353</sup> Theresa Kane, "Dialogue: Constitutions of Women Religious," Presidential address, Leadership Conference of Women Religious (Philadelphia, PA, August, 1980); Theresa Kane, "Dialogue: Constitutions of Women Religious," *Probe* X, no. 4 (March/April 1981): 1.

<sup>354</sup> Kane, "Dialogue.;" Kane, "Dialogue," 1.

<sup>355</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Ministry and Spirituality" (place not given, unknown date, 1981e), 9.

<sup>356</sup> Pinkerton, "Prayer and New Ministry," 10.

<sup>357</sup> Ibid., 15.

<sup>358</sup> Amata IHM Miller, "Expanding Our Horizons," Sisters of Charity (Leavenworth, Kansas, June 13, 1992), 14.

different responsibilities; we have changed our concept of consecration as apart from to immersion. We witness a diversity of ministries bringing us into spheres we never before imagined. We are more in touch with the Gospel as the core of our lives, but we have only just begun.<sup>359</sup>

Pinkerton sees this Gospel core of life as dialogic and participatory by nature with freedom to learn and change. On a copy of a speech given by Margaret Wheatley and Myron Kellner-Rogers entitled "Bringing Life to Organizational Change," Pinkerton underlined, "If we remain curious about what someone else sees, and refrain from convincing them of our interpretation, we develop a richer view of what might be going on."<sup>360</sup> Pinkerton also noted agreement with Wheatley's and Kellner-Rogers' assertion that "participation is not a choice." When people "are engaged in figuring out the future, while they are engaged in the difficult and messy processes of participation, ...they are simultaneously creating the conditions-new relationships, new insights, greater levels of commitment-that facilitate more rapid and complete implementation."<sup>361</sup>

Pinkerton educates others, as citizens of a democracy, to participate in dialogic awareness of the common good in the United States and the world and to know the creative power each person brings to the dialogue. In 1998, Pinkerton urged Maryknoll Sisters to probe through dialogue such questions as: "How is each country and its people whom you serve presently situated in the global scale of things? How do they reflect international, global trends? What international bodies or corporations or movements are affecting them and how? What needs to be done? To what vision of this world reality are we being called and what are the obstacles to the preaching of the Word globally? What are the forces at work at this moment which devalue the environment, human dignity, militate against healthy communities in the name of power, greed and competition? What are the causes of the great disparities between wealth and poverty? Who are those persons, groups, dynamics which divide races, ethnicities, religions? What multilateral institutions or corporations are affecting the lives and cultures of the people among who we minister?"<sup>362</sup> Lest the Maryknoll Sisters stop at the point of inquiries, then Pinkerton reminded them, "There can be no authentic contemplation which does not flow into action toward transformation."<sup>363</sup>

## Conclusion

As we saw in this chapter, Pinkerton's life resonates with dialogue and action. At home, she learned through the social conversation and constitution of the family. Early schooling included cooperation, action, interchange of ideas, and social responsibility. Dialogue enabled women religious in the United States to determine the elements of a holistic education, collaborate, plan and execute the education in the face of some pastors' objections. Dialogue carried the sisters through the tumultuous '60s and '70s, in which they exchanged medieval, floor-sweeping black habits for colorful secular dress, progressed from a hierarchical

---

<sup>359</sup> Pinkerton, "Address to Religion Education Conference," 6.

<sup>360</sup> Margaret Wheatley and Myron Kellner-Rogers, "Bringing Life to Organizational Change" (1998), 7. Note on speech said paper was to be published in the *Journal of Strategic Performance*; however, no journal by that title could be found. The researcher did find an article by the authors in the journal *Futurist*.

<sup>361</sup> Wheatley and Kellner-Rogers, "Bringing Life to Organizational Change," 5.

<sup>362</sup> Pinkerton, "Global Spirituality," 18-19.

<sup>363</sup> *Ibid.*, 19.

authoritative structure to collaborative government, and went from the one ministry of teaching to multiple ministries—including Pinkerton’s current political ministry. Dialogue freed the educators to be educatees and fresh perspectives emerged.

Dialogue and change continued in religious life with the emergence of the humanistic psychology movement. Other social movements also influenced the structure of religious life and the development of individual women religious. Chapter Four includes these movements as educationally significant in the development of Pinkerton’s perspective of the common good.

## CHAPTER FOUR

### A HOLISTIC INCLUSIVITY

*Inclusivity*, a rarely used word defining a state of including, stands in opposition to its more familiar opposite, *exclusivity*, a state of excluding. Recall that inclusion of the other is the common denominator of operationalisms of the common good. The common good requires inclusion of the other, and, according to Robert Grudin, society on all levels struggles to put this principle into practice. Society benefits from new potentialities, Grudin writes, when “it gives ear to new voices, views differences with the interest they deserve, honors people as individuals rather than stereotypes and sees diversity as holding the seeds of future change.”<sup>364</sup> The common good means inclusivity.

#### **Integrating Inclusivity into a Dissertation**

Chapter Three looked into Pinkerton’s life for examples of dialogue and action—two actions necessary for the common good to become reality. Chapter Four now addresses the common denominator of all operationalisms of the common good—inclusion of the other, and as we shall see, sometimes the other is Thee—the Thee being Pinkerton and all women struggling for full inclusion in the Catholic Church. Chapter Four illuminates insights and practices of inclusivity found in Pinkerton’s speeches, in the writings of other women religious, and in records of religious life.

Inclusive historical research should strive to locate and include all possible avenues of effect on the development of the subject of consideration. Consequently, the researcher looked at social movements for possible significance in the development of Pinkerton’s championship of the common good. From community documents, official news organs of organizations developed by women religious, and from Pinkerton’s speeches, the researcher found examples of new thought gleaned from the humanistic psychology movement. The surprise, however, was the overwhelming significance that women religious assigned to the women’s movement in their personal and corporate growth. Pinkerton called the women’s movement “perhaps the greatest revolution in the history of the planet.”<sup>365</sup> Other social movements of the period are not to be excluded as they were a part of changes taking place among the laity as well as religious, but women religious clearly credited much personal growth to the women’s movement.

#### **Social Movements Broaden Inclusivity**

The 1960s and ’70s witnessed many social movements. Three, in particular, affected women religious and prepared them to support social movements of others. The three included the humanistic psychology movement, the women’s movement, and a movement of inclusive spirituality sometimes referred to among the laity as the charismatic renewal. The humanistic psychology movement focused on the whole person rather than fragmented parts. The women’s movement included demands for the inclusion of women as equal partners with men in all areas of life, and the spirituality of the charismatic renewal celebrated and embraced the inclusiveness of the Holy Spirit rather than denominational rules and practices designed to exclude non-

---

<sup>364</sup> Grudin, *On Dialogue*, 40.

<sup>365</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Faculty Orientation: St. Joseph Academy" (Cleveland, Ohio, 23 August, 1989), 13.

adherents.<sup>366</sup> The confluence of these movements was a revolution of the human psyche and spirit. Pinkerton recognized the evolution of human consciousness that brought these movements into being and the “journey inward” for divine wisdom, both of which are addressed in spiritual and transpersonal psychological literatures. Addressing the graduates of Saint Joseph Academy in 1981, she said:

We are taking the journey inward in a great and human and spiritual awakening which takes us back not just to our cultural, ethnic, racial roots, but to the very core of who we are as God’s masterpiece of creation—each of us unique, gifted, blest with an identity and dynamism all our own—irrespective of our sex, our race, our cultural heritage, our role, our education, our position. . . . All the slow imperceptible movements of history have brought us to this point. As humans, we have probed the secrets of the universe and mastered to some degree its processes. But we have come to recognize that the greatest mystery lies in what it is to be truly human in every dimension of our being.<sup>367</sup>

Women religious mentioned all of the movements or thought characteristic of the movements in their speeches and articles, but the lessons learned from feminism<sup>368</sup> seemed to have the most profound effect. Denouncing the system of patriarchy<sup>369</sup> for roles that prevented women and men from being “truly human in every dimension of [their] being,” many women religious became increasingly aware of previously unnoticed means of oppression and the oppression of other groups, also. This continuous learning will be included and interwoven throughout this chapter as examples of a broadening understanding of inclusivity. The chapter begins with a brief recollection of stories of Pinkerton’s early education mentioned in the previous chapter to illuminate the relationship of the events to the theme of inclusivity. The examples of inclusivity proceed chronologically as much as possible. Sometimes a neat chronological separation is not possible as movements converge, and insights arise from multiple influences.

### **Learning from an Inclusive Childhood**

Pinkerton grew up believing she had a right to be heard and a contribution to make to the betterment of society. Inclusivity permeated her childhood. Inclusion in knowledge of parental protests to authority figures against exclusivity and inclusion in serious conversations with her father concerning the interconnectedness of countries in production and exchange of goods via the shipping witnessed on Lake Erie welcomed Pinkerton’s participation at an early age in dialogue and in the business of life. Inclusion in the participative elementary education of the Winnetka Plan that stressed social responsibility, and inclusion in an opportunity to include the poor in the necessities of life via the Catholic Worker Movement provided continuous learning in inclusivity until her immersion into the religious life.

---

<sup>366</sup> In some sections of the U.S., the charismatic renewal later changed from a focus on the inclusivity of the Holy Spirit to a more fundamentalist insistence on adherence to rules.

<sup>367</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Commencement Address" (St. Joseph Academy, Cleveland, 31 May, 1981b), 8.

<sup>368</sup> Feminism is often used to name the belief system that came out of the women's movement. Francine Cardman describes feminism as a movement "that seeks to realize the equality of women and men in all areas of life, so that our relationships, both personal and societal, are characterized by the freedom and mutuality that can only occur between equals" Francine Cardman, "Feminism and Faith," *LCWR Newsletter* 8, no. 2 (April 1980): 1-2.

<sup>369</sup> Patriarchy as defined by Francine Cardman is "the social (and religious) system that is built on male privilege and power" Cardman, "Feminism and Faith."

## **The Exclusivity of Early Religious Life**

When Pinkerton was a young adult and engaging in the developmental task of seeking her own role in a life apart from her parents, she chose to enter the Sisters of Saint Joseph, the religious community, members of which had been her educators throughout twelve years of school. Pinkerton felt called to religious life, but the lessons of inclusivity she had experienced and practiced all of her young life came into conflict with the exclusivity practiced in religious life at the time. On a very personal level, she was to exclude herself from her family, even denying the name her parents had chosen for her and instead answering to the name Sister Mary Pius, a name she detested.<sup>370</sup> In an act of further exclusion, the young sisters were not allowed to go home to visit. Families could come to the convent to visit but only one Sunday afternoon a month. Additionally, the postulants and novices were not allowed to talk to the professed sisters within the community itself.<sup>371</sup> The religious community was not to mix with parishioners. Pinkerton said we lived a life “securely separated from the mainstream of Catholic life and certainly the larger context of the human community. According to Pinkerton, their lives were job-oriented and their living was not integrated into the fabric of society. Somehow they were a group apart living community for community’s sake....”<sup>372</sup>

## **Education in One Arena Affects Learning in Another**

The groups living apart, at least communities of women religious living apart from or having minimal contact with other communities, began to change after World War II. As previously mentioned, certification and accreditation measures instituted to insure quality education necessitated bachelor degrees for the sisters who were teachers. At the time, almost all parochial schools were staffed entirely by religious sisters. To educate so many women all at once required strategic planning, resource sharing, and determination. Bear in mind, as Patrice Noterman reminds, planning for this education came at a time “when dependence, conformity, and institutionalized living were the marks of religious life.”<sup>373</sup> Yet, these women religious took charge and through the Sister Formation Conference planned, developed, and executed a holistic education for their young sisters. According to Noterman, these women experienced “a new kind of responsibility, community building, and discernment.”<sup>374</sup> While the young sisters benefited greatly from a holistic education that didn’t take twenty years to complete, the experience of actively planning change cannot be overestimated in its effect on the older women religious who participated in the development of the education plan. The sisters, through experiential, inclusive, participative learning became aware of their own abilities and talents just about the time the humanistic psychology movement emerged with its emphasis on the whole person, creative and self-actualized.

---

<sup>370</sup> Conversation with Pinkerton on February 4, 1996, at home of researcher in Falls Church, VA.

<sup>371</sup> Postulant comes from the Latin *postulare* meaning *to beg for* (in this case to beg for admission). Novices were new sisters who had not yet taken their final vow of profession.

<sup>372</sup> Pinkerton, "A Sister Views the Church of the '70s,"

<sup>373</sup> Noterman, "An Interpretive History," 1.

<sup>374</sup> Ibid.

## **Inclusion of the Heart and Body with the Intellect**

Pinkerton said, “The new emphasis became the person, the importance of human development, the relation of the person to community.”<sup>375</sup> Recall from Chapter Two, Charles Tart said the humanistic psychology movement focused on creativity and “finding meaning beyond material gratification.”<sup>376</sup>

Pinkerton remembers the questions being asked at the time: “Are we our own makers? Who are we? Where are we going? Are we free? How can we give ourselves and yet possess ourselves? What does it mean to give love? And to feel freedom? Must we always live in fear and guilt? What is the meaning of death?”<sup>377</sup> Contemporary literature and thought and the evaluations of our social, political, economic and educational systems, according to Pinkerton, gave ample evidence that people were questioning the meaning of existence. “These questions,” she said, “indicate on the part of those who ask them a very earnest consideration of human psychology and human existence -- a desire for authenticity. They express the yearning of our age to lead a full, meaningful life, but they likewise demonstrate the absence of a sense of the God who will give life meaning and completion.”<sup>378</sup>

## **Vatican II Focuses on Inclusivity**

During this period of yearning and searching in the ‘60s, Pope John XXIII convened the Second Vatican Council, opened the windows of the church to the world and told the people of God they were the church. Pinkerton says, “Vatican II was the Church’s response to the massive societal shifts already in motion. The Church recognized that we are living through the death of one age and the beginning of another...and therefore, had to address this emerging reality out of a Gospel perspective.”<sup>379</sup> Emerging reality gave the Church a new understanding of an inclusive God who dwells in the secular world as well as the religious. The Church had, in essence, proclaimed God excluded from the secular world, but following Vatican II, the secular world became a place to encounter the sacred. Pinkerton’s community, at the request of Pope John XXIII, returned to the spirit of their founders who met the needs of the church of their day and reflected on how to interpret the call of the Spirit in the ‘60s. Their reflection revealed a need in the world—a need of people to be included.

## **Worldwide Protests Against Exclusion Develop**

Indeed, worldwide protests against exclusion erupted in the 1960s and ‘70s into all sorts of ‘isms,’ ‘ologies,’ and social movements. In the United States, African Americans protesting segregation ushered in the Civil Rights Movement. Women demanding equality renewed the Women’s Movement. Students protested the draft and the Vietnam War and, in other parts of the world, repressive governments. The gay rights movement rose in protest of homophobia. Liberation theology aided empowerment of the poor in Latin America. These large movements

---

<sup>375</sup> Pinkerton, "Prayer and New Ministry," 6.

<sup>376</sup> Tart, "Introduction," ix.

<sup>377</sup> Pinkerton, "The Meaning of Renewal to the Teacher"

<sup>378</sup> Ibid.

<sup>379</sup> Pinkerton, "Address to Religion Education Conference," 7.

protested exclusion. The Sisters of St. Joseph, with the charism of reconciliation, saw their call to be going out into humanity rather than waiting for it to come to them. “They would embrace it as Christ did,” Pinkerton said, ...[and] “try to heed the message ‘that all may be one’ and would seek to help unite rather than further divide.”<sup>380</sup> By the 1980s, Catholic parishes and communities of religious sheltered illegal aliens in the Sanctuary Movement. As Pinkerton explained, “The age of ‘my salvation’ is past. The salvation of each of us is intimately connected with the salvation of all mankind.”<sup>381</sup>

### Old Lessons Are Unlearned

In the age of “my salvation,” (prior to Vatican II) the “good sister” was to be humble, self-sacrificing, quiet, prayerful, hard-working, diligent, concerned with the needs of others, forgetful of their own, and above all—submissive to authority.<sup>382</sup> Anne E. Patrick, SNJM<sup>383</sup> said, “Static, hierarchical authority patterns were assumed to be sacred. The dominant role of male religious authority and the subordinate place of women religious [were] so taken for granted as God’s will that this basic source of the problem does not even reach the level of consciousness....”<sup>384</sup> When the source of the problem doesn’t reach the level of one’s consciousness, Sister Lauretta Mather says that person resides in a tomb, the tomb of dehumanization, and “perhaps our greatest sin (which keeps us tomb-bound) is our adaptation to being less than full persons.”<sup>385</sup> Mather described the tomb of dehumanization as marked “by a colonizing mentality which takes control of the other’s life and destiny. The colonist says: ‘We know what is best for you, we know your real name, we know more about your needs and your fidelity than you do--we will determine your destiny’.”<sup>386</sup> Using the analogy of Lazarus coming forth from the tomb into daybreak, Mather told other women religious the “come forth into daybreak” will come when “we give no one the right to define us and when there is no one whom we seek to define.”<sup>387</sup>

Patrick named the unquestioning obedience of women religious, conformity to passive ideals of virtue, and innocence defined by the religious culture as docility to superiors--“passive responsibility.”<sup>388</sup> According to Patrick, passive responsibility involves being dutiful and living up to the demands of a role largely determined by others. Patrick says there is a reward for passive responsibility: “The payoff ... is security, approval, and perhaps status. But the price is reduced personhood ... and the loss of what my creativity could have contributed to the contexts of my life.”<sup>389</sup>

Passive responsibility, when processed through personal contemplation, communal dialogue and theological reflection, revealed a spirituality that Patrick says missed the dimension of trust. This dimension was “...trust in God’s daily forgiveness and in God’s supportive presence in our process of making choices where innocence is hardly possible, given the

---

<sup>380</sup> Pinkerton, "A Sister Views the Church of the '70s,."

<sup>381</sup> Pinkerton, "The Meaning of Renewal to the Teacher,."

<sup>382</sup> Anne E. Patrick, "The Moral Decision Maker: 'From Good Sisters to Prophetic Women,'" keynote address, LCWR (New Orleans, LA, 2 September, 1985), 9-11.

<sup>383</sup> Sisters of the Holy Names of Jesus and Mary

<sup>384</sup> Patrick, "The Moral Decision Maker," 16.

<sup>385</sup> Lauretta Mather, "Come Forth: Naming the Tombs. Making the Daybreak," LCWR 25th Anniversary (Indianapolis, Indiana, August, 1981), 4.

<sup>386</sup> Mather, "Come Forth," 4.

<sup>387</sup> Ibid.

<sup>388</sup> Patrick, "The Moral Decision Maker," 19.

<sup>389</sup> Ibid., 20.

ambiguities of real life situations.<sup>390</sup> For the sisters, theological reflection, communal dialogue, and personal contemplation act as a filter: addressing emerging reality out of experience and out of a Gospel perspective. The roots of spirituality are included and integrated for a holistic inclusion of the other. Pinkerton's talk at a Formation Conference illustrated this integration:

We must integrate into our desire for personal growth, a new understanding of the redemptional, liberational dimension of the Gospel. The struggle of contemplation and the struggle for the liberation of man in the political and cultural dimensions of his life are one and the same struggle. No contemplation is authentic which does not somehow relate to the struggle to liberate persons in our time and no commitment to such liberation in the public sphere is genuine which does not proceed from the roots of personal contemplation.<sup>391</sup>

Pinkerton's use of the generic *man* in the above citation would soon change as awareness grew of the importance of language.

### **Continuous Learning Reveals Language as a Tool of Exclusivity**

Conversation and language can create marginalization by shaping attitudes and relationships, Sister Joan Chittister writes. "Until we become conscious of the ways our words and communication patterns operate to exclude people as well as simply define and explain reality," Chittister adds, "there is little hope that with all our good intentions we will really do much to correct the basis of exclusion."<sup>392</sup> According to Chittister, "Language theorists and communication specialists have for years been conscious that the single most powerful method of inclusion or separation is symbol systems themselves. ...Peoples and persons are marginalized in language long before a law is ever written, a privilege denied or an access closed."<sup>393</sup> "Words such as Father, Master, king, shepherd, bridegroom defy our experience," Pinkerton says of women in the church.<sup>394</sup> Words such as "Chicano," "nun," "women," "Marxist," "homosexual," Chittister says, are labels that "classify and categorize and evoke reactions that may have little to do with the entire reality. Whole segments of society have been marginated because people accept labels as a substitute for understanding and resist larger meanings or insights."<sup>395</sup> Mary Frances Duffy stressed that: "Language is important because of the reality it reveals and shapes [and] because of the attitudes and values it forms and reflects."<sup>396</sup> Duffy wrote in 1980 that we can conclude from "the prevailing language patterns in our culture (including the church) which remain frozen and statically masculine...that the attitudes and values mirrored therein are essentially sexist."<sup>397</sup> Duffy defined sexist language as "forms of communication which utilize gender and sex images to the extent that one or another of the sexes is ignored and/or

---

<sup>390</sup> Ibid., 17.

