

**An Emerging Partnership in Regional Economic Development:  
Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs), Local State and the  
World Bank. A Case Study of Planaflo, Rondônia, Brazil**

By

Marcos Antonio Pedlowski

Dissertation submitted to the Faculty of the  
Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University in  
partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

IN

ENVIRONMENTAL DESIGN AND PLANNING

APPROVED:

---

John O. Browder, Chair

---

Larry S. Grossman

---

John Randolph

---

Max O. Stephenson

---

Robert Youngs

April 07, 1997

Blacksburg, Virginia

Keywords: Civil Society, Regional Development, Non-  
Governmental Organizations (NGOs), State, World Bank

AN EMERGING PARTNERSHIP IN REGIONAL ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT:  
NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS (NGOs), LOCAL STATE, AND THE  
WORLD BANK. A CASE STUDY OF PLANAFLORO, RONDÔNIA, BRAZIL

By

Marcos Antonio Pedlowski

John O. Browder, Chair

Environmental Design and Planning

(ABSTRACT)

There is a growing body of literature arguing that NGOs are an important tool in the efforts of civil society to influence the actions of the State, especially in the process of economic development. NGOs are primarily seen as effective advocates for the less privileged sectors of civil society. This study examines the influence of local NGOs participation in the implementation of PLANAFLORO, a regional economic development program partially funded by the World Bank in the Brazilian state of Rondônia. This study focuses on four issues that are commonly used to justify the inclusion of NGOs in the development process: representativeness, accountability, autonomy and effectiveness. This study relies on three basic methods of data gathering: focused interviews of key informants,

questionnaire-based surveys of different stake-holder groups, and information from secondary sources. This study's results challenge the common wisdom regarding the positive impacts of NGO participation in economic development programs, and on their contribution to democratic governance. NGOs participating in PLANAFLORO faced great institutional and political difficulties in the process of participation. Many NGOs did not have either the institutional capabilities or the financial autonomy to influence the process of policy-making in PLANAFLORO effectively. Moreover, most NGOs did not have mechanisms of accountability to inform the program's intended beneficiaries of the state of PLANAFLORO's implementation. Finally, both the local State and the World Bank only reluctantly accepted the participation of NGOs in PLANAFLORO. This fact served to greatly limit the contribution of NGOs in PLANAFLORO.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The task of acknowledging those who have helped and encouraged me to prepare this study may be as difficult as the study itself because I have so many different people to thank. For those friends whose names are not cited here, my sincere apologies.

I initially would like to acknowledge my committee chair and advisor, Dr. John Browder, for his help throughout my stay in Blacksburg. I would like also to thank my committee members, Drs. Larry Grossman in Geography, John Randolph and Max Stephenson in Urban Affairs and Planning, and Robert Youngs in Forestry. I would also like to thank Foster Brown, Virginia Dale, and Dagoberto Moura for their contributions in different stages of my academic development.

I would also like to thank to all the people in Rondônia who kindly contributed to make this study possible. My special thanks to Mara Carneiro, Iremar Ferreira, José Carlos M. Gadelha, Walmir de Jesus, Antenor Karitiana, Eraldo Matricardi, Edvan Pinto Rios, Luiz Rodrigues, Eliomar P. Silva Filho, and José Antonio de Souza for their uncountable efforts to help me to conduct this study.

Special thanks to Suzana Müller who literally opened the doors of her house to me so I could have a comfortable

and fun place to live until this work was completed. I would also to thank John Fackenthal and William F.da Costa for lending me their computer skills. I would like also to express gratitude to Urs Buehlmann, Tracey Chew, Nichole Danraj, Ingrid Heydrich, Kalpana Kanwar, Lara Käsner, Bill O'Brien, Peter Ozolins, Shakeel Qureshi, Melissa Shaw, Frances Stanley, Jay Swami, and Diane Zahm for their friendship and support. I would like to thank all my friends at the International Club of Virginia Tech.

This endeavor has special meaning to me because of my family, especially my sister Eliane and nephews (Guilherme and Rafael) and nieces (Letícia and Patrícia). I also thank my little friend Rachel Webb for providing me with so many interesting insights into life.

Finally, this study was made possible by a doctoral fellowship grant provided by the "*Conselho Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico*" (CNPq), the National Council of Scientific Development and Technology of Brazil.

## ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

<b>ASGM</b>	<i>Association of Rubber Tappers of Guajará-Mirim</i>
<b>ASM</b>	<i>Associação de Seringueiros de Guajará-Mirim</i> <i>Association of Rubber Tappers of Machadinho do Oeste</i> <i>Associação de Seringueiros de Machadinho do Oeste</i>
<b>ASSPB</b>	<i>Association of Soldiers of the Rubber and Rubber Tappers of Pimenta Bueno</i> <i>Associação de Soldados da Borracha e Seringueiros de Pimenta Bueno</i>
<b>AVHRR</b>	<i>Advanced Very High Resolution Radiometer</i>
<b>CD</b>	<i>Deliberative Council</i> <i>Conselho Deliberativo</i>
<b>CEPLAC</b>	<i>Executive Committee for the Cocoa Development</i> <i>Comissão Executiva do Plano da Lavoura Cacaueira</i>
<b>CIEL</b>	<i>Center for International Environmental Law</i>
<b>CIMI</b>	<i>Indian Missionary Council,</i> <i>Conselho Indigenista Missionário</i>
<b>CNP</b>	<i>Program Normative Commission</i> <i>Comissão Normativa de Programa</i>
<b>CNS</b>	<i>National Council of Rubber Tappers</i> <i>Conselho Nacional dos Seringueiros</i>
<b>COMAI</b>	<i>Independent Evaluation Committee</i> <i>Comitê de Avaliação Independente</i>
<b>CPT</b>	<i>Pastoral Land Commission</i> <i>Comissão Pastoral da Terra</i>
<b>CU</b>	<i>Conservation Unit</i> <i>Unidade de Conservação</i>
<b>CUNPIR</b>	<i>Coordination of Indian Nations and Peoples of Rondônia, Southern Amazonas and Northern Mato Grosso</i> <i>Coordenação da União de Povos Indígenas de Rondônia, Sul do Amazonas e Norte do Mato Grosso</i>
<b>DER</b>	<i>Rondônia State Highway Department</i> <i>Departamento de Estradas de Rodagem</i>
<b>ECOPORE</b>	<i>Ecological Action of the Guaporé Valley</i> <i>Ação Ecológica do Vale do Guaporé</i>
<b>EDF</b>	<i>Environmental Defense Fund</i>
<b>EMATER</b>	<i>Rondônia State Technical Assistance and Rural Extension Company</i>

	Empresa de Assistência Técnica e Extensão Rural
<b>EMBRAPA</b>	<i>Brazilian Agricultural Research Enterprise</i>
<b>FAERON</b>	Empresa Brasileira de Pesquisa Agro-Pecuária <i>Federation of the Agriculture of Rondônia</i>
<b>FETAGRO</b>	Federação da Agricultura de Rondônia <i>Federation of Rural Workers of Rondônia</i>
<b>FIERO</b>	Federação de Trabalhadores na Agricultura de Rondônia <i>Federation of Industries of Rondônia</i>
<b>FOE</b>	Federação das Indústrias de Rondônia <i>Friends of the Earth</i>
<b>FORUM</b>	Forum of NGOs and Social Movements of Rondônia. Forúm de ONGs e Movimentos Sociais de Rondônia
<b>FUNAI</b>	<i>National Indigenous People Foundation</i> Fundação Nacional do Índio
<b>FUNDAGRO</b>	<i>Rondônia State Agricultural Credit Fund</i> Fundo Agrário de Rondônia
<b>IBAMA</b>	<i>Brazilian Institute for the Environment and Renewable Resources</i> Instituto Brasileiro do Meio Ambiente e dos Recursos Renováveis
<b>IBDF</b>	<i>Brazilian Institute of Forestry Development</i> Instituto Brasileiro de Desenvolvimento Florestal
<b>INCRA</b>	<i>National Institute for Colonization and Agrarian Reform</i> Instituto Nacional de Colonização e Reforma Agrária
<b>INDIA</b>	<i>Institute of Defense of the Amazonian Identity</i> Instituto de Defesa da Identidade Amazônica
<b>IPHAE</b>	<i>Institute of Pre-History, Agriculture and Ecology</i> Instituto de Pré-História, Agricultura e Ecologia
<b>ITERON</b>	<i>Rondônia State Land Institute</i> Instituto de Terras de Rondônia
<b>KANINDÉ</b>	<i>Kanindé Association of Ethnic and Environmental Defense</i> Associação de Defesa Étnica-Ambiental Kanindé
<b>METAIRELÁ</b>	<i>Indigenous Organization of the Suruí People</i> Organização Indígena do Povo Suruí
<b>NGO</b>	<i>Non-Governmental Organization</i>

	Organização Não-Governamental
<b>OSR</b>	<i>Organization of Rubber Tappers of Rondônia</i>
	Organização de Seringueiros de Rondônia
<b>PACA</b>	<i>Environmental Protection of Cacaoal</i>
	Proteção Ambiental Cacoalense
<b>PAMARÉ</b>	<i>Indigenous Organization of the Cinta-Larga People</i>
	Organização Indígena do Povo Cinta-Larga
<b>PIN</b>	<i>National Integration Program</i>
	Programa de Integração Nacional
<b>PLANAFLORO</b>	<i>Rondônia Natural Resources Management Project</i>
	Plano Agro-Pecuário e Florestal de Rondônia
<b>POA</b>	<i>Annual Operative Plan</i>
	Plano Operativo Anual
<b>POLAMAZONIA</b>	<i>Amazon Agricultural and Mineral Poles Program</i>
	Programa de Pólos Agro-pecuários e Agro-minerais da Amazônia
<b>POLONOROESTE</b>	<i>Northwest Rural Development Program</i>
	Programa Integrado de Desenvolvimento do Noroeste do Brasil
<b>SEAGRI</b>	<i>Rondônia State Secretariat of Agriculture and Supply</i>
	Secretaria de Estado da Agricultura e Abastecimento
<b>SEDAM</b>	<i>Rondônia State Secretariat of Environmental Development</i>
	Secretaria de Estado de Desenvolvimento Ambiental
<b>SUDAM</b>	<i>Superintendency for the Development of the Amazon</i>
	Superintendência do Desenvolvimento da Amazônia
<b>SUDHEVEA</b>	<i>Superintendency for Rubber Development</i>
	Superintendência do Desenvolvimento da Borracha
<b>STR</b>	<i>Rural Workers Labor Union</i>
	Sindicato de Trabalhadores Rurais
<b>WWF</b>	<i>World Wildlife Fund</i>