<sup>391</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Untitled," speech given to sabbatical group/clergy (Catholic University Washington, D. C., 1975e), 4.

<sup>392</sup> Joan Chittister, "Talking Your Way Out of Touch," *LCWR Newsletter* 7, no. 2 (June 1979): 7.

<sup>393</sup> Ibid., 7-8.

<sup>394</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "The Future of Ministry and You," Formation Conference (Farmington, MI, 1979), 5.

<sup>395</sup> Chittister, "Talking Your Way," 8.

<sup>396</sup> Mary Frances Duffy, "Language, Attitudes and Reality," *LCWR Newsletter* 8, no. 2 (April 1980): 5.

<sup>397</sup> Duffy, "Language, Attitudes and Reality," 4.

eliminated,” and, asserts Duffy, “Sexist language is an issue! At best, it is annoying; at worst, it is oppressive and unjust. In either case, a facile dismissal of the issue as being unimportant is inadmissible.”<sup>398</sup> Then Duffy spoke of what she called the ultimate inclusive Word: “In the beginning, the life-giving Word at Creation spoke humanity into being as male and female, as man *and* woman. May that life-giving word be in our hearts and on our lips; be in our attitudes and our values; be in our actions and our words, once again, as in the beginning, speaking humanity into being as male and female, as man *and* woman.”<sup>399</sup> In the use of inclusive language, secular society has made much progress since Duffy wrote that in 1980. The Catholic Church has made some improvements in liturgy; however, it hasn’t given up language that refers to God as male.

In addition to the use by some of the word *kindom* to replace *kingdom* to emphasize collaboration rather than power over, theologian Elisabeth Schussler Fiorenza writes the word God as G\*d “to indicate the brokenness, ambiguity and indeterminacy of human G\*d language.”<sup>400</sup> Fiorenza says the “call to be G\*d’s people is not exclusive but inclusive;” hence, she uses the expression “the ekklesia of wo/men.”<sup>401</sup> “Ekklesia,” explains Fiorenza, is a Greek word that “can be translated as assembly, gathering or congress of full citizens,” and she uses it to emphasize the democratic nature of the early Christian community versus the monarchical-hierarchical structure of the Roman church.<sup>402</sup> Fiorenza does not use the word wo/men for feminist chauvinism and exclusivism, she reassures us. Rather, Fiorenza says whenever she uses wo/men, she uses it “in the generic sense so as to include men, the word *she* as including *he* and *female* as including *male*.”<sup>403</sup> She points out that we don’t hear wo/men as inclusive or generic because we are all socialized into a different language system.

Another interesting turn that came from a renewed focus on language was the return to the roots of words such as authority and obedience to gain a new understanding of their original intended meaning. More about these two words further on, but Pinkerton says revelation of the root of *obey* opened many minds to needed changes. Indeed, it was a turning point for all, but most importantly for many women religious who had been reluctant to change tradition.<sup>404</sup>

Some words slip unnoticed into common usage at the grass roots level. Without close attention, we miss their significance. The word *ministry* as used in Catholic circles is one such example. John A. Coleman, S.J., in his talk “Ministry in the 1980s” presented at an LCWR Conference in Philadelphia, noted how the use of the word *ministry* which became ubiquitous in the 1980’s “freed imaginations to see reality in a new light.”<sup>405</sup> Coleman says:

“No one, of course, talked very much in the 1950’s and 1960’s about ministry. Then the prized words were ‘apostolate,’ ‘mission,’ ‘vocation,’ and ‘priesthood’. Priesthood ...functioned as a kind of ‘ministerial moloch,’ abrogating to itself—in pre-eminence at

---

<sup>398</sup> Ibid., 5.

<sup>399</sup> Ibid.

<sup>400</sup> This is editor, Bill Thompson’s explanation of Elisabeth Schussler Fiorenza’s use of G\*d in her keynote address. Elisabeth Schussler Fiorenza, “Equality: A Radical Democratic Ekklesial Vision,” in *Spirituality Justice Reprint*, ed. Bill Thompson, Call to Action National Conference (Milwaukee: Call to Action, 31 October, 1998), 1.

<sup>401</sup> Fiorenza, “Equality,” 1.

<sup>402</sup> Fiorenza, “Equality,” 2.

<sup>403</sup> Ibid., 5.

<sup>404</sup> Information given to researcher during telephone call January 5, 1999.

<sup>405</sup> John A. Coleman, “Ministry in the 1980’s,” Leadership Conference of Women Religious (Philadelphia, PA, May 9, 1980), 5.

least, if not in fact—all ministries within the church. ...How the simple and apparently innocuous language shift to ministry has changed all that! For the term, ministry, finesses the whole issue of lay vs. clerical or lay vs. ordained. Both ordained and laity share ministry. The laity, far from being a residual category, now provide the generic term, ministry, for which the ordained are a mere sub-species.<sup>406</sup>

One word signaled an important shift to inclusive thinking among the laity. According to Coleman, “the appeal to ministry language masks a collegial, non-pyramidal view of charisms mutually building up the one body against a non-collegial, monarchical and purely hierarchical model.”<sup>407</sup>

### **Transformative Learning Leads to Action and Change in Governmental Structures of Religious Communities**

The inclusion of all women religious in the process of determining ministries necessitated that the women assume active responsibility for their choices. They did so through critical self-reflection, theological reflection, and dialogue with peers and those in leadership in communities. Jack Mezirow says this process “has the potential for profoundly changing the way we make sense of our experience of the world, other people, and ourselves.”<sup>408</sup> Mezirow calls this transformative learning and says that such learning “leads to action that can significantly affect the character of our interpersonal relationships, the organizations in which we work and socialize, and the socio-economic system itself.”<sup>409</sup> Such learning did indeed affect the organizations in which the women religious work.

Not all communities changed to the same degree, but, for the most part, as women religious began to understand the experience of being ‘fully human,’ LCWR reported “interaction among peers...displaced dependency on a single authority figure.”<sup>410</sup> LCWR reported that hierarchical structures shifted to a horizontal model in which all became included in processes of decision making. Majority-minority approaches began being replaced with a consensual method of reaching decisions. Authority became seen as one of service, and obedience as “a positive orientation of one’s life to God’s will and a commitment to work with others to carry out that will”<sup>411</sup> Chittister clarifies:

Authoritarianism, a poor synonym for obedience, works its will on others for the sake of the productiveness of the group or the exercise of power itself. Obedience is a joint listening by the authority figure and the religious to the signals of the Holy Spirit around them: to the needs of the person herself, to the circumstances of the congregation, to the people in society whose needs are not being met, to the very purpose of the congregation itself. To make a decision without weighing each of these elements in the balance and then to call it religious is to diminish the whole concept of religious obedience.<sup>412</sup>

---

<sup>406</sup> Ibid., 5,7.

<sup>407</sup> Coleman, "Ministry in the 1980's," 7.

<sup>408</sup> Mezirow, *Fostering Critical Reflection*, xiii.

<sup>409</sup> Ibid.

<sup>410</sup> LCWR, *Publication of Patterns in Authority and Obedience* (Washington, D.C., 1978).

<sup>411</sup> LCWR, *Publication of Patterns in Authority and Obedience*.

<sup>412</sup> Chittister, "An Amazing Journey," 81.

Practicing their new understanding of obedience, the Sisters of Saint Joseph of Cleveland determined together that they needed help in setting up new forms of government. To learn each person's role in a horizontal model of governing, the Sisters of Saint Joseph of Cleveland studied organizational development. Among other things, they learned to view conflict and tension as healthy rather than devious and to accept diversity in prayer, ministry, and lifestyle.<sup>413</sup> Eager to learn, the community utilized The Educational Research Council of America to train facilitators and group leaders. Republic Industrial Educational Institute conducted tests geared to individual strengths and limitations, as well as to attitudes about community direction and ministry. REM of Cleveland developed evaluative instruments for the study of ministries, and the Passionist Leadership Institute aided in every level of government restructuring.<sup>414</sup> These women accessed and included knowledge from the secular world in their quest for holistic change in themselves and in their communities. They were arising from the "tomb of dehumanization and coming forth into daybreak," and daybreak illuminated more work to be done.

### **Relationship with the Institutional Church Is Strained by Exclusion**

The researcher is convinced that only transformative learning could allow women religious to so peacefully and persistently pursue structural reform in the institutional church for so many years. Transformative or emancipatory learning prompted by critical reflection liberated women religious from the cultural assumption that the "good sister" was selfless, quiet, dutiful, and submissive to authority and allowed the women then to see structures that limited their development and growth into agents of social change.<sup>415</sup>

Pinkerton reported that in 1967 the Third World Congress of the Lay Apostolate passed a resolution requesting "a serious doctrinal study be undertaken on the place of women in the sacramental order and in the church" and that women be granted "all the rights and responsibilities of the Christian within the Catholic Church."<sup>416</sup> Thirty years later, those demands are still far from realization, but the women and some brave ordained men continue to speak out. Not all agree on what changes need to take place or even if work for change is viable. According to Pinkerton, some women religious believe women should be ordained. Others have the attitude of "Why bother?" because the structures aren't going to change, and still others don't want to be ordained in what they see as a "sacramental cultic ministry."<sup>417</sup> A brief look through the pages of history reveals the persistence of women religious in their struggle for inclusion as equals in the institutional church.

At the 1974 NAWR Convention, members passed a resolution urging the restoration of the diaconate to Roman Catholic women. The women sent copies of the resolution to: (a) the Apostolic Delegate to the U.S.A., Archbishop Jean Jadot; (b) the four U.S. bishops who would

---

<sup>413</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Remarks About Renewal as Continuing" (undated), from box 2-9-1 of Pinkerton's speeches, 2.

<sup>414</sup> Pinkerton, "Remarks," 2.

<sup>415</sup> Social change, according to Jack Mezirow's theory of learning, may result from perspective transformation, but that is the learner's decision, not the educators. Paulo Freire's conscientization, by contrast, has as its intent, radical social change. Jack Mezirow, "Transformation Theory and Action: A Response to Collard and Law," *Adult Education Quarterly* 39, no. 2 (1989): 173; Freire, *Education for critical consciousness*; Sharan B. Merriam and Rosemary S. Caffarella, *Learning in Adulthood* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1991), 261.

<sup>416</sup> Pinkerton, "Organizing for a New World," 141.

<sup>417</sup> A sacramental cultic ministry would be a ministry in which the means of grace is administered through and controlled by an ordained priest. Pinkerton, "NAWR: A Vision for the Future," 2.

represent women religious at the 1974 Synod; (c) the National Catholic Council of Bishops (NCCB) (d) committees on the permanent diaconate, on pastoral research and practices, and on the status of women; and (e) the Vatican Commission on the Status of Women. Also in 1975, Pinkerton asked in her talk as outgoing chairwoman of NAWR, “What can Sisters and Sisters’ Councils do together nationally and internationally to strengthen the position of women as equals with men in the decision-making and policy-making processes within the Church, as persons eligible for all professional and ministerial roles in Church and society?”<sup>418</sup>

In a 1975 interview, Sister Francis Borgia Rothluebber told Donna Foran that women should be ordained if they wanted to end “the discrimination, to pick up our history where we lost it;” however, she called ordained ministry a “sacramentalism that is not life-giving” and explained her reason: “The Lord kept very clearly separated from the temple ministry. His is a different kind of priesthood.”<sup>419</sup> The ministry of Jesus was a ministry of inclusion—inclusion of those who often were excluded by the practices, beliefs and rituals of the temple ministry. In Matthew 15: 9, Jesus said, “They do me empty reverence, making dogmas out of human precepts,” and He proceeded to place the needs of humanity above laws of the sabbath.<sup>420</sup>

Three years later in 1978, with no positive response from the Church, Pinkerton said, “For the Church to ignore the movement among women for equality of personhood and to act as if these movements have nothing to say to one-half Her membership is unconscionable. As the mystery of Jesus, the Church should be in the vanguard of human liberation, not coming in on its coat-tails.”<sup>421</sup> Pinkerton continued, “Is women of lesser dignity than man? Does one’s chromosomes influence the sacramental effects of Baptism which supposedly admits us to fullness of life in Christ? Are women always to experience their choices in the Church as being allowed in rather than in aspiring to what is rightfully theirs?”<sup>422</sup>

According to Pinkerton, a theology of person needed to be developed--“a process not of developing a theology or theological statements, but of living theology, constantly correcting and reassessing in the light of the wisdom and sacredness of the past as well as the experience of the present.”<sup>423</sup> This correcting, reassessing the past and acknowledging the experience of the present, Pinkerton said, gives women religious a serious responsibility “to work with all who are Church in coming to grips with all aspects of the person question” that is “basic to the coming of a Church that is whole.”<sup>424</sup> “In the process,” continued Pinkerton, “we are called to work side by side with the men of the Church in a relationship of mutuality, aware that at this historical moment we will be on the short side of equality. This is our loving patient contribution to the Church of the future. This loving relationship is based on understanding that we, both men and women, are victims of stereotypes, of structures that have created and reinforced false images.”<sup>425</sup>

When women seeking equality within the Church and society were accused by critics of seeking power, Pinkerton responded, “Yes, but not exploitative power, manipulative power,

---

<sup>418</sup> Pinkerton, "NAWR: A Vision for the Future," 2.

<sup>419</sup> Donna Foran, "LCWR: Our Thinking on Ministry 'Radical,'" *National Catholic Reporter*, October 12 1979, 5.

<sup>420</sup> *New American Bible*, Saint Joseph Edition, trans. The Catholic Biblical Association of America (NY: Catholic Book Publishing Co., 1970), New Testament.

<sup>421</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Reality of Today: Vision of Tomorrow" (Saginaw, Michigan, 10 November, 1978c), 1.

<sup>422</sup> Ibid., 8.

<sup>423</sup> Ibid., 9.

<sup>424</sup> Ibid., 10.

<sup>425</sup> Ibid.

competitive power, or even nutritive power; rather women seek integrative power<sup>426</sup>--“power with the other-- win-win relationship [in which] the dignity of the self and the other is respected. It is non-harming because it is integrated with love.”<sup>427</sup> Pinkerton continued:

If we women of the Church set out to attain equality within the Church without understanding and utilizing integrative power, we shall, indeed, be involved in the oppression of the male element of the Church. Such efforts rather than building the Body of the Church will further fragment it. ...My goal and yours must be the building of a Church that is whole, a Church where not our rights or independence is the question, but where interdependence becomes the goal, the full sharing of the gifts of the Spirit to the Church.<sup>428</sup>

Pinkerton believes a church that is whole acknowledges the feminine and masculine characteristics of God and Jesus and notes:

Genesis says He created them male and female to His own image. If all perfection of persons is in God, must God not embody both the masculine and feminine qualities? What does one do with Yahweh's ‘Am I to open my womb and not bring birth? Or I who bring birth, am I to close it?’ ...What do you do with imagery Jesus uses: ‘How often did I long to gather her children as a hen gathers the chicks under her wings, and you would not’?<sup>429</sup>

Pinkerton noted agreement with Margaret Farley, RSM, then professor of ethics at Yale University, who believed unless we reconcile male and female characteristics in the person of God and Jesus, it will be difficult to reconcile God and Jesus as having the perfection of person.<sup>430</sup>

The Church continued to show little sign of including women in decision making positions, and on October 7, 1979, when Sister Theresa Kane, as President of LCWR welcomed Pope John Paul II at the National Shrine in Washington, D.C., she shocked the world by urging the pope to allow women to serve the Church as fully participating members.<sup>431</sup> Some women religious reacted with horror, even placing in newspapers notices that Kane did not speak for them. Anne E. Patrick, SNJM, however, admired Kane's decision to respond to repeated refusals for private conversation with the pope by “using the occasion of a formal welcome to convey a message she deemed it urgent for him to hear.”<sup>432</sup> Patrick explained:

The action was unexpected and controversial, but I think it epitomizes values within limited circumstances. There was the duty to express welcome and respect; there was the obligation to represent the injustices experienced by those who had chosen her as leader.

---

<sup>426</sup> Rollo May identified these five kinds of power in *Power and Innocence*.

<sup>427</sup> Pinkerton, "Reality of Today," 10.

<sup>428</sup> Ibid., 11.

<sup>429</sup> Ibid., 9.

<sup>430</sup> Ibid., 10.

<sup>431</sup> Theresa Kane, "Welcome to Pope John Paul II" (National Shrine, Washington, D.C., October 7, 1979).

<sup>432</sup> Patrick, "The Moral Decision Maker," 31.

Both concerns found their way into the course she finally elected, and to my mind, she succeeded in the Christian ideal of ‘speaking the truth in love’.<sup>433</sup>

### Speaking the Truth Begins to Include the Word “Feminism”

By 1980, the words feminism and feminists began to appear in Pinkerton’s speeches and in the writings of other women religious. These words often evoke a lot of negative images such as “femi-nazis,” “amazons,” “male-bashers,” etc., but the sisters claimed the words as meaningful and good and defined them as such in their work. Carol Coston, OP, in a Network publication, described feminism as a values transformation that valued “cooperation rather than competition, mutuality rather than hierarchical decision making, and integration rather than dualism.”<sup>434</sup> Coston said that feminism “opposes ... patterns of domination and subordination, ... rejects the win-lose pattern and the ‘Gotta be #1 syndrome,’ works not by exclusion but by incorporation, ... is wholistic—not monolithic or tyrannical, but organic and differentiating, ... seeks to learn from differences, ... is life-supporting, ... values a sense of stewardship toward all life and makes choices to preserve life now and for the future.”<sup>435</sup>

Francine Cardman told the sisters that feminism is not anti-male, but “by questioning and rejecting arrangements of male dominance, feminism can introduce, at least for the time being, an element of difficulty and discomfort, even discord, into relationships between men and women.”<sup>436</sup> Cardman insisted, however, that feminism does not create conflict and agreed with Jean Baker Miller that feminism merely “reveals conflict that already exists though it has been suppressed or masked.”<sup>437</sup> Cardman asserted the fundamentally religious foundations of feminism and wrote that feminism is: “an insight into the dignity and equality of persons, which demands that we treat one another with justice and equal regard; and a call to freedom, which invites us to openness and risk.”<sup>438</sup>

This openness and risk, called “the price of creative responsibility” by Patrick, required giving up the security, approval, and perhaps status of passive responsibility.<sup>439</sup> In taking creative responsibility, Patrick explained to members of LCWR, one risks “being mistaken, being criticized, losing approval and status,” but in return, one gains “an enhanced sense of self-esteem that comes from using all ... [one’s] talents and a sense of being a full adult participant in life rather than a minor, someone who is only marginally involved in shaping ... [one’s] self and the contexts of ... [one’s] life.”<sup>440</sup>

---

<sup>433</sup> Ibid.

<sup>434</sup> Carol Coston, *Feminism: Values and Vision* (Washington, D.C.: Network, 1987), 2. This article was adapted from talks Coston gave in 1980 to the School Sisters of Notre Dame and the Sisters of Saint Joseph of Carondelet.

<sup>435</sup> Coston, *Feminism: Values and Vision*, 2.

<sup>436</sup> Cardman, “Feminism and Faith,” 1.

<sup>437</sup> Ibid.; Jean Baker Miller, *Toward a New Psychology of Women* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1976), 126.

<sup>438</sup> Cardman, “Feminism and Faith,” 1.

<sup>439</sup> Patrick, “The Moral Decision Maker,” 20.

<sup>440</sup> Ibid.

## Conflict With the Hierarchy Intensifies

Being a full adult participant in society and in the church, Pinkerton called “a human issue” not a feminist issue.<sup>441</sup> Whether one saw full participation in the church as a human issue or a feminist issue mattered not to the Most Reverend Pio Laghi, Apostolic Delegate in the United States, who told women and men religious they had to be “in deep and sincere unity with the Vicar of Christ and with the orientations he gives, especially those which concern religious life...”<sup>442</sup> Laghi spoke those words at a 1982 joint meeting of the Conference of Major Superiors of Men (CMSM) and the Leadership Conference of Women Religious (LCWR). At that same conference, five women had been asked to distribute the wine for communion during Mass, but when they went forward to receive the wine at the appropriate time during the Mass, they were quietly told to return to their seats. Archbishop Laghi, the celebrant, had stated it was not to be. Archbishop Augustine Mayer, OSB,<sup>443</sup> Secretary of the Sacred Congregation for Religious and Secular Institutes, (SCRIS) believed “it was ridiculous to have women distributing communion when there were so many priests present.”<sup>444</sup>

The proceedings of that joint meeting of LCWR and CMSM reveal the conflicts present when the status quo is challenged. James D. Baines, then Professor of Urban Education at William Patterson College in Wayne, New Jersey, and also a speaker at the conference, bemoaned the reliance on rules rather than relationships. Baines said, “We rely...on the innate laws of our own inventions...of institutional behavior. We have, in the words of Eric Fromm, sunk into idolatry—into the worship of our own creations.”<sup>445</sup> Baines continued, “It would be nice if we could compile a list of commandments as Moses did when the Israelites were searching for their identity in the desert; but Christ put an end to such neat legalisms when He transformed all the commandments to their essence—love.”<sup>446</sup>

Sandra M. Schneiders, IHM,<sup>447</sup> said in response to Laghi’s action, “To absolutize the institution of the Church...is not a recognition of nor a participation in the royalty of Jesus. It is an exercise of royal consciousness against which, as prophets, we must cry out for it is an idolatry that blinds people to the coming of the reign. To participate in the royalty of Jesus is to so identify with the reign of God that we see clearly the relativity of all human regimes, that of the ecclesiastical institution as much as that of the civil institution.”<sup>448</sup> Schneiders continued, “...We pervert the Gospel ideal of meekness when we make it an excuse for allowing ourselves to be dominated rather than face the struggle to achieve maturity in our relationship with institutional authority.”<sup>449</sup>

Ronald N Carignan, OMI, President of the CMSM, reflected on the criteria for ministry that developed during the meeting and listed the following ‘covenant values’ around which they make important choices in the present development in ministry: “collaboration, interdependence,

---

<sup>441</sup> Pinkerton, "Commencement Address," 9.

<sup>442</sup> Pio Laghi, "Homily to the Leadership Conference of Women Religious and the Conference of Major Superiors of Men," *Proceedings Convergence II*, 15-20 August 1982, 31.

<sup>443</sup> Order of Saint Benedict

<sup>444</sup> LCWR/CMSM, "Official Minutes of Convergence LC II," 2-6-2B (Congregation of Saint Joseph archives, Cleveland, Ohio, 15-20 August, 1982), 5.

<sup>445</sup> James D. Baines, "Bridging the Gap: From Power to Peace," *Proceedings Convergence II*, 15-20 August 1982, 5.

<sup>446</sup> Baines, "Bridging the Gap," 12.

<sup>447</sup> Immaculate Heart of Mary

<sup>448</sup> Sandra M. Schneiders, "Prophetic Consciousness in the Contemporary Church," *Proceedings Convergence II*, 15-20 August 1982, 24.

<sup>449</sup> Ibid.

accountability/mutual responsibility, faith/risk, dialogue, global awareness, synergy, construction/new order.”<sup>450</sup> Carignan described synergy as “when one and one equals three. It is the value that is operative when in our doing things together we transcend our limits. What we do together is greater than the sum of what we could do individually.”<sup>451</sup> Carignan then said they need to promote structures that favored the development and the expression of those covenant values and they need to mediate a new vision of what it means to be church today. “In order to do this we have to lead in liberating the anima<sup>452</sup> within the Church and the World. This is not just a woman issue. It is an ecclesial and global issue.”<sup>453</sup>

At the end of the conference, criteria for ministry were listed under four categories: (a) those that were strongly affirmed by the great majority of members, (b) criteria warmly affirmed, with an occasional minor hesitation, (c) criteria that were positively accepted, though with some hesitation, and (d) criteria that met considerable hesitation, although they were lukewarmly affirmed. One additional category headed “Areas which surfaced from several groups and which represent material for further discussion” contained the following two items: (1) selecting areas of ministry in which fair treatment of women is exemplified, and (2) serving only in those ecclesiastical structures where people are consciously working toward justice in their policies and practices with regard to decision-making and adequate provision for material needs.<sup>454</sup> Apparently the men and women religious were unwilling to address in either of those ways the injustices they saw in the church.

#### Pinkerton Advocates Dialogue and Corporate Action

Undeterred, Pinkerton, in 1983, addressed the General Assembly of the Sisters of St. Joseph that for 6,000 years of history “reality and human affairs were ordered by power and domination” but that age was coming to an end and an inclusive age of equality among differences was beginning. This was to be an inclusiveness that would recognize the variety of God in the voices of men *and* women, the richness of varied cultures and in *all* the great religions of the world.<sup>455</sup>

Not all women religious agreed on women’s role in the church. In her 1983 LCWR Presidential acceptance speech, Pinkerton noted the difference between tolerating or accepting the diversity, honest informed differences, among women religious and respecting that diversity as “symbol of a God who is infinite variety, calling each of us to newness, to greater richness, to places and positions we have not embraced before...”<sup>456</sup> She saw how every voice needed to be included for true solidarity but also, knew the difficulty this presented. Her solution? She called for:

a poverty of spirit that is open to dialogue, to clarifying our positions while perhaps still owning them, to letting go but never dropping out or walking away from membership or involvement without being open to coming back after a good second look, a good laugh, a brisk walk, or a solid time with the God who makes us so uniquely different from one

---

<sup>450</sup> Ronald N. Carignan, "Reflections on Criteria for Ministry," *Proceedings Convergence II*, 15-20 August 1982, 36.

<sup>451</sup> Ibid.

<sup>452</sup> Anima is an inner feminine part of the male personality in the analytic psychology of C. G. Jung.

<sup>453</sup> Carignan, "Reflections on Criteria for Ministry," 37.

<sup>454</sup> LCWR/CMSM, "Official Minutes of Convergence II,."

<sup>455</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Call to Assembly" (Cleveland, Ohio, 18, March, 1983), 2.

<sup>456</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Acceptance Presentation" (LCWR, 18 August, 1983b), 1.

another. For we need each other to affect the peace for which the world hungers. We cannot do alone what we have the power to do corporately.”<sup>457</sup>

Members of the National Association of Religious Women (NARW), formerly National Association of Women Religious (NAWR),<sup>458</sup> spoke corporately when the Vatican told communities of women religious to submit their constitutions for approval and told bishops to investigate religious life in the U.S. In a press release, the women announced, “Our response to an escalating pattern of deepening oppression of women religious by the Vatican Church is simple and clear. We will stand together. We will not be broken.”<sup>459</sup> The women called the Church’s actions “a means once again of depriving women religious of their right to define themselves. The approval of constitutions thus becomes a mechanism for control, for imposing discipline.”<sup>460</sup>

Pinkerton’s address to the Vicars for Religious (representatives of the Bishops), was cordial and welcoming, but she let them know they were dealing with an equal, a representative of LCWR. Pinkerton told the vicars that if they saw themselves only as relating the Bishop’s concerns and decisions to the religious, they would “do both him and the religious life in the local Church a disservice.”<sup>461</sup> In other words, Pinkerton was settling for nothing less than a dialogue in a collaborative relationship.

At the 1984 LCWR National Assembly, the women religious present voted on how to respond to Vatican intervention in U.S. religious congregations. Pinkerton’s speech setting the tone for the discussion was deliberately omitted from the records so as to avoid further conflict, but the speech had prior LCWR Board approval, and board members sat on the stage while Pinkerton spoke. The sisters voted 462 positive, 4 negative that it was appropriate, “in accordance with established norms, [for] the conference to be involved with an individual congregation experiencing difficulties with ecclesiastical authorities” and 463 positive, 3 negative “that the conference should set up, as a resource to members, consultation panels to assist members in situations of ecclesiastical conflict.”<sup>462</sup>

### Reaction to Obedience Injures but Isn’t Lethal

Pinkerton told students at John Carroll University, “The documents of the Church in principle uphold the equality of the sexes,” and noted from scripture Paul’s proclamation that ‘all are baptized in Christ; you have all clothed yourselves in Christ, and there are no more distinctions between Jew and Gentile, slave and free, male and female’.<sup>463</sup> “But,” continued Pinkerton, “the Fathers and Doctors of the Church had different concepts of woman.”<sup>464</sup> To illustrate, Pinkerton referenced a 1977 Vatican Declaration on the ordination of women that used “the arguments of the defective nature of women and their inability to image God in its wording: ‘When Christ’s role in the Eucharist is to be expressed sacramentally, there would not be this natural resemblance which must exist between Christ and His minister if the

---

<sup>457</sup> Ibid.

<sup>458</sup> The name was changed to reflect inclusion of lay women in the organization and to express unity with them.

<sup>459</sup> National Association of Religious Women, *For Immediate Release* (Chicago, ILL: NARW, 1983).

<sup>460</sup> Ibid.

<sup>461</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Presentation to Vicars for Religious" (Cleveland, Ohio, October, 1983d), 4.

<sup>462</sup> LCWR, "Official Minutes," LCWR National Assembly (Kansas City, Missouri, 26-30/August, 1984), 7.

<sup>463</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Talk to Students" (John Carroll University, 15 March, 1984), 3.

<sup>464</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Talk to Students" (John Carroll University, 15 March, 1984), 3.

role of Christ were not taken by a man. In such a case, it would be difficult to see in the minister the image of Christ. For Christ Himself was and remains a man'.<sup>465</sup> The crucial issue here, Pinkerton says, is "Does imaging Christ reside in one's sexuality or in one's humanity?"<sup>466</sup> Pinkerton saw this question of where Christ resides as a crisis of consciousness and said feminism in the Church as in society is a response to that crisis.<sup>467</sup>

Response, however, brought the risks of creative responsibility that Patrick mentioned: "the risk of being mistaken, being criticized, losing approval, and status."<sup>468</sup> Pinkerton shared those experiences with the students: "When they (sisters) had their consciousness raised and took positions, especially in team or pastoral ministry, they began to realize the dimensions of their socialization in a patriarchal system."<sup>469</sup> Pinkerton told the students of the pain the sisters experienced when, after following the Pope's call for renewal and subsequently shifting their lives "from dependence and matriarchy to interdependence, taking full responsibility as equals for their lives and decisions regarding community life and direction," people labeled them as radical and disobedient to the Pope. "The truth of the matter is that we were most obedient to the call of the Church to renewal. In that process, we truly became humanized in Christ and with one another. We began to see the injustices which stem from non-recognition of the equality of us all in the Church as in society and we, many of us, pledged to address human rights in the Church."<sup>470</sup>

On May 9, 1983, Catherine Pinkerton, CSJ; Bette Moslander, CSJ; Lora Ann Quinonez, CDP; and Helen Flaherty met with members of the Congregation for Religious and Secular Institutes (SCRIS) to discuss, among other things, Pope John Paul II's insistence that religious garb (a habit) be required as a sign of consecration. The women respectfully but firmly told the Vatican representatives that (a) wearing secular clothing had "facilitated their ministry and presence to the people, and has resulted in a deeper interiorization of religious identity and commitment," (b) "a uniform frequently connotes status and privilege, identifications not acceptable to many religious, who see themselves as apostolic religious called to be with and among the people, and (c) many women religious who are living religious life deeply cannot, in conscience and as a matter of principle, accept the law that a distinctive religious garb is to be worn nor that it is essential for membership in religious community."<sup>471</sup>

The women showed great courage in refusing to abdicate their judgment to authorities. Courage, Patrick says, is the quality or characteristic most typical of creative responsibility. "Without courage, one cannot risk the creative deed or the prophetic word, for fear of failure, for fear of losing status or approval, for fear of getting into trouble."<sup>472</sup> Pinkerton said the Church that speaks to the world about justice must first be just itself in order to be heard. According to Pinkerton, those who are working for equality of women in the Church don't expect to see its fruition in their life times, but it will come. "Transformation is a process of planting seeds—building awareness, changing consciousness and perceptions, organizing support groups, reflecting, contemplating, acting always in a mode of co-creating and of deep

---

<sup>465</sup> Ibid.

<sup>466</sup> Ibid.

<sup>467</sup> Ibid.

<sup>468</sup> Patrick, "The Moral Decision Maker," 20.

<sup>469</sup> Pinkerton, "Talk to Students," 5.

<sup>470</sup> Pinkerton, "Talk to Students," 5.

<sup>471</sup> LCWR, "Memorandum to LCWR Members: Report of SCRIS/LCWR Meeting," 2-6-2B (Congregation of Saint Joseph archives, Cleveland, Ohio, 9/May, 1983), 3.

<sup>472</sup> Patrick, "The Moral Decision Maker," 21.

conversion.”<sup>473</sup> Pinkerton’s definition of transformation can also be a definition of adult education that is inclusive of the spirit as well as the intellect—an education that taps into the wisdom within. The deep conversion of which Pinkerton speaks gives one knowledge of the interconnectedness of all things and fosters awareness of the importance of the common good in maintaining a balanced system of interrelatedness.

### **Three Inclusive Transitions Seen by Pinkerton as Interrelated**

Pinkerton, in a 1989 address to educators, spoke of what she saw as the confluence of three transitions which “will shake the very foundations of our social, economic and political systems: (a) the decline of patriarchy and the movement toward structures of mutuality, participation, equity, collaboration, (b) the rise of ecological consciousness, and (c) the convergence of science and spirituality and the development of wholistic planetary spirituality.”<sup>474</sup> Pinkerton said patriarchy, a three thousand-year-old system, has never been challenged in recorded history until the advent of the feminist movement which she called “perhaps the greatest revolution in the history of the planet. . . . The strong movements toward interdependence in marriage, economic equity, political equity, changing relationships in the workplace are slowly beginning to evidence the decline of patriarchy.”<sup>475</sup> Mincing no words, Pinkerton defined patriarchy as part of a culture of domination that “strips life of real meaning and destroys the energy of looking toward a future.”<sup>476</sup> Citing evidence of change, Pinkerton continued:

Millions of people in countries across the globe: Chile, Yugoslavia, Algeria, Latvia, Burma, South Korea, China and Poland give evidence of the development of a collective consciousness. People are coming into the streets in various forms of peaceful protest to seek economic, others’ political birthrights and demanding that authorities respond to them. There is evidence that communications networks are linking people and that a powerful force of related purpose and mutual encouragement is at work<sup>477</sup>

Pinkerton then told the gathering of Christian educators the question for them was: “How will you prepare your students, the inheritors of a culture of domination to face the inevitable redistribution of the power and resources of the world community?”<sup>478</sup> Based on a belief that the American psyche of ‘win all, take all’ would be transformed with the “rising tide of people everywhere who are no longer intimidated or apathetic and will risk all to claim their human rights,” Pinkerton asked the educators, “How do you prepare them (the students) to envision and prepare for a world community of peoples who must share equitably the world’s resources, and who each bring a unique culture to the mosaic of the world reality?”<sup>479</sup>

Turning the focus on the educators themselves and on her herself, Pinkerton questioned: “More importantly, how will we enable ourselves in the first world to see the true significance of this global pattern of the assertiveness of the oppressed, be they women in our own nation or

---

<sup>473</sup> Pinkerton, "Talk to Students," 7.

<sup>474</sup> Pinkerton, "Faculty Orientation," 23.

<sup>475</sup> Ibid., 11.

<sup>476</sup> Ibid.

<sup>477</sup> Pinkerton, "Faculty Orientation," 13-14.

<sup>478</sup> Ibid., 14.

<sup>479</sup> Ibid.

victims of oppression in any form?”<sup>480</sup> “What we must learn,” she continued, “is that we are not the saviors of the poor and oppressed; they will liberate us from our paralysis of preoccupation with power, getting ahead.”<sup>481</sup>

According to Pinkerton, respecting the rights of each person and the integrity of each nation begins “not with respect for the most powerful, but rather with empowering the most vulnerable.”<sup>482</sup> Thereby, we begin to repudiate the curse of the modern world, namely the domination of the many by the few,” she said.

### **Increased Awareness of Domination Leads to Ecological Consciousness and Enriched Spirituality**

Pinkerton lamented domination over the earth, the severe degradation of the natural environment upon which we are completely dependent for life: “Our global ecosystem and the further evolution of life on earth are so seriously endangered that they could well end in a large scale ecological disaster,” Pinkerton told educators.<sup>483</sup> She noted the existence of mustard colored smog that burns eyes and chokes lungs, pollution that kills plants and changes the animal populations that depend on them for life, and food additives, pesticides and other chemicals that threaten our health. The core problem, according to Pinkerton, is the domination of nature for “selfish, short-termed productive reasons, rather than entering into a partnership with the earth.”<sup>484</sup>

Pinkerton then tied ecological consciousness to the convergence of science and spirituality from which is emerging a planetary spirituality. According to Pinkerton, “The scientific, mechanistic age in which reality was that which could be scientifically measured and validated, and spiritual phenomena was considered but a manifestation of matter” was coming to an end.<sup>485</sup> Calling the convergence of science and spirituality “one of the strongest rays of light illuminating our world view,” Pinkerton said this synthesis of insights provides a wholistic view of life in which “true reality is found in both sensory and supersensory aspects which coexist within an embracing reality.”<sup>486</sup> Physicists, Fritjof Capra and Brian Swimme are authors who write about new concepts in physics that have changed world views from a mechanistic conception to a holistic and ecological view.<sup>487</sup> Pinkerton, who reads Capra’s, Swimme’s and

---

<sup>480</sup> Ibid., 15.

<sup>481</sup> Ibid.

<sup>482</sup> Empowering the most vulnerable was the thesis of liberation theology that arose in the 1960s in Brazil to empower the peasants. The movement developed among Latin American Catholics who believed the Gospel of Christ calls for liberation of all people from oppression and poverty. It was in this setting that educator, Paulo Freire, developed the dialogic process of conscientization to bring people to awareness of the means of their oppression and to acceptance of responsibility “to become subjects of their own destiny.” The phrase ‘subjects of their own destiny’ was taken from Freire’s book *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* and cited by Robert Goulet’s introduction to *Education for Critical Consciousness* by Paulo Freire. Freire, *Education for Critical Consciousness*, viii.

<sup>483</sup> Pinkerton, “Faculty Orientation,” 18.

<sup>484</sup> Ibid.

<sup>485</sup> Ibid.

<sup>486</sup> Pinkerton, “Faculty Orientation,” 18.

<sup>487</sup> Readers interested in spiritual and ecological integrity or ecology and cosmic purpose can read more in the following books Fritjof Capra, *The Turning Point* (New York: Pantam Books, 1983); Brian Swimme, *The Universe is a Green Dragon* (Santa Fe: Bear and Co., 1984); Brian Swimme, “The Cosmic Creation Story,” in *The Reenchantment of Science*, ed. David Ray Griffin (Albany: SUNY Press, 1988), 47-56; Albert Gore, *Earth in the Balance: Ecology and the Human Spirit* (New York: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1992); Berry, *The Dream of the Earth*.

Thomas Berry's works, cited Berry's support of the *Gaia hypothesis*<sup>488</sup> in which "the whole earth is a single living creature-unique in a neighborhood of other heavenly bodies that do not possess life."<sup>489</sup> Pinkerton says, that according to Berry, "We humans are the reflexive consciousness of the planet. We can now stand outside the planet and reflect on the wonder of the universe Gaia contemplating the eternal creator...[and] this is our role as humans-if we choose to accept it fully and grow to the maturity to which we are called in Christ. It is the development of a global spirituality. Indeed the next frontier is soul size—the linking of minds and hearts."<sup>490</sup> Intrigued with this merging of science and spirituality, she sees it as part of the evolution of human consciousness. Pinkerton's spiritual journey to the development of a global spirituality is the topic of Chapter Five.

### **Inclusivity Grows from Experiential, Interactive, Continuous Learning**

This chapter primarily dealt with the struggle of women religious to be included as equals with men in the work of the church and for them and all women to be seen as equally imaged in God because of the emphasis given this struggle for inclusion in Pinkerton's speeches and other documents. Pinkerton clearly envisions inclusion of all as important for a holistic community, and her speeches over a thirty-year period give witness to the strength of that vision. Pinkerton and other women religious mostly credit the women's movement with enabling them to learn the breadth and depth of domination and exclusion. Chittister said, "Underlying the entire process of religious renewal...was the surging consciousness of women that they had long been denied their share of the gospel, either its rights or its responsibilities."<sup>491</sup> These women religious learned their right as women to define themselves, their right to obey (listen for and hear) God's will for them, and their right to author (give life to) the inclusive Gospel of Jesus in the world today. These rights are not asserted in independence but in dialogic, collaborative, inclusive interdependence with a deep, profound belief that this is God's will. Pinkerton described this process in a 1981 talk:

The renewal of religious life these past fifteen years has brought us through many stages of human and spiritual development, some of them difficult, others exciting, others absolutely confusing. Whatever and whenever the kinds of stages and dynamics, we are as women religious in this country conscious of our new identity and maturity. We have gone through those processes which brought each of us, after years of another type of formation, to a sense of our own personhood, our uniqueness, the specificity of our individual call and our responsibility to participate in designing the life and direction of our congregations. From our former dependency levels, we moved through some stages of independence and into what is emerging as interdependence.<sup>492</sup>

---

<sup>488</sup> Physicist James Lovelock, author of *Gaia: A new Look at Life on Earth* originated the *Gaia Hypothesis*, named after the Greek earth goddess. Lovelock maintained that the earth is a living organism upon whom our lives depend.