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract.....ii

Acknowledgments.....iv

Acronyms and Abbreviations.....vi

Tables.....xi

Figures.....xii

  

Chapter 1 Introduction.....1

  

Chapter 2 The Different Aims of the Contemporary Use of the  
Term "Civil Society.....9

  

Chapter 3 Methodology.....46

  

Chapter 4 The Role of Rondônia in the Recent Settlement of  
Brazilian Amazon.....61

  

Chapter 5 The Implementation of PLANAFLORO: History Repeats  
Itself?.....98

  

Chapter 6 Organizational Profile of NGOs Participating in  
PLANAFLORO: History, Mechanisms of Accountability, and  
Sources of Funding.....125

  

Chapter 7 The Dynamics of NGO Participation in  
PLANAFLORO.....172

  

Chapter 8 NGOs Participation in PLANAFLORO: Views from the  
World Bank, State, Transnational NGOs and the  
Grassroots.....213

Chapter 9 Conclusion: The PLANAFLORO Experience and its Implications for Future NGO Participation in Regional Development.....	245
REFERENCES.....	254
APPENDICES.....	265
VITA.....	280

### TABLES

1)Table 3.1 Major Components and Parameters of NGO leaders Interviews.....	53
2)Table 3.2 Organizational Affiliation of Small Farmers.....	56
3)Table 4.1 Population Growth in Rondônia (1950-1990).....	66
4)Table 4.2 POLONOROESTE Budget, 1981-1985 in millions of January 1981 cruzeiros.....	69
5)Table 4.3 Agro-Ecological Zoning of Rondônia.....	85
6)Table 4.4 Beneficiaries of PLANAFLORO by Social Group.....	87
7)Table 5.1 Allocation of Funds in POLONOROESTE and PLANAFLORO.....	101
8) Table 5.2 Utilization of PLANAFLORO's Funds in 1993 and 1995.....	103
9) Table 5.3 Areas of Conservation Units to be Created or Restored by PLANAFLORO until December 1995.....	115
10) Table 5.4 Rates of Deforestation in Rondônia 1978-1993.....	120
11) Table 6.0 List of NGOs Profiled.....	125

12) Table 6.1 Sources of Funding, Type of Services Provided, Size of Staff, and Total Budget in 1995 for CPT and CIMI.....	153
13) Table 6.2 Organizational Structure of Service Providers GSOs.....	157
14) Table 6.3 Sources of Funding, FY 1990-1995.....	162
15) Table 6.4 Major Partners of the FORUM.....	167
16) Table 6.5 Sources of Funding for FY 1994-1995....	168
17) Table 7.1 The Major Characteristics of GSOs Approaches to their Participation in the Political Process.....	179
18) Table 7.2 Perceived Roles for NGO Participation in PLANAFLORO.....	195
19) Table 7.3 Number of Meetings Held by Normative Program Commissions.....	201
20) Table 8.1 Transnational NGOs Participating in PLANAFLORO.....	227
21) Table 8.2 Nature of Transnational Involvement with Local NGOs in Rondônia.....	228
22) Table 8.3 Status of Affiliation of Small Farmers.....	240
23) Table 8.4 Participation in Meetings to Explain PLANAFLORO.....	241

#### **FIGURES**

1) Figure 1.1 Location of Rondônia in the Brazil.....	3
2) Figure 2.1 Identification of MSOs and GSOs within the Spectrum of NGOs.....	40
3) Figure 4.1 The Agro-Ecological Zoning of Rondônia.....	83
4) Figure 4.2 Model of NGO Participation in the Decision-Making Process of PLANAFLORO.....	94

5) Figure 5.1 Rates of Deforestation in Rondônia.....	118
6) Figure 6.1 Organizational Structure of FETAGRO....	129
7) Figure 6.2 Organizational Structure of OSR.....	136
8) Figure 6.3 Organizational Structure of CUNPIR....	144
9) Figure 6.4 Organizational Structure of the CPT and CIMI.....	150
10)Figure 6.5 Organizational Structure of the FORUM of NGOs.....	165