<sup>489</sup> Pinkerton, "Faculty Orientation," 19.

<sup>490</sup> *Ibid.*, 21.

<sup>491</sup> Chittister, "An Amazing Journey," 85.

<sup>492</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Justice and the Poor" (Congregation of Religious Education, 24 June, 1981c), 1.

They learned experientially and interactively trying new forms of government,<sup>493</sup> new ministries,<sup>494</sup> new rituals,<sup>495</sup> new ways of living community,<sup>496</sup> new ways of praying, new membership,<sup>497</sup> and new ways of confronting oppression.<sup>498</sup> They used theological reflection, self-reflection, critical reflection and dialogue both when division arose among them and to proceed from a position of unity.

While lessons learned from the women's movement did help these women exchange passive responsibility for creative responsibility, the preceding humanistic psychology movement must have prepared them. The humanistic psychology movement with its emphasis on the whole person and creativity taught the sisters that it was all right to define themselves by who they were rather than by what they did. They gave themselves permission to appreciate themselves as gift, each uniquely designed and created by a loving God. It was not sinful to see themselves included as gift. Also, planning and executing, through the Sister Formation Conference, a holistic education for their members gave the sisters concrete realization of their talents and capabilities.

If one accepts Dewey's theory of the continuity of learning—that all learning builds upon prior learning—then lessons learned from the women's movement arose from the preparation gained from the humanist movement. Continuous learning is like a layer cake that continues to add new layers. New layers of learning rise from the yeast of prior learning to take their place on top. The layers grow richer in wisdom, as knowledge in one area begins to be seen as relevant and applicable to another. The exclusion, domination, and oppression these women experienced in a patriarchal system, they also noticed in nations, in abuse of the world's resources and in the

---

<sup>493</sup> In 1984, the Congregation of Saint Joseph in Cleveland settled on team leadership—a three-member team. They saw this structure as (a) providing healthy support for each of the three, (b) affirming congregational values, (c) being a healthy, radical response to the call of the Gospel and Vatican II, healthy for the church, and (d) a counter-cultural model filled with potential. Congregation of Saint Joseph, *A Moment in the Life 1984-1988* (Cleveland, Ohio: Congregation of Saint Joseph, 1988), 13.

<sup>494</sup> In 1988, about one-third of active community members still worked as professional teachers and administrators. The next largest group worked in parishes, diocesan offices or social service institutions as administrators, pastoral ministers, and counselors. A growing number worked in rehabilitation centers, housing complexes, and home health care. The women expressed frustration that administrative positions in church related ministries, for which many of their members were qualified, were not open to them Congregation of Saint Joseph, *A Moment in the Life 1984-1988*, 24.

<sup>495</sup> Both the 1980 and 1984 Directional Statements on the Role of Women proposed developing a list of songs, prayers and resources for worship that were free of sexist language and that enhance non-sexist attitudes of God and preparation of of paraliturgies and prayer services that are non-sexist and inclusive. The Directional Papers were Proceedings from the 1980 and 1984 Chapters of the Congregation of Saint Joseph, Cleveland, which were compiled in *A Moment in the Life: 1980-1984* Congregation of Saint Joseph, *A Moment in the Life 1984-1988*.

<sup>496</sup> Some members live in local communities (in Cleveland), some with co-members, some with non-members, and others away from community in apartments Congregation of Saint Joseph, *A Moment in the Life 1984-1988*, 24.

<sup>497</sup> The Congregation decided in 1976 to have co-members. Co-members include both male and female, single, married, divorced or widowed. They are people who share the same spirituality, want to be of service and want to do it corporately. They remain co-members as long as the mutual commitment exists Congregation of Saint Joseph, *A Moment in the Life 1984-1988*, 21.

<sup>498</sup> A few of the ways of countering oppression mentioned in the 1980 and 1984 Directional Papers of the Congregation of Saint Joseph, Cleveland, include: denouncing militarism and stockpiling of nuclear weapons, lobbying Congress, writing books about sexism, participating in peaceful protests, providing public sanctuary for refugees from Central America in protest of U.S. government's refusal to protect those in danger of any form of persecution—not just political persecution, awakening the consciousness of others to the needs of the poor, causes of poverty, and possible remedies, and providing salary subsidies for sisters focusing their work on the economically poor Congregation of Saint Joseph, *A Moment in the Life 1984-1988*.

omission of spiritual phenomena from reality. The layers continue to build, but the icing that bonds them together is a deep, rich, evolving-in-revelation spirituality—a spirituality that continues to grow in inclusivity.

Pinkerton's spirituality is the topic of the next chapter, but for now it should be noted that this growth in inclusivity is not without its "lumps in the icing." As religious communities continue to broaden their membership to include various configurations of associate members, Margaret Brennan, IHM,<sup>499</sup> tells us the fear of some women religious of loss of identity causes them to meet attempts to include others "with anxiety, apprehension, and sometimes hostility."<sup>500</sup> Nonetheless, Brennan says, expanding understanding of feminist and ecological insights continues to foster "spiritualities that are prophetic, contemplative, holistic and mystical in the truest sense. Recommitments to work for justice are nuanced by a growing sense of the interdependence and unity of all creation as central to the emerging view."<sup>501</sup> This continued movement toward inclusivity led Felix Cardegna, at a 1989 joint meeting of LCWR and CMSM, to predict that by 2010 religious communities would be ecumenical and possibly interfaith, as well as composed of persons of different genders, cultures, and even sexual orientation, have both lay and clerical members, and with priorities for service influenced by global awareness.<sup>502</sup> Such changes may seem impossible and unrealistic, but a holistic, contemplative, mystical spirituality seems to foster another view of differences. Differences cease to mean 'other than' or 'lesser than,' but neither are differences simply overlooked or ignored. Rather, women religious who appear to have such spirituality seem to view, even welcome, differences as gift-gift reflecting the limitless mystery of God.

---

<sup>499</sup> Immaculate Heart of Mary

<sup>500</sup> Margaret Brennan, "A White Light Still and Moving: Religious Life at the Crossroads of the Future," in *Religious Life*, ed. CP Yuhaus, HED (New York: Paulist Press, 1994), 104.

<sup>501</sup> Brennan, "A White Light," 99.

<sup>502</sup> Brennan, "A White Light," 104.

## CHAPTER FIVE

### AN INCARNATIONAL SPIRITUALITY

The researcher defines spirituality as a faith-filled and faith-fueled way of embracing life and the world. Spirituality encompasses and permeates one's being and may or may not include denominational beliefs. Thomas Matus in a conversation with physicist Fritjof Capra and Benedictine monk David Steindl-Rast describes spirituality as experiential, a direct knowledge of absolute Spirit in the here and now.<sup>503</sup> Pinkerton's spirituality is born of an experiential faith. Pinkerton experiences this faith as a dialogic relationship with a God who became one of us in Bethlehem and whose recorded life demonstrates how to be in relationship. According to James Fowler, the quality of a relationship with God depends in part upon the process of maturation in faith.<sup>504</sup> Maturation is also a factor in adult education.

#### **The Process of Maturation as Related to Adult Learning**

Malcolm Knowles described adult education, "viewed in its broadest sense," as "the process of adult learning."<sup>505</sup> Adult learning, according to Knowles, is guided in part by the process of maturation. The word *process* warrants particular attention. Harry Overstreet once defined a mature person as "one whose mental habits are such that he grows in knowledge and the wise use of it."<sup>506</sup> Notice that the mature person is not one who reached a certain level of growth and stopped. The word *grows* indicates that the mature person, in Overstreet's mind, is one that is always in process—in other words, a lifelong learner. Not all adults, however, are open to learning, particularly in areas that may challenge previously held cherished "truths." This rejection or acceptance of information that challenges cherished "truth" is particularly visible in the stages of faith development proposed by James Fowler.<sup>507</sup> For example, people for whom Fowler's Stage 3 describes their level of faith development, find their locus of authority in "consensus of valued groups and in personally worthy representatives of belief-value traditions."<sup>508</sup> For Catholics, that authority would be the hierarchy of the Roman Catholic Church. Teaching from other than those authorities regarding matters of faith would more than likely suffer rejection as uninformed. In contrast, those whom Fowler includes in Stage 6 of faith development find their locus of authority "in a personal judgment informed by the experiences and truths of previous stages, purified of egoic striving, and linked by disciplined intuition to the principle of being."<sup>509</sup> Fowler says Stage 6 is extremely rare, and persons best described by it "have generated faith compositions in which their felt sense of an ultimate

---

<sup>503</sup> Fritjof Capra and David Steindl-Rast, *Belonging to the Universe* (San Francisco: Harper, 1991), 12.

<sup>504</sup> James Fowler, "Stages of Faith and Adults' Life Cycles," in *Faith Development in the Adult Life Cycle*, ed. Kenneth Stokes (NY: W.H. Sadlier, 1982), 179-207.

<sup>505</sup> Malcolm Knowles, "An Adult Educator's Reflections on Faith Development in the Adult Life Cycle," in *Faith Development in the Adult Life Cycle*, ed. Kenneth Stokes (New York: W.H. Sadlier, 1982), 64.

<sup>506</sup> Harry A. Overstreet, *The Mature Mind* (NY: W.W. Norton, 1949), 43; Knowles, "An Adult Educator's Reflections," 71.

<sup>507</sup> Fowler, "Stages of Faith.," James Fowler, *Stages of Faith* (San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1981).

<sup>508</sup> *Ibid.*, 189.

<sup>509</sup> *Ibid.*, 194.

environment is inclusive of all being. They have become incarnators and actualizers of the spirit of an inclusive and fulfilled human community.”<sup>510</sup>

### **A Structure for Exploration**

Chapter Five examines Pinkerton’s embrace of life and the world for revelation of her spirituality. Fowler’s Stages of Faith Development aid in recognition of an expanding spirituality. An account of Pinkerton’s experience with the Depression and a struggle of faith as an adolescent provide an indication of the way in which Pinkerton embraced life as a young person. Pinkerton’s experience as a new sister reveals maturing aspects of her spirituality.

Examples from her life as a mature woman religious, one who grows in knowledge and the wise use of it, illuminate Pinkerton’s embrace of challenging changes in the church, religious life, consciousness, and society. Finally, Pinkerton’s embrace of a universal community concludes the search for indications of her spirituality.

### **A Young Woman Embraces Life and the World**

Pinkerton did not experience personally deprivation or poverty during the Great Depression, but she witnessed poverty and embraced as her responsibility help for those who did. As a high school student, she volunteered with others to help clean and paint a house in a notoriously rough section of Cleveland. For a period of time, she withheld knowledge of her participation in this project from her parents lest they perceive the involvement too risky. The house, run by the Catholic Workers’ Movement, was a Hospitality House for the homeless for whom Pinkerton returned on Saturdays to cook meals. After more than a decade in Catholic schools, Pinkerton would have known well the scripture from Matthew 25: 40, “As often as you cared for the least of my brothers, that you did also for me.” She understood that message from scripture to be a directive for her, and she acted. One other teaching she struggled with, however.

Pinkerton recalled that in her adolescent years, she questioned how she could ever emulate Mary, the mother of Jesus, as Catholic girls were supposed to do. Pinkerton said, “As I went plodding along my bumpy road to becoming what I thought Jesus wanted me to be, I wondered what impact she [Mary] had on me.”<sup>511</sup> According to Pinkerton, a scripture scholar who stressed the concept of freedom helped her realize an informed freedom from which Mary agreed to be the mother of Jesus. Mary’s act was not one of “passive acquiescence,” an act that probably would be abhorrent to Pinkerton. Pinkerton said, “He [the scripture scholar] stressed that upon the degree of one’s freedom as person, largely depends one’s growth in Christ Jesus and one’s ability to be called forth by Him as Mary was.”<sup>512</sup> Pinkerton understood that Mary had the freedom to refuse, but had she refused, Pinkerton said, “She [Mary] would never had known the fullness of person to which she was called.”<sup>513</sup> Applying that lesson to the twentieth century, Pinkerton continued, “Like her, if we do not exercise responsible freedom, we will not know the depths of relationship with Him to which each of is called....”<sup>514</sup> Examination of these two

---

<sup>510</sup> Ibid., 193.

<sup>511</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Untitled" (St. Angela Merici, May, 1976e), 1.

<sup>512</sup> Pinkerton, "Untitled," 2.

<sup>513</sup> Ibid.

<sup>514</sup> Ibid.

events reveals some characteristics of Pinkerton's embrace of life as a young person. Pinkerton reflected, questioned, sought to learn, valued freedom of choice, and applied the lessons of her faith in active participation.

### **A Young Sister Embraces the Dark**

The early part of religious life Pinkerton described as a dark night of the soul,<sup>515</sup> and she questioned her decision to enter religious life. The sisters who had been her lifelong teachers, whom she had admired as role models in their joyful embrace of teaching, lived lives of rigidity beyond Pinkerton's imagination. How did Pinkerton choose to embrace this way of life that she couldn't understand? She could have left; her parents had told her repeatedly that she was welcome at home anytime. Indeed, Pinkerton admits she almost left several times, but "something" kept her there. The "something" she described simply as an interior sense that this was the place where she was supposed to be.<sup>516</sup> She stayed and mostly adhered to the rigid rules covering every aspect of daily life but she never stopped questioning or listening to her inner voice. Pinkerton struggled to unify opposites in the behavior and beliefs of women religious.

Once when the sisters were required to attend a retreat—a retreat, according to Pinkerton, led by a priest "with all the theology of a second grade first communicant"—Pinkerton decided after a short time that she could listen no longer.<sup>517</sup> So she slipped unnoticed out the rear door and crossed the grounds to attend another retreat. Among the retreatants there, Pinkerton spied Mother Margaret Mary, the Superior of the convent, who also had slipped out of the other retreat. Pinkerton did not let herself be seen, but her willfulness surfaced for all that evening at supper. The other sisters were planning their answers to a question posed by the priest, and Pinkerton, completely unaware of the question, of course, had no answer to give. Pinkerton readily admitted that she went to another retreat. The sister in charge said she would have to report this disobedience to Mother Margaret Mary. To which, Pinkerton replied, "Very well, but Mother was there, too!"<sup>518</sup>

Hungry for contact with the outside world, Pinkerton, whose assignment was to pick up and deliver the sisters' mail, used to sit in the tunnel on the grounds and read all the magazines in the mail before delivering them to the sisters. She said, "They were all the same magazines my father read."<sup>519</sup> Intellectual curiosity overcame discretion in that instance, but Pinkerton apparently embraced life on the outside (of the convent) as well as on the inside.

Pinkerton seemed to embrace the rigid life as new sister with faith that things she didn't understand would somehow be revealed if only she waited through them. Pinkerton remembers one particular struggle as a young religious: "of responding deeply during retreat to the essential truth—it is the love of Christ that has brought us together in community."<sup>520</sup> This teaching "clashed with reality in her experience of community living," and Pinkerton says, "I was ultimately forced to accept the unpleasant fact that in the ordinary-day-to-day grind the

---

<sup>515</sup> The phrase "dark night of the soul" refers to the poem of that title written by Saint John of the Cross (1542-1591), a Spanish mystic and poet. The dark night of the soul is a time of purification of the soul—a time often accompanied by feelings of absolute aloneness and despair when nothing makes sense. The mystic, St. John of the Cross, described this period as a necessary step on the spiritual journey to a mystical union with God.

<sup>516</sup> Interview with Pinkerton on July 31, 1995 in Onset, Massachusetts.

<sup>517</sup> Conversation with Pinkerton on February 4, 1996, at home of researcher in Falls Church, VA.

<sup>518</sup> Ibid.

<sup>519</sup> Ibid.

<sup>520</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Integration: Prayer and the Local Community" (Dubuque, Iowa, no date given, 1976k), 2.

‘structures’ of religious life were more important than the ‘spirit’ of it [religious life].”<sup>521</sup>  
Pinkerton further elaborated:

In practical matters the principle seemed pretty much to be: we have an important job to do for God; how can we best ‘order our lives’ that we may do it well? It was out of this mentality, apostolic though it may be, highly motivated by love of God as it surely was, that our religious structures took shape. A pattern of life that should have been geared to forming apostolic persons tended rather to perfect an apostolic machine.”<sup>522</sup>

Pinkerton allowed her faith to be experiential even in its darkest moments, while continuing to embrace life with intellectual curiosity. Fowler says in this stage of faith development one is “alive to paradox and the truth in apparent contradictions,” and the person in this stage is “ready for closeness to that which is different and threatening to self and outlook (including new depths of experience and religious revelation).”<sup>523</sup> According to Fowler, a danger arises in this stage of faith development—the danger of “a paralyzing passivity or inaction, giving rise to complacency or cynical withdrawal”,<sup>524</sup> but we shall see this was not the case with Pinkerton.

### **A Mature Woman Religious Embraces Change.**

Still using Overstreet’s understanding of maturity as a process of growing in knowledge and the wise use of it, we see Pinkerton’s embrace of life and the world become stronger and richer. Overstreet says the mature person is rather a *maturing* person—“one whose *linkages with life* are constantly becoming stronger and richer because his attitudes are such as to encourage their growth rather than their stoppage.”<sup>525</sup>

Gradually, following the humanistic psychology movement and, later, Vatican Council II, Pinkerton said the sisters began to move away from a grace-salvation centered spirituality, “a kind of Jesus and me spirituality.”<sup>526</sup> The sisters moved toward a philosophy that Pinkerton described as “grounded in God in the deep levels of our being, but . . . radically relational and profoundly human.”<sup>527</sup> According to Pinkerton, religious communities began to understand the mission of Jesus as “enfleshed in the world, situated in the religious, social, economic and political structures which human beings create as they attempt to organize and control the world. Our mission springs to life in the midst of the people, in encounters with men and women who were formerly shut out from our safe conventual life.”<sup>528</sup>

Through personalism stressed in humanistic psychology, the women religious sought to be in touch with their own persons, to be women of integrity and responsibility. When wholeness became the emphasis in formation, Pinkerton said the sisters were like “a new wine that cannot

---

<sup>521</sup> Ibid.

<sup>522</sup> Ibid.

<sup>523</sup> Fowler, "Stages of Faith," 191.

<sup>524</sup> Fowler, "Stages of Faith," 191.

<sup>525</sup> Overstreet, *The Mature Mind*, 3; Knowles, "An Adult Educator's Reflections," 71.

<sup>526</sup> Pinkerton, "Justice and the Poor," 2.

<sup>527</sup> Ibid.

<sup>528</sup> Ibid.

be contained in old wineskins.”<sup>529</sup> Structures of religious life, the old wineskin, could not contain the new life.

Pinkerton remembered personalism from an earlier period, however:

Anyone who read *The Catholic Worker* back in the ‘30s imbibed personalism from the pen of Peter Maurin, the colorful French ‘personalist teacher’ of Dorothy Day and co-founder with her of the Catholic Worker Movement. His terse essays, graphically set forth in pointed phrases, would draw your attention the minute you opened your weekly issue; and, if you were a people-person by nature, you fed yourself on his bread gladly. And if you did, then in the ‘40s and ‘50s your person-centered thinking and love-directed mode of acting frequently clashed with the static structure-centered thinking and legalistic-directed decisions of not only some administrators but of many professional associates.<sup>530</sup>

This issue of personalism signified a major switch from spirituality as denial of self to spirituality as delight: “delight,” as Joan Chittister, OSB<sup>531</sup> writes, “in the people we serve, delight in the things we do, delight in the spiritual life itself.”<sup>532</sup> Personalism stressed recognition of the unique gifts given by the Creator to each woman for the transformation of society, recognition of the parts of one’s personality that prevented the full flowering of those gifts, and the process of becoming free to be the one called by God to be. The concept of freedom reappears, freedom to become the person one is called to be. Pinkerton spoke often about this process of “coming to the fullness of human growth and fulfillment.”<sup>533</sup> To know the will of God for oneself in community requires the balance of solitude, deep, personal, loving relationships with others, a “poverty of spirit” and courage.<sup>534</sup> Solitude provided a time for self-reflection entered into with what Pinkerton called a poverty of spirit. Poverty of spirit, as spoken of by Pinkerton, is an agenda-free openness to revelation. Pinkerton explains, “If I am already filled with theories, convictions, opinions, there is no space for me to listen, to discover the mysteries of life and of God...I cannot receive the gift which is the other...because my heart is not open.”<sup>535</sup>

To approach self-reflection filled with opinions, convictions, etc., Robert Grudin refers to as *taking oneself along*.<sup>536</sup> According to Grudin, “Inner change, ...growth is difficult, if not impossible, if one ‘takes oneself along;’ that is, if one confronts every new situation with an armored identity, imposing a familiar perspective on unfamiliar events.”<sup>537</sup> Grudin, an advocate of self-reflection, says self-inquiry can be effective if we “renounce the goal of some designated product in favor of an ongoing process of discovery.”<sup>538</sup> The reward in doing so, he says, is a new perspective of “one’s own multiplicity and capacity for change,” “an ability to identify and

---

<sup>529</sup> Pinkerton, "Integration," 5.

<sup>530</sup> Pinkerton, "Integration," 5.

<sup>531</sup> Order of Saint Benedict (Benedictine Sisters)

<sup>532</sup> Chittister, "Climbing the Eight Mountains of Religious Life," 29.

<sup>533</sup> Pinkerton, "Justice and the Poor," 9.

<sup>534</sup> Pinkerton, "Prayer and New Ministry," 20.

<sup>535</sup> Pinkerton, "Justice and the Poor," 3.

<sup>536</sup> Grudin, *On dialogue*, 198.

<sup>537</sup> Grudin, *On Dialogue*, 198.

<sup>538</sup> *Ibid.*, 199.

reduce the forces that produce knee-jerk, self-limiting responses,” and an ability to “discover and try to heal the conflicts that produce self-defeating patterns”.<sup>539</sup>

Pinkerton also noted that poverty of spirit was a fruit of authentic renewal,<sup>540</sup> a grace that enabled one to receive the other, “whether the other be God, nature, a friend, a culture, group....”<sup>541</sup> Truly receiving the other, Pinkerton says, “...means more than being mindful of God and His glorious creation (persons, gifts of nature); it means more than being concerned. It [truly receiving the other] means taking them to heart--...making them part of self. I communicate and enter into communication with. I create the climate in which another can be liberated.”<sup>542</sup>

### Creating the Climate in Which Another Can Be Liberated

As structure-centered religious living continued to shift to person-centered living, many sisters began to desire more person-centered communal prayer. Friction developed between those sisters who wanted a praying fellowship and the sisters who wanted rote prayers said in union. According to Pinkerton, the CSJ leadership then offered a wide range of choices as to number in the group, location, kind of authority, and prayer desires and let the membership participate accordingly. Those in leadership desired to honor each sister’s needs with a flexible structure that would prevent feelings of isolation or alienation for anyone. The plan succeeded beyond anything the women had envisioned. Pinkerton reported, “As a result of this person-centered planning, warm human relations became an outstanding characteristic of every house...creating an outstanding pervasive atmosphere of joy.”<sup>543</sup>

At a gathering of women religious in Dubuque, Pinkerton read from the report of this experiment the description and effect of the joy:

And now something remarkable happened: out of this joy of togetherness sprang, unexpectedly, a readiness for genuine solitude. We are dealing here with an existential fact: the joy-effect of togetherness seemed to be a necessary condition for the flowering of the deeper joy of solitude. Some sisters came to a House of Prayer this summer hurt, wounded, even warped, through frustrations in trying to live community; they came to be healed, and they were. Solitude was unbearable to them until they had experienced the healing power of a warm, supportive community. The poet says that ‘man on the way to silence stops to hear and see.’ It would seem that this summer, sisters on the way to solitude had to stop and drink in and taste deeply human togetherness.<sup>544</sup>

Slowly, but steadily, faith sharing and subjective prayer became more and more a part of the sisters’ spirituality. Pinkerton, who tends to be one of the first to embrace reflected-upon change, described the old objective prayer done in unison as “beautiful in its time.” However, she pointed out, “It is a law of creativity that once an art form has been brought to perfection, there are only two paths open....” One can either “go on marking time with the old form, trying

---

<sup>539</sup> Ibid., 199-200.

<sup>540</sup> Pinkerton, "Justice and the Poor," 3.

<sup>541</sup> Ibid.

<sup>542</sup> Ibid.

<sup>543</sup> Pinkerton, "Integration," 20.

<sup>544</sup> Congregation of Saint Joseph, *Exploring Inner Space* (Ohio, 1969); Pinkerton, "Integration," 20.

to inject new life into it by ingenious ways, or...strike out on an entirely new path with a diametrically-opposed form.”<sup>545</sup>

### Liberation Begets More Change and More Friction

Interpersonal relations among women religious were still in a hesitant, infant stage of development, however. According to Pinkerton, in the 1940s and ‘50s, “interpersonal relations were not only discouraged, they were nearly forbidden.”<sup>546</sup> Pinkerton said many elements in the sisters’ training and in the structures of living together had militated against normal, human, interpersonal relations.<sup>547</sup> Remembering how Sister Margaret Brennan, a leader in spiritual renewal, once described their dilemma, Pinkerton said:

If we prayed too much, we were a bit suspect because we should be working. On the other hand, if we gave ourselves too much to our students, to the people for whom we worked, if we stayed out too long or were a bit too popular, that was a problem, too, because we should be home in the convent. Thank God that innumerable women religious kept their cool, as it were and, after weathering novitiate restrictions followed their intuition rather than the masculine logic of spiritual books. If this were not the case, we would not have so many dynamic women religious today leading the way in spiritual renewal.<sup>548</sup>

Each person and each community has a unique rhythm for integrating change, a phenomenon that can cause friction in groups. For Pinkerton, the call of Pope John XXIII to a new Pentecost “was like bursting of chains and an opening of doors, such as Peter must have experienced when the angel released him from prison.”<sup>549</sup> For others, Vatican II ushered in a period of dislocation, loss, confusion, even wandering.<sup>550</sup> Everything familiar and thought to be unchangeable was now changing. Many women religious left religious life, unable or unwilling to accept the renewal. Pinkerton, on the other hand, told a group of Catholic school educators the renewal was:

A plan, a vision that has been obscured time and again in the evolution of the world’s history. But it’s like that piece of a jigsaw puzzle that makes all the difference in the picture. Events and men have a way of obscuring the plan and action of God. [He said,] ‘I came that all might have life and have it more abundantly.’<sup>551</sup>

Pinkerton seemed to have a sense of history and an on-going revelation of God throughout history.

### Educating Educators in the Embrace of Life

---

<sup>545</sup> Pinkerton, "Integration," 5.

<sup>546</sup> Pinkerton, "Integration," 17.

<sup>547</sup> Ibid., 18.

<sup>548</sup> Ibid.

<sup>549</sup> Ibid., 6.

<sup>550</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Focusing Ministry for Our Times," *LCWR Newsletter* 9, no. 2 (April 1981): 1.

<sup>551</sup> "I come that..." John 10:10, Pinkerton, "The Meaning of Renewal to the Teacher."

In the tumultuous time of the '60s, Pinkerton advised frustrated teachers of skeptical students: "Love the youngsters as individuals and respect them."<sup>552</sup> Pinkerton's advice reflects an experiential, inclusive spirituality, as she explained, "Christ never let anyone close to His divinity until they had first accepted humanity."<sup>553</sup> Stated another way, humanity, no matter how personally annoying, can never be disregarded as "other," if one wants to find God. On the same theme, Pinkerton told another group of educators that the youngsters before them were responsive to "the sacred, to contemplation, to searching," and "were hungry for truth and love."<sup>554</sup> "They [the students] cannot be fed a religion that takes priority over Christian living, that refuses to hear the questions so basic to its search."<sup>555</sup> Pinkerton reminded the educators of the example of Jesus:

Christ always satisfied the need or answered the question as a takeoff. 'Master, what about the coin?' 'They have no wine.' 'Lord, that I may see...' 'Master, where dwellest Thee?' 'Master, what is the greatest of these commandments?' He always took people in the situation they were in and satisfied their longing for the kingdom of peace, truth and justice. He was constantly opening their eyes to the possibility of transforming the work-a-day commonplace world of their era, seeing beyond the situation to its ultimate meaning.<sup>556</sup>

According to Pinkerton, the key word was *process*: "It's not a package you can wrap up and give. True communication of the Gospel means making possible a decision for or against it."<sup>557</sup> Throughout Pinkerton's life the process of freely making a decision surfaces as important. Pinkerton posed some difficult questions to the educators: "How do you define faith? What do you look upon as lack of faith? Non-assistance at a meaningless liturgy? Do you accept the child's right not to accept your way of faith? Do you allow the faith of others to take a different course? Do you clutter the child with answers before you've heard the questions?"<sup>558</sup> Then Pinkerton told the educators if they were going to teach human beings to become whole personalities, "able to be still and wonder, to live and love nature as reflecting God, to live the dark journeys as part of the one journey leading to fullness of life," they themselves had to be whole.<sup>559</sup> "Those who stand before youngsters today to proclaim the Gospel," continued Pinkerton, "must be fully human, or they cannot be fully Christian."<sup>560</sup> Examination of Pinkerton's advice to the educators through Fowler's stages of faith development illuminates a locus of authority in "dialectical joining of judgment-experience processes with reflective claims of others and of various expressions of cumulative human wisdom."<sup>561</sup>

---

<sup>552</sup> Pinkerton, "The Meaning of Renewal to the Teacher."

<sup>553</sup> Ibid.

<sup>554</sup> Pinkerton, "A Picture of the Contemporary Situation."

<sup>555</sup> Ibid.

<sup>556</sup> Ibid.

<sup>557</sup> Pinkerton, "A Picture of the Contemporary Situation,"

<sup>558</sup> Ibid.

<sup>559</sup> Ibid.

<sup>560</sup> Ibid.

<sup>561</sup> Fowler, "Stages of Faith," 192.

## Embracing the Process of Becoming Fully Human

Turmoil and confusion often reigned in community life, also, as the women struggled to understand what “fully human” meant and how interpersonal relations integrated one into community. They had called community what they always had, and this new structure was completely different. Pinkerton likened the period to a time of exodus, “moving from a church and society that was familiar and secure and into new forms not clearly mapped out for us. “The evolutionary process of integration in community is not automatic,” Pinkerton said, citing William Johnston.<sup>562</sup> William Johnston, SJ,<sup>563</sup> according to Pinkerton, said the process “...must be carried forth by men and women in an ongoing dialogue with one another and with the world.” Meditation was a key factor in dialogue and even, “in the march forward of humanity.”<sup>564</sup> According to Johnston, “...the meditator or the mystic, going beyond thoughts and concepts and images to a deeper level of awareness, finds himself in an ever growing union with the universe and with others—a union which is enacted at the core of his being.”<sup>565</sup>

The education-oriented community combined dialogue and meditation in guided retreats, workshops on prayer, on spiritual direction—all focusing on spiritual growth. Additionally, they offered sensitivity training, workshops on interpersonal relations, on human sexuality, on “affirmation of the person through an understanding of self-defeating behavior.”<sup>566</sup> The women grew in self-identity and acceptance of diversity. Experiments with new types of governance brought more into positions of responsibility, and new competent leaders emerged.<sup>567</sup>

## Embracing Societal Challenges through Responsible Freedom

The theme of responsible freedom arises again in Pinkerton’s talks. When women religious felt powerless to make changes for the common good in light of the complexity of world problems, Pinkerton reminded them of the presence of God’s life within every person to “direct our existence and our activity in the world towards the definitive fulfillment of humankind.”<sup>568</sup> Pinkerton called this a presence and direction that “radicalizes our responsibility to be serious actors in the area of history transforming the world in Christ,” and said:

It is in the dialogue between the absolute freedom of God and in His Self-communication to each of us and our responsible freedom before the call of His love that the Kingdom of God will come. Our radical involvement in the tasks of the world is an imperative..<sup>569</sup>

---

<sup>562</sup> William Johnston, *Silent Music: The Science of Meditation* (NY: Harper & Row, 1974), 173; Pinkerton, "Integration," 22.

<sup>563</sup> Society of Jesus, members of which are known as Jesuits.

<sup>564</sup> Johnston, *Silent Music*, 173; Pinkerton, "Integration," 22.

<sup>565</sup> Ibid.

<sup>566</sup> Pinkerton, "Integration," 21.

<sup>567</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "The Transferability of the Principles of Organizational Development Employed by Renewing Religious Communities" (Think Tank on Organizational Development, Cleveland, OH, 9-12 August, 1976g), 13.

<sup>568</sup> Pinkerton, "NAWR: A Vision for the Future," 4.

<sup>569</sup> Ibid.

Pinkerton's spirituality of freedom in Christ is paradoxical in the sense that the seemingly unfree act of allowing Jesus full possession, for her, radically expands spirituality into "an active, dynamic, questioning, critiquing" relationship.<sup>570</sup> Because "God is made manifest in the signs of the times and in those with and among we live," Pinkerton said, "Obedience then requires not doing what another says, but rather requires communication, dialogue, listening, mutual search, openness—a dialogical spirituality."<sup>571</sup> Relationship is seen here as dialogic and free in nature. To Pinkerton, God is a God of freedom, a freedom, she says, that is "both relational and radical."<sup>572</sup> It is freeing in the sense that "the choice to be in relationship with Him is ours and that the choice for relationship gives one radical internal freedom "that is operative even in situations where exterior restraints limit the right to do what one chooses."<sup>573</sup>

This freedom, Pinkerton says, "is a challenge for us to be for others as Jesus was for us," and coupled with the freedom we enjoy in this country, gives U. S. Catholics "awesome responsibilities individually and collectively." She explains, "As citizens of a world power which in a real sense can effect the humanization or oppression of peoples... we must respond as persons who profess faith in the Lord Jesus Resurrected."<sup>574</sup> "Whenever evil exists in our midst and we do not name it or try to work against it, we reinforce and validate it," Pinkerton says.<sup>575</sup> Some of the evils Pinkerton named include: "allowing the elderly to be treated as unnecessary," "building in the name of national security the largest and deadliest arsenal of weapons in the world," "arming other nations," "teaching other nations the art of killing one another," and "believing that people wouldn't be poor if they worked."<sup>576</sup> To those who lamented the prevalence of violence in society, Pinkerton reminded them to look beyond the acts "to the WHY," and when they began to see "poverty, lack of education, racism, sexism, classism, unjust foreign policy, unfair trade as causes of violence," then they would know the need to take action for change.<sup>577</sup>

Pinkerton urged women religious to learn social analysis of systems: "Such development of a critical conscience in the light of gospel values must become the art of the one who ministers out of the justice agenda."<sup>578</sup> But intellectual analysis wasn't enough, she told them; "to serve means experiencing some of what those you serve experience." Pinkerton pointed out, "One who truly ministers in the name of the poor Jesus is credible only in terms of how her life reflects the discipline of enoughness or the asceticism of simplicity."<sup>579</sup> "Analysis and experience should then be followed by intense reflection," added Pinkerton. "What is Jesus saying to me/us in all of this?"<sup>580</sup> According to Pinkerton, "Congregations and individuals who have allowed the Lord to pass through them in these ways of analysis, experience, theological and scriptural reflection on the global reality, indicate that the primary ministry agenda for the foreseeable future may indeed be the focusing of ministry and resources of time, talent, funds, and land on the economically poor."<sup>581</sup> Pinkerton said the women should not fear to "rock the boat," be called

---

<sup>570</sup> Ibid., 1.

<sup>571</sup> Pinkerton, "Ministry and Spirituality," 9.

<sup>572</sup> Pinkerton, "NAWR: A Vision for the Future," 2.

<sup>573</sup> Ibid., 3.

<sup>574</sup> Ibid., 8.

<sup>575</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Untitled" (St. Paschal Baylon, 5 April, 1984b), 4.

<sup>576</sup> Pinkerton, "Untitled," 4-5.

<sup>577</sup> Ibid., 7.

<sup>578</sup> Pinkerton, "Focusing Ministry," 2.

<sup>579</sup> Ibid.

<sup>580</sup> Ibid.

<sup>581</sup> Pinkerton, "Focusing Ministry," 2.

different, and be seen as radical. They should remember, “Jesus was in the true sense radical, rooted in the mission of His Father. He questioned systems. He worked with some and denounced others. Are we equal to such a challenge as a community of prophecy?”<sup>582</sup>

### Embracing the Raised Consciousness of Feminism

“Maleness and femaleness are physiological; masculinity and femininity are cultural designations,” Pinkerton told students at John Carroll University.<sup>583</sup> “The Church,” Pinkerton continued, “relies on cultural designations in its treatment of women when clearly scripture reports male and female as made in God’s image.”<sup>584</sup> Pinkerton recalled the words of St. Paul who said all are baptized in Christ, and there are no more distinctions between male and female. She related the inequality of women in church and in society to the whole issue of human rights and even saw the inequality of women as a model for all types of oppression.<sup>585</sup> The Sisters of Saint Joseph of Cleveland, Pinkerton said, expressed a concern with the wholeness of humanity, “the full stature of every person, male and female, their probing beyond their stereotypes and restrictions to a fullness of human consciousness yet unrealized.”<sup>586</sup>

### Grounding the Embrace in the Present

Women religious who asked Pinkerton if she thought religious life had a future, heard the reply: “The more Gospel question is, ‘What do we do with the present so as to make a difference?’ What is asked of us now that cannot be asked of anyone else for reason of the very identity and maturity we have as women religious in this country?”<sup>587</sup> In the keynote address at a national gathering of the Congregation of Saint Joseph, Pinkerton spoke frankly about lamenting “the demise of religious life:”

I look upon our penchant for pathologizing about the future of religious life as a slap in the face of the Holy Spirit. Instead of asking, what are the causes of our diminishment? Why are we failing to attract new members? Are we dying? Can we die gracefully? We need to stop pathologizing and begin re-mythologizing. There is a world out there that is falling apart; a world which cannot take time to plan its future and is hungering for what we have. That conflicted reality in need of reconciliation is the imminent place of God and the source of our future. Can we see it?<sup>588</sup>

Pinkerton’s embrace of life and the world reflects the belief that God is always calling one to minister. To hear that call, one must not worry about future security.

---

<sup>582</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Broadening the View of Parish" (Resurrection Community, 16 March, 1981f), 4.

<sup>583</sup> Pinkerton, "Talk to Students," 3.

<sup>584</sup> Ibid.

<sup>585</sup> Ibid.

<sup>586</sup> Catherine Pinkerton, "Call to Assembly" (Cleveland, Ohio, 1980i), 2.

<sup>587</sup> Pinkerton, "Justice and the Poor," 2.

<sup>588</sup> This article is edited from Pinkerton's keynote address delivered at the United States Federation of the Sisters of Saint Joseph, National Event held in Philadelphia in July, 1995 Catherine Pinkerton, "Membership," Box 2-9-1 (Cleveland, Ohio; Sisters of Saint Joseph Mother House Archives, November 2, 1996, 1996), 1.

## Embracing the Future

While Pinkerton sees clearly the global problems and inequities, she is hopeful that a healthy, vital, human global community is possible. She refers to the world reality as “a moment in salvation history.”<sup>589</sup> Undaunted by the complexity of problems, Pinkerton says, “We can no longer look at the quality of our persons, our lives together, our prayer/spirituality, our service of and by themselves, but always in the context of the interdependent space we share and the people whom we are with, everyone who inhabits this diminishing planet, Mother Earth.”<sup>590</sup>

Pinkerton recognizes a hegemony of free market capitalism, the growing disparity “between the haves and the have-nots,” and the “destruction of the environment for greater corporate profit,” but she embraces and urges others to embrace the job of social reform.<sup>591</sup> She explains the root of her conviction:

Properly understood, the Gospel is a **RADICAL SOCIAL MOVEMENT!** Jesus fought the prevailing attitudes of His time. He tried to teach another way of thinking and being and acting. His whole mission was about transformation in order to bring fullness of life. He came, not to die for us, as we were so well drilled,<sup>592</sup> but to give life and to continue to give life through us.... We are called to really put on Christ, to be Christ, the life-giver for our times.... Every great spirituality is born within the great historical moment of the age in which it is formulated. The concrete forms of the following of Christ are connected with those moments.<sup>593</sup>

Pinkerton told a group of women religious that there are three requirements for transformation of the global reality: (a) contemplation/theological reflection, (b) systemic thinking, and (c) action for systemic change.<sup>594</sup> For Pinkerton, all authentic contemplation ends with action for transformation. The action, she said, should be for the human dignity of those persons “caught in poverty and oppression, in the violence of the home or workplace, in child prostitution or child labor, in prisons and refugee camps, or in the violent squalor of our central cities”.... “But,” continued Pinkerton:

It is not their human dignity alone which we must seek to address. We must also address the human dignity of those who have sold their humanity, their potential for human greatness, sacrificed their moral values, trampled under foot any ethical considerations in the process of exercising power over people, making judgments that are driven by greed, developing strategies that lead to unbridled competition, living lives of consumption.

They have no compunction about their corporate decisions made with access to power and technology, decisions which move workers and families around the world OR seek out cheap labor in another nation in order to make production more profitable. We know

---

<sup>589</sup> Pinkerton, "Global Spirituality," 7.

<sup>590</sup> Pinkerton, "Call to Assembly," 1.

<sup>591</sup> Pinkerton, "Global Spirituality," 5, 15.

<sup>592</sup> Father Ed Kelly told Catholics in a 1997 Good Friday homily the teaching that Jesus came to die for us was bad theology. Jesus came that we might have life and have it abundantly, Father Kelly said, and the religious and political authorities had him killed. (Our Lady Queen of Peace Catholic Church, Arlington, VA)

<sup>593</sup> Pinkerton, "Global Spirituality," 15, 17.

<sup>594</sup> *Ibid.*, 27.

that they transfer trillions of dollars in investments daily within the flick of an eyelash—most of which enrich the few and consign innumerable families and communities to poverty and devastation....

We need to touch into their evolution as human beings, to challenge them. What brought them to this level of consummate greed often couched in what they would term “good intentions?”<sup>595</sup>

Pinkerton’s spirituality embraces all—those whose human dignity has been denied and those who contributed to the denial, either knowingly or unknowingly. She urged the women religious also to help heal the divisions that separate people of differing races and cultures and help others gain “a new radically different vision of the way people might live with each other and enrich each other by their very uniqueness.”<sup>596</sup>

“The same is true in religious pluralism,” Pinkerton says.... “We need to go beyond denominationalism to that deep core of spirituality at the heart of humanity made in God’s image and likeness.”<sup>597</sup> Pinkerton warned that “unwillingness or temerity in working to become multiracial, multicultural, multireligious societies will stunt the development of a global spirituality.”<sup>598</sup> To those who thought the development of a global spirituality was overwhelming, Pinkerton replied, “Not in community! Each of us makes her/his own contribution not only out of the movement of the Spirit within, but also with the Spirit active within the community.”<sup>599</sup>

Clearly in possession of a “felt participation in a power that unifies and transforms the world,” one of the characteristics of Stage 6 in Fowler’s development of faith model, Pinkerton has a sense of an ultimate inclusive, universal community.<sup>600</sup> Fowler says those who reach Stage 6 of faith development are persons of universalizing faith, and they are “‘contagious’ in the sense that they create zones of liberation from the social, political, economic, and ideological shackles we place and endure on human futurity.”<sup>601</sup>

Pinkerton’s “shed shackles” show in this dream she shared with other women religious. The heart and spirit of an educator also shows:

...I envision a time soon when men and women religious across the globe will convene a huge global meeting or retreat—comparable to Copenhagen and Beijing—in which we come together to share our knowledge of all the aspects of globalization. How do we together define our mission in this ever-expanding global and planetary reality which offers the possibility of Christ’s prayer ‘that they all may be one’. How can we listen together to what the Spirit asks of us at this moment? What a wake-up call such a mass meeting would be for the globe! Such a teachable moment!<sup>602</sup>

---

<sup>595</sup> Pinkerton, "Global Spirituality," 22-23.

<sup>596</sup> *Ibid.*, 24.

<sup>597</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>598</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>599</sup> *Ibid.*, 26.

<sup>600</sup> Fowler, "Stages of Faith," 193.

<sup>601</sup> Fowler, "Stages of Faith," 193.

<sup>602</sup> Pinkerton, "Global Spirituality," 29.

## The Wholeness of Pinkerton's Spirituality

Our look at the ways in which Pinkerton embraces life and the world reveals a wholeness to her spirituality. Let us examine the findings in light of contemporary authors' calls for a return to the common good that were reported in Chapter One. Martin Marty advises every citizen "who wishes to participate in American life" to "start talking, hearing and keep talking."<sup>603</sup> Marcus Raskin urges an "empathic awareness of the Other, whether nature, animal, or the person."<sup>604</sup> John M. Bryson and Barbara C. Crosby see a need to share power in confronting public problems and a need to encourage motivation of others to pursue the common good.<sup>605</sup> George Rupp says we must counter individualism and urges religious communities to focus on a spirituality "concerned with corporate historical life."<sup>606</sup> A study by Daloz, et al. of a group of people with a long term commitment to the common good revealed themes of community, compassion, conviction, courage, confession and commitment. Findings revealed that these people had a broad awareness of connectedness and interrelatedness.<sup>607</sup>

This look at Pinkerton's spirituality reveals every component associated with a commitment to the common good that these authors name. Pinkerton embraces those in religious life, both her own community and others, the laity, U.S. senators and congressmen, and her God in dialogic relationships. She embraces participation in U.S. civic life, at age 77 still pounding the halls of Congress for social justice more than a decade after the usual retirement age. She encourages others to embrace responsible freedom and get involved in civic life.

Pinkerton's embrace of feminism, while belonging to a patriarchal church that expands and restricts opportunity to serve on the basis of gender, shows courage born of conviction. She is a woman of action who asks, "What do we do with the present so as to make a difference?"<sup>608</sup> Pinkerton embraces the world and the universe with an awareness of the interconnectedness of all creation. She envisions a world community working together for the common good of the planet and all in it. Pinkerton's spirituality is inclusive—an embrace of all as integral to the common good. Each person's vision and action is needed because it is in dialogic action together that justice is accomplished.

Finally, Pinkerton's embrace of life illuminates an interrelatedness of intellect, emotions, body, and spirit. Pinkerton engages her intellect in social analysis, her emotions in empathic concern for those deprived unjustly of human dignity and those who deprive, her body in action, and her spirit in reflective, dialogic relationship with her God and her community. Pinkerton's spirituality is whole. Her embrace of life and the world "incarnates and actualizes the spirit of an inclusive and fulfilled human community."<sup>609</sup>

---

<sup>603</sup> Marty, *The One and the Many*, 225.

<sup>604</sup> Raskin, *The Common Good: Its Politics, Policies, and Philosophy*, 326.

<sup>605</sup> Bryson and Crosby, *Leadership for the Common Good*.

<sup>606</sup> Rupp, *Commitment and Community*, 77, 81.

<sup>607</sup> Daloz, Keen, et al., *Common Fire*, 17.

<sup>608</sup> Pinkerton, "Commencement Address," 2.

<sup>609</sup> This is James Fowler's description of Stage 6 faith development, a stage Fowler says is rarely reached Fowler, "Stages of Faith," 193.

## CHAPTER VI

### RECONCILIATION: THE WHOLE CLOTH

In this study, the literature reviews of the common good and transpersonal psychology uncovered the themes of dialogue, participation, inclusivity and spirituality. The study of Pinkerton's education and later educational outreach revealed the same themes. Each theme has been singled out and examined individually in the preceding chapters. The researcher sequenced the chapters in the order that she became aware of these themes in Pinkerton's life. Awareness of dialogue and action surfaced first—both from observation of Pinkerton's interaction with others and from copies of her speeches. Next, inclusivity stood out, particularly in the accounts of personalism or psychotherapeutic thought of the humanistic psychology movement and the women's movement. Finally, the researcher realized that Pinkerton's spirituality—her faith-filled way of embracing life and the world—encompassed and permeated each of the themes. Now, using reconciliation, the charism of Pinkerton's religious community, as a theme for the final chapter, the individual themes are reconciled in their interaction and educational significance in shaping a life committed to the common good. Reconciliation implies an 'as-meant-to-be' wholeness.

First, an analogy of weaving a seamless garment describes the wholeness of Pinkerton's life. Next, a brief chronological revisiting of Pinkerton's life allows the reader to view the development of an extraordinary commitment to the common good through a Deweyan lens of education—education that is continuous, participative, and experiential. A connection of Pinkerton's education with educational processes advocated by Jack Mezirow, Stephen Brookfield, and Paulo Freire follows, and a citation from a 1976 talk given by Pinkerton reveals an interaction of mind, body, and spirit in a life of ministry. This ministry flows from a truly radical, relational freedom that emanates from a wisdom within. The chapter concludes with the significance of this study for the field of adult education.

#### **The Wholeness of Pinkerton's Life**

Reconciliation of the themes in Pinkerton's life brought the analogy of a seamless garment or whole cloth to mind. The seamless garment image comes from John 19:23-24:

After the soldiers had crucified Jesus they took his garments and divided them four ways, one for each soldier. There was also his tunic, but this tunic was woven in one piece from top to bottom and had no seam. They said to each other, "We should not tear it. Let us throw dice to see who gets it."<sup>610</sup>

The significance of the seamless garment, according to William Barclay, is that it describes the linen tunic that the high priest wore. Barclay says, "The function of the priest was to be the liaison between God and man. The Latin for priest is *pontifex*, which means *bridge-builder*."<sup>611</sup> Current Christian teaching regarding the sacredness of all life gives contemporary significance to the seamless garment image. To those who oppose abortion as

---

<sup>610</sup> *New American Bible*, 136.

<sup>611</sup> William Barclay, *The Gospel of John*, The Daily Study Bible Series, vol. 2 (Philadelphia, PA: The Westminster Press, 1956), 296.

murder but advocate the death penalty as justice, the teaching reminds them that life is a seamless garment, a whole cloth that cannot be valued at one end, the beginning of life, and not valued at the other end of life.

Pinkerton's advocacy and championship of the common good are so interwoven into her personhood that her life is a seamless garment always in process. Richly hued threads of the past along with threads of the present are continuously being woven and rewoven with the threads of an envisioned future. The warp, the vertical threads through which all others are woven, is Pinkerton's radical spirituality that embraces persons as good and moving toward fulfillment in Christ Jesus, life as a gift, and the planet as home. A shuttle called dialogue carries the threads through the seamless garment of her life. Dialogue guided by relational freedom enhances the potentiality of a vibrant, whole cloth woven through interaction. Non-coercive dialogue finds joy in letting new designs emerge through interaction. Radical, responsible, relational freedom provides the pattern that guides the weaving of this vibrant, ever-changing whole cloth of being and becoming. Pinkerton's whole cloth advocacy and championship of the common good is an artistic creation--a living of a life woven from the threads of history, threads from the present, and threads from the future all interacting through dialogue guided by freedom.

One last thing remains to be done before leaving this analogy. Artists title their creations, and Pinkerton has titled hers, although she probably is not aware of it. "A Passion for the Possible" is a phrase repeatedly used by Pinkerton in conversation, and is an appropriate title for her whole cloth life of advocacy and championship of the common good. A passion for the possible allows Pinkerton's championship of the common good to be on going, multi-dimensional, and ever changing as dialogue reveals the needs. One with a passion for the possible tends not to get snagged by dichotomous *either-or* thinking. Rather, some threads from the *either* and some from the *or* are freshly combined and recombined into 'the possible' for today and for the future.

### **A Deweyan Education That Was Continuous, Participative, and Experiential**

The development and educative embodiment of Pinkerton's transpersonal commitment to the common good is an interaction of education, spirituality, and history. Pinkerton's championship of the common good evolved historically through continuous, interactive and participatory engagement with learning. In childhood, Pinkerton began learning who she is. Ellen Condliffe Lagemann writes "...one's sense of self is largely derived from the reactions one elicits in those to whom one is most closely attached."<sup>612</sup> When Pinkerton's father set a special weekly time to be with her—a time in which he was truly present to her—he was telling Pinkerton who she was. She was an intelligent conversationalist, interesting and enjoyable. Pinkerton's mother's active, decision-making role in the family business provided a strong female role model. Pinkerton saw a woman using her intellect, and, even more importantly, she saw her mother's intellect being valued by a man. In the same way, as a young girl, Pinkerton experienced her intellect being valued by her father's obvious enjoyment of their dialogues together.

When Pinkerton's mother confronted the pastor before Mass one Sunday about the injustice of publishing the names of parishioners who contributed five dollars in the weekly offering, Pinkerton learned that even the church, a good institution, needed critical evaluation. Actions were to be weighed by their effect on others. In many Catholic families, "Father said"

---

<sup>612</sup> Lagemann, *A Generation of Women*, 13.

bore almost as much weight as “God said,” but not in Pinkerton’s family. Through her mother’s interaction with the pastor, and through the pastor’s willingness to confess his error in judgment, Pinkerton learned that a position of authority does not guarantee “rightness,” and mistakes in judgment can be freely admitted and corrected.

Her father and mother’s decision not to buy the house in the suburbs was another action that allowed Pinkerton to see the two people dearest to her always caring for others. The common good was important to her parents. The importance placed on listening to President Roosevelt’s Fireside Chats on the radio and conversation about Roosevelt’s New Deal programs for the common good had Pinkerton participating as citizen as a young child. Her early education--based on the Winnetka Plan in which students had a part in helping their peers master skills--built on the early learning of social responsibility. The Winnetka Plan also emphasized social learning. Children daily learned the art of dialogue through participation in project planning and enactment. Pinkerton’s work in the Catholic Worker Movement reflected the lessons learned from the actions of her parents and early schooling. Even Pinkerton’s invitation to Dorothy Day to speak at her high school, the action that reaped a “tongue-lashing” from the principal, reflected experience of a valued intellect and experience with taking responsibility. Pinkerton’s secondary schooling continued the development of dialogue and action. The interdisciplinary instruction in which students learned the music, art, mythology, science, inventions, great thinkers, etc., of any given period, and events occurring in every section of the world during that period, must have provided and expanded understanding of system interrelatedness. When the examination required the students to design a bulletin board to display all of those aspects of culture, intellect interacted in dialogic, participative, experiential education.

The spiritual life was an important part of Pinkerton’s formal education in Catholic schools. In addition to learning the teachings of the Catholic Church, she learned the life of service espoused and modeled by Jesus in the scriptures. Pinkerton learned and practiced reflection both in making religion lessons relevant to her own life and in preparation to receive periodically the sacrament of reconciliation. The sacrament of reconciliation included: (a) reflective examination of ways in which one had failed to live up to the ten commandments and to the teachings of the church, (b) confession of these sins with a firm purpose of amendment, and (c) penance—usually several prayers to be said in atonement. Atonement is the state of being one that comes from reconciliation. The Catholic practice of attending periodic retreats in which one “comes away from the world” for a period of spiritual renewal also fosters reflection and integration of the daily outward life with the inner spiritual one. As a Catholic school student, Pinkerton made periodic retreats.

During the novitiate period, Pinkerton was unable to reconcile the sisters’ dynamic, enthusiastic embrace of life and teaching that she witnessed as a student with the rigid, exclusive way of life she experienced as a novice. The stressful period put to the test Pinkerton’s learned skills of reflection, dialogue, and action, her attitude of inclusion of the other for the common good, and her understanding of a God of freedom. Pinkerton reflected, questioned, reflected, obeyed (listened for God’s will), questioned more, reflected anew, and, very importantly, she waited. Pinkerton essentially agreed to remain and thereby experienced fully a disconcerting period. She allowed traditions of religious life to interface with conflicting prior experience and with her understanding of a God of freedom. Pinkerton called this period “the dark night of the

soul.” Walter Brueggemann reminds us, however, that “energy comes from the embrace of the inscrutable darkness.”<sup>613</sup>

Energy to persevere through the darkness also came from the embrace in friendship of an older sister whose wisdom Pinkerton had learned to respect. This sister, Mother Margaret Mary, somehow sensed that renewal was on the horizon and reassured Pinkerton that change was coming. This reassurance from a respected authority figure also signaled Pinkerton that her thinking was valid. Pinkerton had hope—hope for reconciliation of her spirituality and her chosen life as a woman religious. Integrity or wholeness would evolve.

As communities of women religious faced the task of educating the teaching sisters for certification, the women began a process of taking responsibility for their own lives. The collaborative process of dialogue among the different communities, active participation in planning a holistic education, and resource sharing strengthened intercommunity relationships. Even before completion of the education plan, the humanistic psychology movement with its emphasis on the wholeness of personhood-- body, mind and spirit—swept the country. Women religious referred to this emphasis as personalism which in their lives stressed “the person, the importance of human development, the relation of the person to community.”<sup>614</sup>

The sisters were somewhat prepared to embrace the lessons of dialogue and inclusivity and the call for change that emanated from the Second Vatican Council (1962-1965). The embrace required hard work, however, as interpersonal relationships were in an infant stage of development. Decisions and trial experiments of changes in governmental structures, dress, community prayer, ministry left such a feeling of instability that many left. For Pinkerton, however, a feeling of hope and wonder at the work of the Lord accompanied the hard work. She had been ready for years to embrace this opportunity for dialogue, action and inclusivity.

Full inclusion in the institutional church continues to elude the women, however, which is a source of sadness for Pinkerton. The women learned to see themselves and their talents as integral to their communities. They benefited from courses in theology, philosophy, history, psychology, and they gained practice in reflective, dialogic, participative, experiential learning. Their heightened consciousness from these preceding events prepared them for an awareness of oppressive systems ordered by power not only over themselves, but over all women, over minorities, and over the poor—a lesson learned from feminism. This awareness broadened ministry. Service for the common good now included work to change systems that deny the common good. Theological reflection, experience, and scriptural reflection increased understanding of the interconnected systems necessary to sustain life. As Pinkerton said, “We can no longer look at the quality of our persons, our lives together, our prayer/spirituality, our service of and by themselves, but always in the context of the interdependent space we share and the people whom we are with, everyone who inhabits this diminishing planet, Mother Earth.”<sup>615</sup>

The design of this dissertation and the above summary were structured to enable the reader to view the educational development of Pinkerton’s extraordinary commitment to the common good through a Deweyan lens of education. John Dewey’s conception of education as experiential, continuous, and participative illuminates the processes of interaction by which Pinkerton’s potential was activated, and developed.

---

<sup>613</sup> Walter Brueggemann, *The Prophetic Imagination* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1978), 23.

<sup>614</sup> Pinkerton, "Prayer and New Ministry," 7.

<sup>615</sup> Pinkerton, "Call to Assembly," 1.

## Pinkerton, Mezirow, Brookfield, and Freire

This study of the development of Pinkerton's advocacy of the common good reveals educational processes advocated by three well-known adult educators: Jack Mezirow, Stephen Brookfield, and Paulo Freire. All three emphasize critical thinking, critical reflection, dialogue, and action for change.

The process of critical thinking involves questioning the assumptions underlying our usual ways of thinking and acting, and a willingness to change these habitual ways as a result of the questioning. Mezirow speaks of a perspective transformation that can result from learning how one's meaning perspectives may be limiting their growth. According to Mezirow, "Our tasks as educators are to encourage the multiple readings of 'texts,' to make a wider range of symbol systems or meaning perspectives available to learners, and to create reflexive dialogic communities in which learners are free to challenge assumptions and premises, thereby breaking through the one-dimensionality of uncritically assimilated learning."<sup>616</sup> Pinkerton's system analysis that she urges others to learn is a skill that permits multiple readings of texts.

Adult educator, Stephen Brookfield calls critical thinking "one of the most significant activities of adult life."<sup>617</sup> Pinkerton and other women religious evidenced the first phase of critical thinking when they questioned why is "the good sister" humble, self-sacrificing, quiet, prayerful, hard-working, diligent, submissive to authority? Critical thinking usually results from a trigger event in one's life, and people often think of these trigger events as negative events that raise self-doubt. Brookfield, however, writes that positive events can also provide the trigger.<sup>618</sup> In fact, for women positive events are more likely to provide the trigger. Brookfield cites the research findings of Belenky, Clinchy, Goldberger, & Tarule who say doubt is probably not an incentive for women to question underlying assumptions "because so many women are already consumed with self-doubt."<sup>619</sup>

The exact event that triggered critical thinking in the women religious as a group is difficult to identify, but it is safe to say the process of going back to their roots to learn the history of their particular community and the history of religious communities in general had considerable influence. During that period of historical research, the women realized the word *obey* did not mean automatic submission to authority.

The second part of critical thinking is a willingness to change one's usual way of thinking or acting as a result of questioned assumptions. The women religious became assertive, dynamic, knowledgeable women who insisted upon their right to define themselves, their lives, and the operation of their religious communities—a change in thinking and acting.

Once aware of their own oppression, women religious developed increased awareness of the oppression of others and of planet earth. Pinkerton began to educate others in ways to uncover hidden oppression. Pinkerton frequently begins her talks with a denial of any expertise in the topic but with a willingness to give a "grassroots" viewpoint. Then she proceeds to speak with such assurance and conviction that her enthusiastic words carry an authority that inspires others to work collectively for change. According to Brookfield, people who transmit "the sheer inspirational force of their vision" trigger critical thinking in other people. They can cause

---

<sup>616</sup> Jack Mezirow & Associates, *Fostering Critical Reflection in Adulthood* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1991), 360-61.

<sup>617</sup> Brookfield, *Learning Democracy*, ix.

<sup>618</sup> *Ibid.*, 6.

<sup>619</sup> Brookfield, *Learning Democracy*, 32; Mary Faith Belenky, Blythe McVicker Clinchy, et al., *Women's Ways of Knowing* (USA: Basic Books, Inc., 1986), 228.

people to take seriously the idea that if enough of us are willing to work for the collective visions of change we share, these visions can become reality.”<sup>620</sup> Pinkerton inspires her audiences.

Paulo Freire also worked to bring collective visions of change to reality. According to Richard Shaull, Paulo Freire in his work with the poor in Brazil, discovered a “culture of silence of the dispossessed.” Shaull explains that Freire discovered all the systems—social, political, economical, and paternal—that kept the oppressed unaware of any alternative response, and he used the field of education to initiate change by breaking the culture of silence.<sup>621</sup> Women religious in this country lived for decades in this same culture of silence. For years, they were held to a standard of compliance to those in authority as the standard for sanctity. The prescribed behavior for “the good sister” was to be humble, self-sacrificing, prayerful, diligent, and submissive to authority. When the women began to dialogue among communities to plan a holistic education for the younger sisters, they became subjects in their historical reality in a new way. The disapproval of their plan by some in positions of authority provided further proof of oppression. Freire calls this process of coming to awareness of contradictions in one’s life and taking action against the oppressive elements—*conscientizacao*. *Conscientizacao* or conscientization, in English, entails reflection and action and occurs through dialogue “with,” not imposition “from.”<sup>622</sup> Dialogue added to the theological reflection of religious life an emphasis on critical reflection. In the subsequent years of changing governmental structure, dress, prayer, living arrangements, etc., the women questioned why and how these rules and prescriptions for living emerged and their continued relevance or non-relevance in the twentieth century. Dialogue with its emphasis on finding together solutions to problems gave the women freedom to experiment with new ways. Searching together is a critical component of dialogue that prevents any one person or group from becoming another oppressor and frees all from the fear of that happening—a fear that would prevent action. Freire says, dialogue “requires an act of faith in each other.”<sup>623</sup> Through faith in each other and dialogue, these women claimed the right to define themselves and enact communally determined changes. Dialogue is always a part of every election of leadership teams and every educational gathering of the Cleveland Sisters of Saint Joseph. Pinkerton, also, provides her sisters with a never-ending source of topics for dialogue from her current political ministry and from her avid perusal of books that concern changing thought in science, theology and ecology. Dialogue with the past, present, and future, with herself, with others and with God, gives Pinkerton a truly radical freedom to act—to embrace life with enthusiasm.

### **A Truly Radical Freedom**

Pinkerton, in a 1976 talk describes her understanding of this relationship between freedom and dialogue in the weaving of the whole cloth of life. While the citation is rather lengthy, its incorporation is justified by its revelation of a truly radical relational freedom that culminates in a commitment to the common good.

---

<sup>620</sup> Brookfield, *Learning Democracy*, 33.

<sup>621</sup> Richard Shaull authored the forward to Freire's work. This excerpt is found on pages 10-11 Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*.

<sup>622</sup> Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, 20.

<sup>623</sup> *Ibid.*, 79.

...we must remember that freedom is relational; it never exists apart from other values. It is rooted in our relationship to others, in community for us, but also rooted in our history, past and present. He (God) lives, breathes, moves within us IF we allow Him full possession of us. This point makes freedom paradoxical. I choose total dependence on Jesus; I allow Him possession of me IF I would be free. The free person, therefore, is the totally humble person, aware of being gifted and responding as gift. This is radical internal freedom. It brings peace, the ability to respond, to say "Yes" to ministry, to life situations, to risk, because one is responding in Jesus who calls. Rootedness in Christ, rootedness in life is the secret of prayer, no matter what our ministry, our lifestyle is the answer to prayer. Here is where Jesus is speaking to us, in the persons around us, in their needs and concerns and in ours. A person so oriented walks before God in peace and serenity because she realizes He is within, He is in possession. We cannot hide who we are or what we are, but we can refuse to let Him call us forth. We can hide behind our individual burning bushes (we never choose the right ones anyway), we can deny our individual capabilities and potentialities, our loves and hates, our weaknesses and limitations, the things that make us joyful or sad. OR we can acknowledge all, knowing that in His presence it doesn't hurt to admit because His love is ever faithful. He is calling us to affirm Yahweh's I AM by affirming our own I AM.

Our attitude then as we go into new areas of ministry should be that of walking before Him, centered in Him, walking straight and tall into life, embracing its beauty and its hardships. But to truly embrace life is a process of developing awareness, of meditating on its mysteries, of responding to that which is good and uprooting that which is evil and to appreciate the gifting.<sup>624</sup>

The reader can see the dialogic relationship Pinkerton has with a divine inner wisdom. Both freedom to act and desire to act for the common good arise from that relationship.

### **Concluding Thoughts**

Pinkerton's life radiates with dialogue, action, and inclusivity—all elements of the common good. All three elements are necessary components of the common good, but dialogue stands out among contemporary research as having critical importance for the millenium. *Dialogue* is the process that brings "the Other" into "one of us" who search together for solutions to contemporary problems. Dialogue fosters awareness of interconnectedness, and interconnectedness is the awareness Daloz, et al. found common to participants in their study of those with a long-term commitment to the common good.

A keen sense of the interconnectedness of every element of life also surfaces in studies of people who access a divine wisdom from somewhere deep within them. Transpersonal psychology research indicates that these people are aware of a sacredness of the planet, even the universe, and aware of the planet and universe being a part of themselves. Pinkerton understands interconnectedness. She has lived and continues to live a life structured with all the practices that can lead to an extraordinary commitment to the common good. But, of what significance to adult education is the development of this commitment in the life of woman religious, Catherine Pinkerton?

---

<sup>624</sup> Pinkerton, "Prayer and New Ministry," 13-14.

## Significance for the Field of Adult Education

This study of Catherine Pinkerton, CSJ, advocate of educator for the common good illuminates an education in formal, informal, and non-formal ways that resonates with dialogue, action, and inclusivity and culminates in an identity with the common good. Adult education can learn from that education to help adults search together for solutions to global problems.

We've learned from adult educators like Jack Mezirow, Stephen Brookfield, and Paulo Freire the importance of critical thinking with its components of reflection and action and the potential such thinking has for perspective transformation. Mezirow, Brookfield, and Freire, also advocate a dialogic education with Freire placing the most emphasis on dialogue. Dialogue in Freire's conscientization process was the tool that developed unity and subsequent ability to act among the Brazilian poor. If one accepts the premise of contemporary writers calling for a return to the common good, dialogue seems to be a missing component in contemporary life, and it is dialogue that connects us together.

Adult education has a history of bringing together and an opportunity to continue this action in a socially significant way. Indeed, according to historians of American adult education, Harold W. Stubblefield and Patrick Keane, the field of adult education developed when scholars recognized diverse educational programs as having the same purpose and brought them together into one field.<sup>625</sup> Stubblefield and Keane report that as early as the 1920s scholars brought together "educational activities conducted by individuals or offered by a sponsoring agency as part of a larger phenomenon called adult education."<sup>626</sup> Additionally, adult education has brought together in practical application research findings from psychology, sociology, anthropology, philosophy, and history among others. Adult education at certain periods in the history of the United States, brought together laborers, women, farmers, African-Americans, among others, in an attempt to change a culture that excluded them. At other times, however, adult education reflected the exclusivity of the dominant culture. According to Stubblefield and Keane, regulated access to education as early as the Colonial Period in the United States kept adult minorities (Native Americans and African Americans) and women in prescribed social roles.<sup>627</sup> Adult education reflected the hegemony of the dominant culture.

Evolution of consciousness now recognizes the error of such exclusive practices. Yet a hegemonic influence exists today that keeps some in conditions of poverty and others working two and three jobs to stay ahead of poverty and a planet increasingly devoid of unrenewable natural resources. Sister Joan Chittister names some of the characteristics and results of today's hegemonic influence: "profit-mongering," "concentration of resources," "unparalleled development," "planetary poverty," and "incommensurable international hunger."<sup>628</sup> Adult education can help adults question how this can be in such comfortable economic times, or adult education can reflect the hegemony of the dominant culture. Adult educators without a vision of the common good and without a vision of the need to help adults read the multiple texts of the dominant culture will reproduce the dominant culture with both its productive and non-productive features. Non-involvement in a global common good does not reflect a neutral stance. Non-involvement in the common good is complicity in the demise of the common good.

---

<sup>625</sup> Stubblefield and Keane, *Adult Education in the American Experience*, 1.

<sup>626</sup> Ibid.

<sup>627</sup> Stubblefield and Keane, *Adult Education in the American Experience*, 43.

<sup>628</sup> Joan Chittister, "Millennial Wisdom Stirs in the Desert," *National Catholic Register*, 19 February 1999, 33.

As a result of this study, the researcher sees a need for dialogue among adult educators and transpersonal psychologists regarding increased human potential. Dialogic educational research into increased human potential can lead to educational methods, practices and courses of study that allow adults to recognize their interconnectedness with others and with the planet. Dialogue's focus on finding solutions together encourages learning and a learning society. An understanding of interconnectedness broadens the use of education merely as a tool for material success to education as a tool for the common good.

Will adult education help adult students from the corporate world balance human resource development for the bottom line with human resource development for the common good? Will adult education become a dialogic education to help adults develop awareness of interconnectedness? Society's need is providing an opportunity.

## References

- Adler, Mortimer J., editor in chief. *The Great Ideas: A Syntopicon of Great Books of the Western World*. Vol. II. Edited by Mortimer J. Adler and William Gorman. Chicago: Encyclopaedia Britannica, Inc., 1952.
- Anderson, Rob, Kenneth N. Cissna, and Ronald C. Arnett. "Introduction." In *The Reach of Dialogue*, edited by Rob Anderson, Kenneth N. Cissna and Ronald C. Arnett, 1-5. Cresskill, New Jersey: Hampton Press, Inc., 1994.
- Angyal, A. *Foundations for a Science of Personality*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press for the Commonwealth Fund, 1941.
- Baines, James D. "Bridging the Gap: From Power to Peace." *Proceedings Convergence II*, 15-20 August 1982, 5-13.
- Barclay, William. *The Gospel of John*. The Daily Study Bible Series, vol. 2. Philadelphia, PA: The Westminster Press, 1956.
- Barnet, Richard J., and John Cavanagh. *Global Dreams*. New York: Simon & Schuster, 1994.
- Barzun, Jacques, and Henry F. Graff. *The Modern Researcher*. Fifth edition. Fort Worth: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich College Publishers, 1992.
- Belenky, Mary Faith, Blythe McVicker Clinchy, et al. *Women's Ways of Knowing*. USA: Basic Books, Inc., 1986.
- Berry, Thomas. *The Dream of the Earth*. San Francisco: Sierra Club Books, 1988.
- Best, John W., and James V. Kahn. *Research in Education*. Seventh edition. Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1993.
- Blunt, Adrian. "The Future of Adult Education Research." In *Research Perspectives in Adult Education*, edited by D. Randy Garrison, 167-209. Malabar, Florida: Krieger Publishing Company, 1994.
- Boucouvalas, Marcie. "An Analysis of Lifelong Learning and Transpersonal Psychology as Two Complementary Movements Reflecting and Contributing to Social Transformation." diss, Tallahassee, Florida: Florida State University, 1980.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Social Transformation, Lifelong Learning, and the Fourth Force-Transpersonal Psychology." *Lifelong Learning: The Adult Years*, March 1983, 6-9.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "An Analysis and Critique of the Concept of Self in Self-Directed Learning: Toward a More Robust Construct for Research and Practice." Transatlantic Dialogue Among Standing Conference on University Teaching (SCUTREA), Adult Education Research

- Conference (AERC), and the Canadian Association for the Study of Adult Education (CASAE). University of Leeds, 11-13-July, 1988.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Transcultural Self: An Issue Area for Comparative Adult Education Research." World Conference on Comparative Adult Education. University of Ibadan, Nigeria, 7-11 October, 1991.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Transpersonal Psychology: Scope and Challenges Revisited." In *Embracing Transcendence: Visions of Transpersonal Psychology*, edited by E.M. McNeill and S.I. Shapiro, 1-25. Stafford Heights, Australia: Bolda-Lok Publishing and Educational Enterprises, 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Transpersonal Orientation as a Framework for Understanding Adult Development and Creative Processes." In *Art, Science, and Spirituality in the Context of Maturity*, edited by M. & Cook-Greuter Miller, S., pages unknown-work not yet published. Greenwich, CT: Ablex, 1999.
- Brennan, Margaret. "A White Light Still and Moving: Religious Life at the Crossroads of the Future." In *Religious Life*, edited by CP Yuhaus, HED, 92-108. New York: Paulist Press, 1994.
- Brookfield, Stephen. *Learning Democracy: Eduard Lindeman on Adult Education and Social Change*. London: Croom Helm, 1987.
- Brueggemann, Walter. *The Prophetic Imagination*. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1978.
- Bryk, Anthony S., Valerie Lee, and Peter B. Holland. *Catholic Schools and the Common Good*. Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1993.
- Bryson, John M., and Barbara C. Crosby. *Leadership for the Common Good*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1992.
- Byrne, Patricia. "French Roots of a Women's Movement: The Sisters of St. Joseph, 1650-1836." diss. *A 46/12, p. 3752, June 1986* (1996), Boston: Boston College.
- Capra, Fritjof. *The Turning Point*. New York: Bantam Books, 1983.
- Capra, Fritjof, and David Steindl-Rast. *Belonging to the Universe*. San Francisco: Harper, 1991.
- Cardman, Francine. "Feminism and Faith." *LCWR Newsletter* 8, no. 2 (April 1980): 1-2, 2.
- Carey, Ann. *Sisters in Crisis*. Huntington, Indiana: Our Sunday Visitor, Inc., 1997.
- Carignan, Ronald N. "Reflections on Criteria for Ministry." *Proceedings Convergence II*, 15-20 August 1982, 35-37.

Chittister, Joan. "Talking Your Way Out of Touch." *LCWR Newsletter* 7, no. 2 (June 1979): 6-8, 2.

\_\_\_\_\_. "An Amazing Journey: A Road of Twists and Turns." In *Religious Life: The Challenge of Tomorrow*, edited by Cassian J. Yuhaus, CP, 76-91. New York: Paulist Press, 1994.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Climbing the Eight Mountains of Religious Life." *National Catholic Register*, February 20 1998, 29-33.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Millennial Wisdom Stirs in the Desert." *National Catholic Register*, 19 February 1999, 33-37.

Chittister, Joan, OSB. "Heart of Flesh: A Feminist Spirituality for Women and Men." Call to Action. Detroit, Michigan, November 15, 1997.

Clifford, Geraldine Joncich. "The Life Story Biographic Study." In *Historical Inquiry in Education: A Research Agenda*, edited by John Hardin Best, 56-74. Washington, D.C.: American Educational Research Association, 1983.

Coleman, John A. "Ministry in the 1980's." Leadership Conference of Women Religious. Philadelphia, PA, 9/May, 1980.

Collins, James. "Book Review of The Philosophy of Bertrand Russell." *The Modern Schoolman* XXII, no. No. 2 (January 1945): 107, No. 2.

Commager, H. S. *The Nature and the Study of History*. Columbus, Ohio: C. E. Merrill, 1965.

Congregation of Saint Joseph. *Exploring Inner Space*. Ohio, 1969.

\_\_\_\_\_. *A Moment in the Life 1984-1988*. Cleveland, Ohio: Congregation of Saint Joseph, 1988.

Congregation of the Sisters of Saint Joseph. *Constitution and Complementary Document*. Cleveland: Congregation of Saint Joseph, 1984.

Coston, Carol. *Feminism: Values and Vision*. Washington, D.C.: Network, 1987.

Creal, Michael. "Introduction." In *In the Eye of the Catholic Storm: The Church Since Vatican II*, edited by Michael Creal, 1-7. Toronto, Canada: Harper Collins Publishers, 1992.

Cremin, Lawrence A. *Popular Education and Its Discontents*. New York: Harper and Row, 1989.

Cremin, Lawrence. *The Family as Educator*. Edited by Hope Jensen Leichter, 76-91. New York, 1977.

- Cutler, III, William W. "Asking for Answers." In *Historical Inquiry in Education: A Research Agenda*, edited by John Hardin Best, 94-108. Washington, D.C.: American Educational Research Association, 1983.
- Daloz, Laurant A., Cheryl H. Keen, et al. *Common Fire*. Boston, Massachusetts: Beacon Press, 1996.
- Danner, Kerry. "Our Lady of the Lobby." *Washington Post Magazine*, 23 May 1993, 8.
- Dewey, John. "My Pedagogic Creed." *The School Journal* LIV, no. No. 3 (January 16 1897): 77-80, No. 3.
- Dilman, Tham. *Morality and the Inner Life: A Study in Plato's Gorgias*. New York: Harper and Row, 1979.
- Duffy, Eileen. "American Women Religious Since Vatican II." Cleveland, Ohio, 29 October, 1997.
- Duffy, Mary Frances. "Language, Attitudes and Reality." *LCWR Newsletter* 8, no. 2 (April 1980): 2-5, 2.
- Dworkin, Martin S. *Dewey on Education: Selections*. Classics in Education, vol. 3. NY: Teachers' College, Columbia University, 1959.
- Edwards, Richard, and Robin Usher. "Modern Field and Postmodern Moorland: Adult Education Bound for Glory or Bound and Gagged." In *Adult Education and Social Responsibility*, edited by Danny Wildemeersch, Matthias Finger and Theo Jensen, 27-56. Frankfurt am Main, Germany: Peter Lang GmbH, 1998.
- Elson, Ruth Miller. *Guardians of Tradition: American Schoolbooks of the 19th Century*. Lincoln, Nebraska: University of Nebraska Press, 1964.
- Etzioni, Amitai. *The Spirit of Community: Rights, Responsibilities, and the Communitarian Agenda*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Introduction." In *Rights and the Common Good*, edited by Amitai Etzioni, 1-9. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1995.
- Evans, Sara M., and Harry C. Boyte. *Free Spaces*. New York: Harper & Row, 1986.
- Fay, Brian. *Critical Social Science: The Limits of Liberation*. NY: Cornell University Press, 1987.
- Festinger, Leon. *A Theory of Cognitive Dissonance*, 1957.

- Finger, Matthias Finger, Theo Jansen, and Wildemeersch. "Reconciling the Irreconcilable? Adult and Continuing Education Between Personal Development, Corporate Concerns and Public Responsibility." In *Adult Education and Social Responsibility*, edited by Danny Wildemeersch, Matthias Finger and Theo Jansen, 1-26. Frankfurt am Main, Germany: Peter Lang GmbH, 1998.
- Fiorenza, Elisabeth Schussler. "Equality: A Radical Democratic Ekklesial Vision." In *Spirituality Justice Reprint*, edited by Bill Thompson, 1-6. Call to Action National Conference. Milwaukee: Call to Action, 31 October, 1998.
- Fogarty, Gerald P., S. J. "Leo XIII," edited by Judith A. Dwyer, 546-48. Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 1994.
- Foran, Donna. "LCWR: Our Thinking on Ministry 'Radical'." *National Catholic Reporter*, October 12 1979, 5.
- Fowler, James. *Stages of Faith*. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1981.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Stages of Faith and Adults' Life Cycles." In *Faith Development in the Adult Life Cycle*, edited by Kenneth Stokes, 179-207. NY: W.H.Sadlier, 1982.
- Freire, Paulo. *Education for Critical Consciousness*. New York: The Seabury Press, 1973.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. Translated by Myra Bergman Ramos. New York: Continuum, 1990.
- Gambari, Elio, SMM. *Religious Apostolic Formation for Sisters*. New York: Fordham University Press, 1964.
- Giblin, Marie J. "Quadragesimo Anno." In *The New Dictionary of Catholic Social Thought*, edited by Judith A. Dwyer, 802-13. Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 1994.
- Gore, Albert. *Earth in the Balance: Ecology and the Human Spirit*. New York: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1992.
- Gottmoeller, Doris, RSM. "Befriending the Wind." Leadership Conference of Women Religious, August 29, 1994.
- Grof, Stanislav. "East and West: Ancient Wisdom and Modern Science." *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology* 15, no. 1 (1983): 13-36, 1.
- Grof, Stanislav, and Christina Grof. "Transpersonal Experiences and the Global Crisis." In *Paths Beyond Ego: The Transpersonal Vision*, edited by Roger Walsh and Frances Vaughan, 251-52. Los Angeles, CA: Jeremy P. Tarcher/Perigee Books, 1993.
- Grudin, Robert. *On Dialogue*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1996.

- Hart, Mechthild U. *Working and Educating for Life: Feminist and International Perspectives on Adult Education*. London: Routledge, 1992.
- Haught, John F. *The Promise of Nature*. New York: Paulist Press, 1993.
- Havighurst, Robert J. *Developmental Tasks and Education*. New York: David McKay Co., 1961.
- Hollenbach, SJ, David. "Common Good." In *The New Dictionary of Catholic Social Thought*, edited by Judith A. Dwyer and Elizabeth L. Montgomery, 192-97. Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 1994.
- Institute of Transpersonal Psychology. "The William James Research Center." <<http://www.tmn.com/itp/details.html#Research>>. 12/26 1997.
- James, William. *Memories and Studies*. NY: Longmans, 1912.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *A Pluralistic Universe*. Essays in Radical Empiricism, vol. 2. New York, 1943.
- Jarvis, Peter. "The Education of Adults as a Social Movement: A Question for Late Modern Society." In *Adult Education and Social Responsibility*, edited by Danny Wildemeersch, Matthias Finger and Theo Jansen, 57-72. Frankfurt am Main, Germany: Peter Lang GmbH, 1998.
- The Jerusalem Bible*. Reader's Edition. Garden City, NY: Doubleday & Company, Ltd., 1968.
- Johnson, Jr., Henry C. *Historical Inquiry in Education: A Research Agenda*. Edited by John Hardin Best. Washington, D.C.: American Education Research Association, 1983.
- Johnson, Richard. "'Really Useful Knowledge 1790-1850: Memories for Education in the 1980s.'" In *Radical Approaches to Adult Education: A Reader*, edited by Tom Lovett, 3-34. London: Routledge, 1988.
- Johnston, William. *Silent Music: The Science of Meditation*. NY: Harper & Row, 1974.
- Kane, Theresa. "Welcome to Pope John Paul II." National Shrine, Washington, D.C., October 7, 1979.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Dialogue: Constitutions of Women Religious." Presidential address. Leadership Conference of Women Religious. Philadelphia, PA, August, 1980.
- Kane, Theresa. "Dialogue: Constitutions of Women Religious." *Probe X*, no. 4 (March/April 1981), 4.
- Kissinger, Henry. "Perils of Globalism." *Washington Post*, 5 October 1998, A21.

Klaassen, Cees. "Empowerment and Social Responsibility in the Learning Society." In *Adult Education and Social Responsibility*, edited by Danny Wildemeersch, Matthias Finger and Theo Jansen, 221-36. Frankfurt am Main, Germany: Peter Lang GmbH, 1998.

Knowles, Malcolm. "An Adult Educator's Reflections on Faith Development in the Adult Life Cycle." In *Faith Development in the Adult Life Cycle*, edited by Kenneth Stokes, 63-73. New York: W.H. Sadlier, 1982.

\_\_\_\_\_. *The Adult Learner: A Neglected Species*. 4th ed. Houston: Gulf Publishers, 1990.

Lagemann, Ellen Condliffe. *A Generation of Women*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1979.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Looking at Gender Women's History." In *Historical Inquiry in Education: A Research Agenda*, edited by John Hardin Best, 251-63. Washington, D.C.: American educational research association, 1983.

Laghi, Pio. "Homily to the Leadership Conference of Women Religious and the Conference of Major Superiors of Men." *Proceedings Convergence II*, 15-20 August 1982, 28-31.

Lasch, Christopher. *The Culture of Narcissism*. New York: Norton, 1978.

LCWR. *Publication of Patterns in Authority and Obedience*. Washington, D.C., 1978.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Memorandum to LCWR Members: Report of SCRIS/LCWR Meeting," 2-6-2B, LCWR. Congregation of Saint Joseph archives, Cleveland, Ohio, 9/May, 1983.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Official Minutes," 1-10. LCWR National Assembly. Kansas City, Missouri, 26-30/August, 1984.

LCWR/CMSM. "Official Minutes of Convergence II," 2-6-2B, LCWR 1980-'84. Congregation of Saint Joseph archives, Cleveland, Ohio, 15-20 August, 1982.

Leadership Conference of Women Religious of the USA, and Conference of Major Superiors of Men of the USA. "Apostolic Religious Life in a Changing World and Church." Fifth Inter-American conference of religious, 1986.

Lefevere, Patricia. "Bishop Sacks Liberal Column, Diocesan Priests Fight Back." *National Catholic Reporter*, February 13 1998, 7.

Leichter, Hope Jensen. "Some Perspectives on the Family as Educator." In *The Family as Educator*, edited by Hope Jensen Leichter, 1-43. New York: Teachers College Press, 1974.

\_\_\_\_\_. "The Concept of Educative Style." *Teachers College Record* 75 (Dec. 1974b): 239-50.

- Leonard, Margaret Ann. "Reality of United States Women Religious Past and Present." National Assembly of the Leadership Conference of Women Religious. Kansas City, Missouri, 27/August, 1984.
- Magness, Jacqueline B. "Transformation." Va. Technological Institute and State University, 1995.
- Maritain, Jacques. *The Person and the Common Good*. First paperback edition 1966. Translated by John J. Fitzgerald. Notre Dame, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press, 1946.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *The Person and the Common Good*. first paperback edition. Translated by John J. Fitzgerald. Notre Dame, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press, 1966.
- Marty, Martin. *The One and the Many*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1997.
- Maslow, A. H. *Motivation and Personality*. New York: Harper and Row, 1954.
- Maslow, Abraham. *Toward a Psychology of Being*. NY: Van Nostrand Reinhold, 1968.
- Mather, Laretta. "Come Forth: Naming the Tombs. Making the Daybreak." LCWR 25th Anniversary. Indianapolis, Indiana, August, 1981.
- McCluskey, Neil G. *Catholic Viewpoint on Education*. New York: Harvard University Press, 1959.
- McInery, Ralph. "Jacques Maritain." In *The New Dictionary of Catholic Social Thought*, edited by Judith A. Dwyer, 563-65. Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 1994.
- McKeon. *The Basic Works of Aristotle*. Edited by McKeon, 127-1324. New York: Random House, 1941.
- McNamara, Jo Ann Kay. *Sisters in Arms*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1996.
- McSwite, O. C. *Legitimacy in Public Administration*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications, Inc., 1997.
- Merriam, Sharan B., and Rosemary S. Caffarella. *Learning in Adulthood*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1991.
- Merriam, Sharan B., and Edwin L. Simpson. *A Guide to Research for Educators and Trainers of Adults*. second edition. Malabar, Florida: Krieger Publishing Co., 1995.

- Metz, Johannes B. *Followers of Christ the Religious Life in the Church*. Translated by Thomas Linton. NY: Paulist Press, 1978.
- Mezirow & Associates, Jack. *Fostering Critical Reflection in Adulthood*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1991.
- Mezirow, Jack and Associates. *Fostering Critical Reflection in Adulthood*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 1991.
- Mezirow, Jack. "Transformation Theory and Action: A Response to Collard and Law." *Adult Education Quarterly* 39, no. 2 (1989): 170-76, 2.
- Miller, Amata IHM. "Expanding Our Horizons." Sisters of Charity. Leavenworth, Kansas, June 13, 1992.
- Miller, Amata. "On the Side of the Poor: Evolution of a Stance." *Shaping a New World: The Catholic Social Justice Tradition 1891-1991* (1991).
- Miller, Jean Baker. *Toward a New Psychology of Women*. Boston: Beacon Press, 1976.
- Miller, Melvin E., and Susanne R. Cook-Greuter. "Introduction." In *Transcendence and Mature Thought in Adulthood*, edited by Melvin E. Miller and Susanne R. Cook-Greuter, xiv-xxxiv. Lanham, Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc., 1994.
- Morrow, Felix. "William James and John Dewey on Consciousness: Suppressed Writings." *Journal of Humanistic Psychology* 24, no. 1 (Winter 1984): 69-79, 1.
- National Association of Religious Women. *For Immediate Release*. Chicago, ILL: NARW, 1983.
- Network. *Shaping a New World*. Washington, D. C.: Network, Inc., 1991.
- New American Bible*. Saint Joseph edition. Translated by The Catholic Biblical Association of America, New Testament. NY: Catholic Book Publishing Co., 1970.
- Newton, Judith, and Deborah Rosenfelt. "Introduction." In *Feminist Criticism and Social Change*, edited by Judith Newton and Deborah Rosenfelt. New York: Methuen, 1985.
- Noterman, M. Patrice. "An Interpretive History of the Sister Formation Conference, 1954-1964." diss. *UMI Dissertation Services* (1988), Chicago: Loyola University of Chicago.
- Novak, Michael. *Free Persons and the Common Good*. Lanham, MD: Madison Books, 1989.
- Overstreet, Harry A. *The Mature Mind*. NY: W.W. Norton, 1949.

Patrick, Anne E. "The Moral Decision Maker: 'From Good Sisters to Prophetic Women.'" keynote address. LCWR. New Orleans, LA, 2 September, 1985.

Patton, M. Q. *Qualitative Education and Research Methods*. 2d ed. Newbury Park: Sage, 1990.

Peck, M. Scott. *A World Waiting to Be Born*. New York: Bantam Books, 1993.

Pinkerton, Catherine. "The Meaning of Renewal to the Teacher," 2-9-1, File 1968-'69. Sister of Saint Joseph Mother House, Cleveland, OH, 1968.

\_\_\_\_\_. "A Sister Views the Church of the '70s." Ecumenical Meeting-Avon, 2-9-1, File 1968-'69. Sisters of Saint Joseph Mother House, Cleveland, OH, 1968-9.

\_\_\_\_\_. "A Picture of the Contemporary Situation," 2-9-1, File 1968-'69. Sisters of Saint Joseph Mother House, Cleveland, OH, 1969a.

\_\_\_\_\_. "NAWR: A Vision for the Future." NAWR. San Francisco, 1975.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Organizing for a New World." *New Catholic World* 218, no. 1305 (May 1975c): 139-43, 1305.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Vision for the Future." *Brothers' Newsletter* 17, no. No. 3 (Fall 1975d): 30-38, No. 3.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Untitled." speech given to sabbatical group/clergy. Catholic University Washington, D. C., 1975e.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Prayer and New Ministry." Formation Conference. Dubuque, Iowa, 1976.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Untitled." St. Angela Merici, May, 1976e.

\_\_\_\_\_. "The Transferability of the Principles of Organizational Development Employed by Renewing Religious Communities." Think Tank on Organizational Development, Cleveland, OH, 9-12 August, 1976g.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Integration: Prayer and the Local Community." Dubuque, Iowa, no date given, 1976k.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Reality of Today: Vision of Tomorrow." Saginaw, Michigan, 10 November, 1978c.

Pinkerton, Catherine. "The Future of Ministry and You." Formation Conference. Farmington, MI, 1979.

Pinkerton, Catherine. "Call to Assembly." Cleveland, Ohio, 1980i.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Focusing Ministry for Our Times." *LCWR Newsletter* 9, no. 2 (April 1981): 1-3, 2.

- \_\_\_\_\_. "Commencement Address." St. Joseph Academy, Cleveland, 31 May, 1981b.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Justice and the Poor." Congregation of Religious Education, 24 June, 1981c.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Ministry and Spirituality." Place not given, unknown date, 1981e.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Broadening the View of Parish." Resurrection Community, 16 March, 1981f.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Call to Assembly." Cleveland, Ohio, 18, March, 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Acceptance Presentation." LCWR, 18 August, 1983b.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Presentation to Vicars for Religious." Cleveland, Ohio, October, 1983d.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Talk to Students." John Carroll University, 15 March, 1984.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Untitled." St. Paschal Baylon, 5 April, 1984b.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Address to Religion Education Conference." Religion Education Congress. Providence, RI, 15/March, 1986.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Wellspring of Political Action: Prayer." *Catholic Evangelization in the United States of America* 1, no. 2 (March/April 1988): 38-39, 2.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Faculty Orientation: St. Joseph Academy." Cleveland, Ohio, 23 August, 1989.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Untitled." Commission tenth anniversary. Akron, Ohio, 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Membership," Box 2-9-1. Cleveland, Ohio; Sisters of Saint Joseph Mother House Archives, November 2, 1996, 1996.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Global Spirituality." Maryknoll, NY, March 17, 1998.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Remarks About Renewal as Continuing," undated. From box 2-9-1 of Pinkerton's speeches.
- Pope, Stephen J. "Rerum Novarum." In *The New Dictionary of Catholic Social Thought*, edited by Judith A. Dwyer, 828-44. Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 1994.
- Quinlan, Margaret. "Sisters of Saint Joseph of Cleveland." Cleveland, 1963.
- Quinonez, Lora Ann, CDP, and Mary Daniel Turner, SNDdeN. *The Transformation of American Catholic Sisters*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1992.

- Rackham, H. *Aristotle's Ethics for English Readers Rendered from the Greek of the Nicomachean Ethics*. Translated by H. Rackham, Chapter V 1129a-38b. New York: Barnes and Noble, Inc., 1943.
- Randall, John Herman. *Plato: Dramatist of the Life of Reason*. NY: Columbia University Press, 1970.
- The Random House Dictionary of the American Language*. Second Edition Unabridged. New York: Random House, 1987.
- Raskin, Marcus G. *The Common Good: Its Politics, Policies, and Philosophy*. New York: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1986.
- Raspberry, William. "Market Idolatry." *The Washington Post*, Friday/April 10 1998, A23.
- Rupp, George. *Commitment and Community*. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1989.
- Russell, Peter. "An Inner Manhattan Project." In *Paths Beyond Ego: The Transpersonal Vision*, edited by Roger Walsh and Frances Vaughan, 252-53. Los Angeles, CA: Jeremy P. Tarcher/Perigee Books, 1993.
- Savage, Mary Lucinda, SSJ. "The Congregation of Saint Joseph of Carondelet." diss, 329, Washington, D. C.: Catholic University of America, 1923.
- Schneiders, Sandra M. "Prophetic Consciousness in the Contemporary Church." *Proceedings Convergence II*, 15-20 August 1982, 14-27.
- Schuck, Michael J. "Modern Catholic Social Thought." In *The New Dictionary of Catholic Social Thought*, edited by Judith A. Dwyer, 611-32. Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press, 1994.
- Shafer, R.J. *A Guide to Historical Method*. Revised edition. Homewood, IL: The Dorsey Press, 1974.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *A Guide to Historical Method*. Homewood, IL: The Dorsey Press, 1980.
- Shain, Alan. *The Myth of American Individualism*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1994.
- Sherover, Charles M. *Time, Freedom and the Common Good*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1989.
- Skeat, Rev. Walter W. *An Etymological Dictionary of the English Language*. Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1995.
- Smith, Michael. *Human Dignity and the Common Good in the Aristotelean-Thomistic Tradition*. Lewiston, NY: The Edwin Mellen Press, 1958.

- Stewart, John. "Forward." In *The Reach of Dialogue*, edited by Rob Anderson, Kenneth N. Cissna and Ronald C. Arnett, viii-xx. Cresskill, New Jersey: Hampton Press, Inc, 1994.
- Stubblefield, Harold W., and Patrick Keane. "The History of Adult and Continuous Education." In *Handbook of Adult and Continuing Education*, edited by Sharan B. Merriam and Phyllis M. Cunningham, 26-36. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1989.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Adult Education in the American Experience*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Adult Education in the American Experience*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1995.
- Sutich, Anthony. *Transpersonal Psychology* 1, no. 1 (Spring 1969). 1.
- Swimme, Brian. *The Universe is a Green Dragon*. Santa Fe: Bear and Co., 1984.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Cosmic Creation Story." In *The Reenchantment of Science*, edited by David Ray Griffin, 47-56. Albany: SUNY Press, 1988.
- Sylvester, Nancy, and Carol Coston. "The Prophetic Tradition of Denouncing and Announcing." *Shaping a New World* (1991).
- Tart, Charles T. "Introduction." In *Transpersonal Psychologies: Perspectives on the Mind from Seven Great Spiritual Traditions*, edited by Charles T. Tart. San Francisco: Harper, 1991 (2nd. ed.).
- United Kingdom Catholic Bishops Conference. "Morality in the Market Place." In *The Common Good*. <<http://www.tasc.ac.uk/cc/cbc/cg004.htm>>. 1997.
- van Kaam, Adrian. "Introduction." In *Sisters for the World*. New York: Herder & Herder, 1966.
- Vatican Council II. *Vatican Council II the Conciliar and Post Conciliar Documents*. second, 1975, ed. Flannery, Austin, O. P. Translated by Ambrose McNicholl, O. P., 903-47. Northport, NY: Costello Publishing Co., 1965.
- Vaughan, Frances E. "The Transpersonal Perspective: A Personal Overview." *The Journal of Transpersonal Psychology* 14, no. 1 (1982): 37-45, 1.
- Wall, A.E.P., editor in chief. *The American Catholic Who's Who*. Washington, D.C.: N.C. News Service, a division of the U.S. Catholic Conference, 1976.
- Walsh, Roger, and Frances Vaughan. "The Adventure of Consciousness." In *Paths Beyond Ego: The Transpersonal Vision*, edited by Roger Walsh and Frances Vaughan, 266-68. Los Angeles, CA: Jeremy P. Tarcher/Perigee Books, 1993.
- Washburne, Carleton W., and Jr. Marland, Sidney P. *Winnetka: The History and Significance of an Educational Experiment*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1963.

Weigel, George. *Catholic Sun*, Jan. 29-Feb. 4 1998.

Welton, Michael R. "The Critical Turn in Adult Education Theory." In *In Defense of the Lifeworld*, edited by Michael R. Welton, 11-38. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1995.

Welton, Michael. "Civil Society as Theory and Project: Adult Education and the Renewal of Global Citizenship." In *Adult Education and Social Responsibility*, edited by Danny Wildemeersch, Matthias Finger and Theo Jansen, 187-220. Frankfurt am Main, Germany: Peter Lang GmbH, 1998.

Welwood, John. "Principles of Inner Work: Psychological and Spiritual." *Journal of Transpersonal Psychology* 16, no. 1 (1984): 63-73, 1.

Wheatley, Margaret, and Myron Kellner-Rogers. "Bringing Life to Organizational Change," 1998.

Wilber, Ken. *Eye to Eye: The Quest for the New Paradigm*. Boston: Shambhala Publications, 1990.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Paths Beyond Ego in the Coming Decades." In *Paths Beyond Ego: The Transpersonal Vision*, edited by Roger Walsh and Frances Vaughan, 256-66. Los Angeles, CA: Jeremy P. Tarcher/Perigee Books, 1993.

Zeitlin, Irving M. *Plato's Vision: The Classical Origins of Social and Political Thought*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall, 1993.



Sister Catherine Pinkerton, CSJ (circa 1960)



Catherine Pinkerton, CSJ  
1995



President Clinton and Catherine Pinkerton, CSJ (Official White House Photo 08SEP95 8k PO31726-17A)



Vice President Gore and Catherine Pinkerton, CSJ (Official White House Photo 08Sep95 CS V008544-04A)



First Lady Hillary Clinton and Catherine Pinkerton, CSJ (Official White House Photo 04Mar96 8M PO37382-023)



*To Catherine  
Best Wishes,  
Bill Clinton*

President Clinton and Catherine Pinkerton, CSJ (Official White House Photo 06Jul95 RA PO29945-20A)

## VITA

### JACQUELINE BROCK MAGNESS

Jacqueline Magness received a Bachelor of Arts in Elementary Education from Brenau College, Gainesville, Georgia. After teaching in elementary schools in the U.S. and Germany and working several years in the business sector, she continued her education by earning from Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University the degrees of Master of Science in Adult and Continuing Education and Doctor of Philosophy in Adult Learning and Human Resource Development.

She co-founded Light Works, Inc., a not-for-profit educational corporation developed to foster collaborative learning and facilitate change in individuals, teams, and groups. Ms. Magness was born in Jacksonville, Florida and currently resides in Falls Church, Virginia.